



This project is funded by the European Union

Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey:
Gender Equality Monitoring Project

Gender Equality in Access to Urban Rights and Services

Mapping and Monitoring Study
Full Summary

Dr. Özgün Akduran
Assoc. Prof. Ayşegül Yakar Önal
Prof. Dr. Gülay Günlük Şenesen



CEİD PUBLICATIONS

Gender Equality in Access to Urban Rights and Services
Monitoring and Mapping Study
Full Summary

The present text is the informative summary of "Mapping and Monitoring of Gender Equality in Access to Urban Rights and Services" prepared under the "Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Gender Equality Monitoring Project. Turkish version of this summary, main text and bibliography are available at: www.ceidizleme.org

ISBN: 978-605-69015-4-6

It can be reproduced and used by referring to the source.

CEİD ADDRESS:

Cinnah Caddesi, No: 75/7 Çankaya, 06690
Ankara, Turkey
Tel: + 312 440 04 84-85
www.ceid.org.tr
www.ceidizleme.org
December 2018

Cover/Text Design: Elma Teknik Basım Matbaacılık Tic. Ltd. Şti.
İvedik OSB Matbaacılar Sitesi
1516/1 Sokak No:35
Yenimahalle/Ankara
Tel: 0 312 229 92 65

Translation: Metin Çulhaoğlu

This publication is produced with the financial support of European Union. Its contents are the sole responsibility of the Association for Monitoring Gender Equality and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union or the Directorate for EU Affairs - Department of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Republic of Turkey.

PROF DR GÜLAY GÜNLÜK-ŞENESEN is a faculty member in İstanbul University Faculty of Political Sciences. She served as short-term advisor to the World Bank in researches promoting women's employment in Turkey and to UN Women in gender responsive budgeting in Turkey. In 2008 she was in the Turkish delegation to the 52nd Session of the UN Commission on Women's Status on "financing of gender equality and women's empowerment." She is the co-author of *Kadınsız Kentler* (2017) (Cities without Women).

ASSOCIATED PROF AYŞEGÜL YAKAR ÖNAL is faculty member in İstanbul University Faculty of Political Sciences, Department of Political Science and Public Administration. Her academic studies focus on urban economics, local government financing, taxation-accumulation-distribution relations and gender responsive budgeting. The book "Cities without Women" contributed by various authors (2017) is the outcome of the TÜBİTAK-SOBAG project "1001 Well-Being Gender Budgeting" which she participated as researcher.

DR ÖZGÜN AKDURAN is in İstanbul University Faculty of Political Sciences, Political Science and Public Administration Department. Her fields of academic interest include privatizations, regulation and regulatory institutions, and new approaches to public budgeting. In the period 2013-2014, Dr Akduran took part as national expert and trainer in gender responsive budgeting under the UN Project on Women-Friendly Cities.

PREFACE

The present report is the outcome of a series of thematic mapping work and efforts to develop gender equality (GE) monitoring indicators under the *Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Gender Equality Monitoring Project*. The project took shape in the period 2013-2017 in a process involving meetings and exchange of opinion with many institutions and persons. The common point emerging in this process was the necessity of developing independent mechanisms for monitoring and evaluation at the stage that GE policies reached in Turkey. In other words, what was needed was an independent monitoring mechanism to assess the appropriateness and effectiveness of national legislation and action plans developed so far in translating GE into life. This also entailed the development of tools satisfying relevant scientific and technical requirements and facilitating systematic monitoring free from political and ideological polemics. To ensure compliance with international norms and sustainability, it was also necessary to develop monitoring indicators and assess these indicators through mapping and periodic reporting, which became the roadmap of the project. It was also among the objectives of the project to take initial steps to ensure the institutionalization needed for the sustainability of these efforts.

While delineating its field of work the *Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Gender Equality Monitoring Project* adopted a “gender sensitive rights-based” approach. The basic objectives of the project include the following: Supporting the inclusion of international norms and standards developed for GE in legislation, practices and monitoring policies in Turkey; reporting of GE related problem areas through mapping; contributing to institutionalization in Turkey of an independent, scientific and mainstreamed strategy by developing GE specific monitoring indicators; and enhancing government-civil society cooperation and monitoring capacity in the field of GE.

Starting in March 2017, the project was planned so as to be completed in 24 months. In the project funded by the European Union, the beneficiary is the Ministry of Foreign Affairs Directorate for EU Affairs, contracting authority is the Central Finance and Contracts Unit and the implementing party is the Association for Monitoring Gender Equality. The target group of the project comprises gender-focused civil society organizations, other civil organizations engaged in rights-based monitoring, relevant governmental agencies, governorates and metropolitan municipalities, and district municipalities as units of equality. Project stakeholders include the Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services General Directorate on the Status of Women (KSGM), the TBMM (The Grand National Assembly of Turkey) Commission on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men (KEFEK), Human Rights and Equality Institution of Turkey (TİHEK), and Ombudsman Institution (KDK).

Mapping reports and **monitoring indicators** were developed in ten thematic areas identified in line with the objective of the project (combating gender-based violence against women; gender equality in participation to political decision making, to education, employment, religious activities, sports, access to urban rights/services, media and combat against trafficking in women/human beings). Besides, to make project outputs as well as many sources and data in relevant fields accessible to all, a **Gender Equality Monitoring Centre** was set up and made functional with its e-library. Mapping Reports on ten thematic areas and their summaries

were made available in the electronic environment, printed in Turkish and their informative summaries were released in Turkish and English. On the basis of Mapping Reports, 1337 GE monitoring indicators were presented to the public for use, 515 of which have their presently available or accessible data and 822 proposed to be developed.

One important component of the project was intensive work carried out in selected pilot provinces for local-level sharing of data from reports and indicators developed. Training in gender-sensitive rights-based monitoring and in mapping reports and monitoring indicators accompanied by preparatory workshops on local equality monitoring action plans were the activities carried out in selected seven pilot provinces. Efforts were made to establish and maintain **Local Equality Monitoring Platforms**. In Adana, Ankara, İstanbul, İzmir, Kars, Gaziantep and Trabzon as pilot provinces, **Local Equality Monitoring Plans** were developed to assess and monitor whether services delivered at local level observe gender equality, and a **National Equality Monitoring Plan** was prepared to scale up this work countrywide and ensure its sustenance.

The longer-term durability of services developed by the project is possible with the presence of sustained support. We believe that this support will be available as project outputs are used and further improved by large sections of society.

There are so many organizations and individuals contributing to the project without which it would be simply an impossible endeavour. We are grateful to the project team working with full commitment and engagement throughout the process, experts completing mapping reports and indicators in a long and tiresome work, and to CEİD members supporting the management of the project in harmony from its start to completion. CEİD local coordinators and training experts facilitated the implementation of the project by their hard work at both central and local levels. Staff from public organizations and representatives from civil society organizations who prepared Local Equality Monitoring Plans by taking part in work conducted by Local Monitoring Platforms put this work in practice at the local level. In case this project is to be attributed any success, it is the outcome of efforts and contributions of many including those we could not mention here. We are indebted to all for what they have added to the *Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Gender Equality Monitoring Project*.

Association for Monitoring Gender Equality

Board of Directors

Contents

Biography	3
Preface.....	4
List of Tables	8
List of Acronyms.....	9
I. INTRODUCTION	12
Brief History of Gender Equality and the Right to the City	12
II. IDENTIFICATION OF NORMS AND STANDARDS	15
A. Norms.....	15
B. Standards, Criteria and Best Practices.....	16
1. Standards.....	16
Standards set around the axis of the right to urban housing.....	16
Standards set around the axis of the right to urban mobility.....	16
Standards set around the axis of the right to urban democracy	19
Standards set around the axis of the right to urban safety.....	20
Standards set around the axis of the right to access to urban public services.....	20
2. Criteria	21
3. Good Examples	22
Good examples around the axis of the rights to urban housing and democracy ...	22
Good examples around the axis of the right to urban mobility	23
Good examples around the axis of the right to urban safety	25
III. ANALYSIS OF PRESENT SITUATION IN TURKEY: NORMATIVE-POLICY STRUCTURE.....	26
A. Mapping of legislation: Assessing the Compliance of Legislation with Relevant Human Rights Documents (Structural Monitoring)	29
B. Mapping of Relevant Policies: Assessing the Compliance of Policy Documents with Relevant Human Rights Documents (Structural Monitoring)	31
C. Mapping Capacities of Civil Society Organizations and Other Public Actors (Structural Monitoring).....	36
1. CSO cases in relation to urban rights	36
2. Management structure of CSOs.....	42
IV. INDICATOR AND DATA SOURCES	44
A. Mapping of Sources of Indicators.....	44
B. Mapping of relevant data	44

V. GENDER EQUALITY MAPPING IN TURKEY: URBAN RIGHTS AND SERVICES	46
VI. INDICATORS	49

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.	Sidewalk Standards	18
Table 2.	Criteria in Urban Rights and Services.....	22
Table 3.	Public Organizations and Agencies Relevant to Urban Rights and Services	32
Table 4.	Projects Implemented by Public Organizations.....	36
Table 5.	Women’s Organizations	38
Table 6.	LGBTI Organizations.....	40
Table 7.	Rights-Based Organizations	41
Table 8.	Management Structure of CSOs.....	42
Table 9.	Data Sources	44
Table 10.	Turkey: Sample Indicators and Data Sources Relating to the Status of Women in Cities.....	48
Table 11.	Indicators for which Data is Collected and Used in Turkey	49
Table 12.	Indicators Suggested for Use in Turkey	52

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AREM	T.C. Ministry of Interior Research and Study Centre
ASPB	Ministry of Family and Social Policy
CAFSU	Comité Action Femmes et Sécurité Urbaine
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CEİD	Gender Equality Monitoring Association
CEMR	Council of European Municipalities and Regions
CSO	Civil Society Organization
ECRI	European Commission on Racism and Intolerance
EIGE	European Institute of Gender Equality
FMDV	Global Fund for the Cities Development
HIC	Habitat International Coalition
IBDU	Brazilian Institute of Urban Law
IULA	International Union of Local Authorities
IULA-EMME	International Union of Local Authorities-Section for the Eastern Mediterranean and Middle East Region
KETEM	Centre for Early Diagnosis, Screening and Training in Cancer
KHK	Decree in Force of Law
KEİG	Women's Labour and Employment Initiative Platform
LGBTI	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender/Transsexual and Intersex
MSP	More Secure Places
SAKEM	Sarıyer Municipality, Women Studies Coordination Centre
SDI	Shack Slum Dwellers International
SOBAG	Social Sciences and Humanities Research and Support Group
SPoD	Association for Social Policy, Gender Identity and Sexual Orientation Studies
SWOT	Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats
TBMM	The Grand National Assembly of Turkey
TEPAV	Economic Policy Research Foundation of Turkey
TMMOB	Union of Chambers of Engineers and Architects
TÜBİTAK	Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey
TÜİK	Turkish Statistical Institute
TÜSİAD	Association of Industrialists and Businessmen of Turkey
UCLG	United Cities and Local Governments

UCLG-MEWA	United Cities and Local Governments Middle East West Asia Section
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNJP	United Nations Joint Programme
WALD	World Academy for Local Government and Democracy
WAVE	Women Against Violence Europe
WDS	Woman Design Service
WFC	Women Friendly City
WIEGO	Women in Informal Employment: Globalizing and Organizing
YEEP	Local Equality Action Plan
YEPPKOM	Local Equality Action Plan Coordination Committees

Information on the Names of Institutions

Since this report was completed before the decrees mentioned below it does not reflect changes made in the names of some major institutions. The Decree No. 703 in Force of Law on 'Amendment of Some Laws and Decrees to Ensure Compliance with Constitutional Amendments' was published in the Official Gazette No. 30473 dated 9 July 2018. The decree introduced changes to the organization and mandate of some Ministries and institutions.

With the Presidential Decree No. 1 dated 10 July 2018 on the Organization of the Office of Presidency and the Presidential Decree No. 4 dated 15 July 2018 on the Organization of Agencies and Institutions Under, Related and Attached to Ministries and other Agencies and Institutions, organizational structure and mandate of some ministries and institutions were modified.

The ministries and institutions subject to modifications are listed below.

- The Ministry of Family and Social Policies (*Aile ve Sosyal Politikalar Bakanlığı*) and Ministry of Labour and Social Security (*Çalışma ve Sosyal Güvenlik Bakanlığı*) were merged and renamed as 'Ministry of Labour, Social Services and Family.' (*Çalışma, Sosyal Hizmetler ve Aile Bakanlığı*)

Upon the Presidential Decree (Decree No. 15) dated 4 August 2018 on Amendments to Some Presidential Decrees, the Ministry of Labour, Social Services and Family (*Çalışma, Sosyal Hizmetler ve Aile Bakanlığı*) was renamed as Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services (*Aile, Çalışma ve Sosyal Hizmetler Bakanlığı*).

- The Ministry of European Union (*Avrupa Birliği Bakanlığı*) was closed and the Department of European Union (*Avrupa Birliği Başkanlığı*) was established within the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.
- The Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology (*Bilim, Sanayi ve Teknoloji Bakanlığı*) and Ministry of Development (*Kalkınma Bakanlığı*) were merged and named as Ministry of Industry and Technology (*Sanayi ve Teknoloji Bakanlığı*).
- The Ministry of Customs and Trade (*Gümrük ve Ticaret Bakanlığı*) and Ministry of Economy (*Ekonomi Bakanlığı*) were merged and renamed as Ministry of Trade (*Ticaret Bakanlığı*).
- The Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Animal Husbandry (*Gıda, Tarım ve Hayvancılık Bakanlığı*) and Ministry of Forestry and Hydraulic Works (*Orman ve Su İşleri Bakanlığı*) were merged and renamed as Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (*Tarım ve Orman Bakanlığı*).
- The Ministry of Finance (*Maliye Bakanlığı*) was renamed as Ministry of Treasury and Finance (*Hazine ve Maliye Bakanlığı*), and the Undersecretary of Treasury (*Hazine Müsteşarlığı*) which used to be under Deputy Prime Minister was transferred in the new structuring to the Ministry of Treasury and Finance.
- The Ministry of Transportation, Maritime Affairs and Communication (*Ulaştırma Denizcilik ve Haberleşme Bakanlığı*) was renamed as Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure (*Ulaştırma ve Altyapı Bakanlığı*).

I. Introduction

This is a mapping report prepared in the field of urban rights and services which is one of the thematic fields identified under the project "Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Monitoring Gender Equality." The objective of the report is to provide the framework necessary for monitoring the field of the right to the city on the basis of gender equality. The report first presents existing international norms, standards and good practices in the field of the right to the city in the context of human rights together with existing legislation in Turkey related to this issue. Then, information is given about civil society capacity required for monitoring, followed by sharing of indicators compiled from international indexes, survey data and academic studies to be used in rights-based monitoring in the context of urban rights and services.

Brief History of Gender Equality and the Right to the City

The first feminist criticism in the literature on urban and city planning appeared in the 1970s arguing that city planners planned "gendered" cities only in line with the needs of men and families (Beebeejaun, 2016). This criticism paved the way for studies seeking an answer to the question "how cities would look like if they had not been designed in a 'sexist way?'"¹ Also, there were works on the themes of city, women and gender focusing on the visibility of women in urban life² (Parker, 2011: 435). In particular, special issues focusing on "androcentric nature of transportation, housing and city design of such journals as *SIGNS* (1980), *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* (1978) and *Antipode* (1984) made their significant contributions to studies in this field (Parker, 2011: 434).

While the literature on the right to the city did not explicitly touch upon gender equality earlier, studies conducted later revealed that social fabric shaped by dominant culture created difficulties for women and the LGBTI in benefitting from facilities of urban life (Fenster, 2005). Though contributions in this regard continued, no meaningful transformation and progress could be observed in practice. While this situation is explained by the unchanged nature of social structure that gives rise to multi-layered discrimination that women face socially and economically (Beebeejaun, 2016), we observe that gender-based discussion of the right to the city always intersects with identity issues accompanied by differences in ethnicity, nationality and culture (Fenster, 2005). Thus, the right to the city that is gender-sensitive and devoid of inequalities requires a serious assessment of patriarchal power relations with ethnic and cultural dimensions that determine the use of private and public spaces by women and different individuals (Fenster, 2005). Existing inequalities of this kind may further be consolidated by gender-blind public policies. Meanwhile it is possible to mitigate and eventually eliminate inequalities through policies designed around the axis of human rights.

1 See, Hayden, D. (1980). What would a non-sexist city be like? Speculations on housing, urban design, and human work. *Signs*, 5(Suppl. 3), S170-S187.

2 See, Tivers, J. (1985). *Women attached*. London: Croom Helm

The theoretical base outlined above has led to better understanding of multi-dimensional phenomena related to the city which is now the main living space of population, and also served to institutional transformations in the recognition and protection of the rights of urban dwellers. Before anything else, the right to the city can be ensured by identifying what is required for an urban order where all can live equally and in decent conditions and responding to this requirement (Buckingham, 2010:57). In this vein, many international, national and local instruments (treaties, conventions) have been developed and signed by states and local governments to safeguard the right to the city. It must be added that particularly in the 90s, human rights activists, CSOs and various social movements contributed to this process while activities carried out under the United Nations were also vital and pioneering.

One of the most basic conditions of existing in a city is the means to have decent housing. It is universally accepted that the principal element in human safety is freedom from fear (UNDP, 2000: 29). In the context of gender, the most important problem faced in sharing facilities of urban life is safety for women and the LGBTI. Besides its restrictive nature, discrimination in the use of some urban spaces also threatens life safety and increases the possibility of being exposed to violence (Fenster, 2005; Falú, 2010; Falú, 2014). Poor safety arrangements, restriction of means to access to such urban spaces as parks, urban squares, houses, etc. (transportation, mobility) undermines equal participation to urban life. As a result, women and the LGBTI are jammed in their own safe spaces; they share urban life only partly and cannot fully enjoy their urban rights. A natural consequence of this exclusion is restriction of their say about urban life, which means restriction of political participation. When there is poor participation to activities of both local governments and civil society organizations, the rights of women and LGBTI cannot be voiced sufficiently and contribution to policies for improvement remains limited. As is the case for other inequalities, monitoring of gender inequality in the context of exclusion from the enjoyment of urban rights will make it easier to better access the situation and to develop suggestions for solution (Cebollada-Frontera & Miralles-Guasch, 2006; Falú, 2014).

While the concept the “right to the city” started to be discussed from the mid-60s, the stress on the gender dimension of this right came first in 1992 when Article 20 in the European Urban Charter-1³ stated that local governments are forbidden to engage in gender-based discrimination in their service delivery. The European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life-II⁴ signed in 2006 was the document in which this right was addressed with its full dimensions in the context of gender equality. Further, the concluding report of the Habitat-III⁵ convened in 2016 includes suggestions and emphases concerning how gender equality is to be realized in the field of urban rights and services. The latter parts of the report expose the historical evolution of the right with its main features accompanied by norms and standards derived from international instruments as well as good practices.

The present report prepared to provide a general framework and a roadmap for monitoring in the field of urban rights and services consists of four main parts. The second part following introduction identifies norms and standards in the field of urban rights and services. This part first presents a list of international conventions, their annex documents and recommendations,

3 European Urban Charter. (1992). EU. <http://www.mimarlarodasi Ankara.org/?id=964>. Accessed: 3 August 2017.

4 European Urban Charter-II. (2008). Manifesto for a New Urbanity. Council of Europe. http://kisi.deu.edu.tr/yakup.ozkaya/UIKDocs_kentselsart_.pdf. Accessed: 10 August 2017.

5 HABITAT-III. (2017). UN. New Urban Agenda (71/256 UN resolution). <http://www.csb.gov.tr/db/habitat/editordosya/file/dokumanlar/TR-Habitat%20III%20New%20Urban%20Agenda%20%28Zero%20Draft%29-Turkce.pdf>. Accessed: 27 August 2017.

concluding reports of gatherings like HABITAT which have their States Parties though not having binding character, and documents prepared by civil society, which again do not have the status of convention or declaration but provide guidelines and principles in the field of urban rights and services. Then, fields of rights related to human rights norms and urban rights and services contained in these documents were identified. This was followed by the identification of standards responding to the question how these norms were to be translated into life on the basis of same documents accompanied by examples of internationally recognized good practices.

The third part of the report analyses the present situation in Turkey in the field of urban rights and services. This part includes evaluation of both the legislation in effect and related policy documents together with a mapping of capacity of relevant civil society organizations and other public actors. The fourth part of the report compiles indicators that can be used in rights-based monitoring of urban rights and services.

II. Identification of Norms and Standards

A. Norms

The international human rights instruments lay down basic norms in relation to rights. Accordingly, the following are the most frequently cited norms in international human rights documents:

- Non-discrimination,
- Gender equality,
- Respect for human dignity, and
- Sustainability,

These norms are recognized also by international instruments related to the right to the city and they provide the basis of practices related to this right.

The following are the “fields of rights in the city” that we shall focus on for gender-based monitoring of urban rights and services.

- Housing
- Safety
- Mobility
- Access to urban public services
- Urban democracy

Below is a brief explanation about the scope of these areas⁶:

Housing: All citizens have means and opportunities of housing in safe and sanitary conditions,

Safety: All public and semi-public spaces in the city including parks, gardens, sites, neighbourhoods, streets, downtown, etc. are safe for all citizens for 24 hours,

Mobility: Urban dwellers enjoy free mobility within the city and in transport to other cities at any time of the day; availability of accessible and affordable-low cost means of public-mass transportation for citizens for this purpose; arrangement of urban infrastructure including bicycle and pedestrian ways and sidewalks so as to respond to mobility needs of different individuals,

Access to urban public services: Ensuring equal access to physical and social infrastructure in cities; in other words, offering local public services with easy access and responding to the needs of all,

Urban democracy: Soliciting the opinion of urban dwellers in the planning and management of cities; availability of participatory mechanisms by which citizens convey their requests, priorities and needs.

⁶ Based on explanations made in relevant documents and recommendations of international organizations and documents containing principles that are not binding but developed by recognized initiatives in this field without that will be mentioned ahead.

B. Standards, Criteria and Best Practices

1. Standards

Standards set around the axis of the right to urban housing

- Identification of the needs of the most disadvantaged group⁷
- Safe, healthy and appropriate housing⁸
- Safe shelters for the homeless, women victimized by violence and the LGBTI⁹
- Housing policies considerate of different needs (informally employed persons, migrants, women in single-parent families, etc.)¹⁰
- Low-cost housing opportunities¹¹
- Mechanisms of lending and incentives for women in mass housing¹²
- Priority to single-parent/household head women¹³
- Legislation regulating various forms of tenancy¹⁴
- Safeguarding women's position as tenants,
- Equipping women with equal rights in owning a house and safeguarding their use of¹⁵
- Identification of differing needs of poorest women
- Access to safe water and sewage services¹⁶

Standards set around the axis of the right to urban mobility

- Producing gender-disaggregated data relating to urban mobility¹⁷
- Ensuring physical safety in urban transportation^{18,19}
- Identifying mobility needs of different individuals separately^{20,21}
- Identifying urban transportation habits of different individuals
- Removing obstacles to access to urban services²²

7 HABITAT -I (Vancouver Canada), 1976: Article 2

8 European Charter for the Safeguarding of Human Rights in the City, 2000

9 European Charter for the Safeguarding of Human Rights in the City, 2000

10 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

11 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004; European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

12 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

13 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

14 HABITAT III - New Urban Agenda, 2017, Paragraph 33

15 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

16 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

17 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

18 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

19 Another example in the same context is the practice that women passengers in mass transportation can get off at any point on the route after 10:00 p.m. in services delivered by Eskişehir, İstanbul and İzmir Metropolitan Municipalities. For detailed information: <http://www.hurriyet.com.tr/izmirde-kadinlar-22-00den-sonra-istedikleri-yerde-otobusten-inebilecek-40304852>

20 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

21 An example of good practice related to this standard can be given by referring to Eskişehir Metropolitan Municipality that extends mass transportation services to rural women to ensure their access to KETEM cancer screening at the city. For detailed information: <http://www.unwomen.org/en/news/stories/2015/4/rural-women-access-early-cancer-screening-in-turkey>

22 HABITAT III - New Urban Agenda, 2017, Paragraph 26.

In addition to these standards included in international documents, standards used in accessibility monitoring and supervision work launched in 2013 by the Ministry of Family and Social Policies in Turkey under the leadership of the General Directorate of Services for the Disabled and Elderly provides opportunities for ensuring urban mobility on the basis of gender equality.²³ The Accessibility Monitoring and Supervision Regulation prepared on the basis of the Law No. 5378 on Persons with Disabilities which took effect on 20 July 2013 with its publication in the Official Gazette No. 28713 brings some standards on width and height of sidewalks which are given in Table 1.

As can be traced in Table 1, standards relating to sidewalks vary by density.²⁴ Table 1 also includes questions that must be responded to while checking the accessibility of sidewalks.

23 For detailed information visit: <https://eyh.aile.gov.tr/uygulamalar/erisilebilirlik/erisilebilirlik-mevzuati-ve-genelgeler/erisilebilirlik-izleme-ve-denetleme-yonetmeligi-ve-genelgeler>

24 Low density (Sidewalk with pedestrian density of up to $d = 0.3$ pedestrian/m² where pedestrians do not need to get ahead of others)
Limited density (Sidewalk with pedestrian density of $d = [0.3 - 0.6]$ pedestrian/m² where pedestrians can walk easily, take normal steps and get ahead of others without trouble.)
Medium density (Sidewalk with pedestrian density of $d = [0.6 - 1.0]$ pedestrian/m² where it is less easy to take normal steps and get ahead of other and where there is more pedestrian scramble.)
High density (Sidewalk with pedestrian density of $d = [1.0 - 1.5]$ pedestrian/m² where there is overcrowding as a result of the existence of sports and arts activities, cinemas and theatres, schools, etc. In such environments, steps are restrained, speed gets lower, scrambles increase and it gets difficult for pedestrians to walk without touching each other).

Table 1. Sidewalk Standards

Low density	Limited density	Medium density	High density
<p>For all pedestrians to move freely on sidewalks with low density:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Ground grids with distance longer than ± 1.3 centimetres in-between, ■ Ground grids parallel to the direction of movement, ■ Bollards and other vehicle blockers, ■ Electric pole, ■ Conduit box, ■ Mail box, ■ Advertising boards, ■ Signboards, ■ Store stands and hangers, ■ Tables, chairs and stools, ■ Parked vehicles, ■ Damaged flooring, ■ Stretched parking lot chains, ■ Bumps and pits, ■ Is there at least 150 cm wide pass way free from manhole covers and other obstacles creating rise of over ± 0.6 cm? <p>Is there minimum 50 cm wide safety lane on the side of vehicle road on sidewalks with low density?</p> <p>In low density sidewalks is there minimum 25 cm wide private property line adjacent to property?</p>	<p>For all pedestrians to move freely on sidewalks with limited density:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Ground grids with distance longer than ± 1.3 centimetres in-between, ■ Ground grids parallel to the direction of movement, ■ Bollards and other vehicle blockers, ■ Electric pole, ■ Conduit box, ■ Mail box, ■ Advertising boards, ■ Signboards, ■ Store stands and hangers, ■ Tables, chairs and stools, ■ Parked vehicles, ■ Damaged flooring, ■ Stretched parking lot chains, ■ Bumps and pits, ■ Is there at least 200 cm wide pass way free from manhole covers and other obstacles creating rise of over ± 0.6 cm? <p>Is there minimum 50 cm wide safety lane on the side of vehicle road on sidewalks with limited density?</p> <p>In limited density sidewalks is there minimum 25 cm wide private property line adjacent to property?</p>	<p>For all pedestrians to move freely on sidewalks with medium density:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Ground grids with distance longer than ± 1.3 centimetres in-between, ■ Ground grids parallel to the direction of movement, ■ Bollards and other vehicle blockers, ■ Electric pole, ■ Conduit box, ■ Mail box, ■ Advertising boards, ■ Signboards, ■ Store stands and hangers, ■ Tables, chairs and stools, ■ Parked vehicles, ■ Damaged flooring, ■ Stretched parking lot chains, ■ Bumps and pits, ■ Is there at least 250 cm wide pass way free from manhole covers and other obstacles creating rise of over ± 0.6 cm? <p>Is there minimum 50 cm wide safety lane on the side of vehicle road on sidewalks with medium density?</p> <p>In medium density sidewalks is there minimum 50 cm wide private property line adjacent to property?</p>	<p>For all pedestrians to move freely on sidewalks with high density:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Ground grids with distance longer than ± 1.3 centimetres in-between, ■ Ground grids parallel to the direction of movement, ■ Bollards and other vehicle blockers, ■ Electric pole, ■ Conduit box, ■ Mail box, ■ Advertising boards, ■ Signboards, ■ Store stands and hangers, ■ Tables, chairs and stools, ■ Parked vehicles, ■ Damaged flooring, ■ Stretched parking lot chains, ■ Bumps and pits, ■ Is there at least 300 cm wide pass way free from manhole covers and other obstacles creating rise of over ± 0.6 cm? <p>Is there minimum 120 cm wide safety lane on the side of vehicle road on sidewalks with high density?</p> <p>In high density sidewalks is there minimum 50 cm wide private property line adjacent to property?</p>

Source: ASPB, General Directorate of Services for the Disabled and Elderly, Accessibility Monitoring and Supervision Regulations, 2013.²⁵

²⁵ See, ASPB website: http://eyh.aile.gov.tr/data/58d128db6914078278e71ac3/ek-ii_a_yaya%20kaldirimlar.pdf, Accessed: 14 February 2018.

Considering individuals' freedom to mobility in the context of urban rights and services, *walkability* is another feature that we come across. On this issue, Ewing and Cervero (2010) focus on *density, distance to transit, destination accessibility, diversity* and *design* as determinants of mobility in the city. Here, density denotes number of people per km² and as density decreases so does walkability and individuals can reach from one point to another only by using a vehicle. The second element related to mass transportation is the distance between home and the closest point for transit. Shorter this distance higher is individuals' choice for walking and mobility. According to internationally agreed standards this distance should be around 400 m (El-Geneidy et al., 2013). In addition, the distance between stops also affects people's experience in mobility. According to standards relating to rules on city roads-bus stops set by the Turkish Standards Institution (TSE-11783, dated 2 January 2014, TSE 2014), stops must be selected at locations close to pedestrian arteries coinciding with bus routes so as to facilitate access for passengers. The distance between two stops must be 400-500 meters. It can be 600-700 meters on major arteries. These distances may be reduced by 100 meters at locations where there is high passenger density.

As other factors determining urban mobility, destination accessibility and diversity in fact complement each other. Destination accessibility is the multiplicity of means that facilitate travel and make it attractive. Diversity derives from the idea that multiple functions of urban spaces in terms of utilization encourage human mobility. Close location and combined planning of spaces for business activities, residence, shopping and leisure will increase the appeal of such spaces for users and accordingly encourage mobility. As the last element, design is related to the physical properties of urban spaces. Quality of street connections can be given as an example. The issue is the effect on human mobility of straight and connected streets where there is high rate of urbanization on the one hand and circular streets in outskirts with rare connections in-between. The element "design" also covers such issues as the availability and width of streets, number of pedestrian crossings and trees along streets that affect human mobility.

Standards set around the axis of the right to urban democracy

- Mechanisms facilitating participation²⁶
- Quota, positive action and legislative arrangement²⁷
- Taking women and feminist organizations as counterparts in the physical planning of the city
- Counselling and participation structures responding to different needs of women and men²⁸
- Participative and gender responsive budgeting²⁹
- Counselling committees³⁰
- Neighbourhood councils/assemblies

26 HABITAT - I (Vancouver Canada), 1976

27 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

28 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

29 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

30 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

- E-participation³¹
- Participatory planning processes³²
- Effective mechanisms for accountability³³
- Systems of monitoring on equalitarian and fair distribution of resources³⁴
- Ensuring citizens' access to data collected on access to services³⁵

Standards set around the axis of the right to urban safety

- Lightening in streets and parking lots³⁶
- Safety and lightening of transfer stations in mass transportation³⁷
- Identification of perceptions of insecurity and lack of safety in the city by women and men separately³⁸
- Campaigns on violence against women³⁹

Standards set around the axis of the right to access to urban public services

- Gathering gender-disaggregated levels of access to services by individuals⁴⁰
- Surveys measuring and making visible unpaid household labour of women⁴¹
- A decentralized planning policy to prevent the clustering of urban services at specific points and make these services accessible to all wherever they are⁴²
- Developing infrastructure, services and facilities that consider the needs of children, elderly and disabled persons⁴³
- Introducing means of transfer or discount for women in the delivery of services involving monetary transaction⁴⁴
- Municipality's commitment to the public to deliver equalitarian services⁴⁵
- Training public personnel in equality⁴⁶
- Standards of behaviour that employed persons must comply with (respecting norms of human rights and covering principles related to the right to the city)⁴⁷
- Gender assessment of existing policies, procedures and patterns of use⁴⁸

31 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

32 Gwangju Principles for a Human Rights City, 2014

33 Gwangju Principles for a Human Rights City, 2014

34 HABITAT III - New Urban Agenda, 2017, Paragraph 44.

35 HABITAT III - New Urban Agenda, 2017, Paragraph 42-43-44.

36 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

37 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

38 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

39 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

40 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

41 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

42 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

43 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

44 Charter for Women's Right to the City, 2004

45 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

46 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

47 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

48 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006: "Reviewing existing policies, procedures, practices and patterns and volumes of usage, in order to assess whether they disclose any unfair discrimination, whether they are based on

- Childcare services⁴⁹
- Care services for others that there is obligation to deliver care⁵⁰.

2. Criteria

Addressing urban rights and services in the context of gender is a relatively new theme compared to other fields. In places where standards in this field have yet not been developed we can refer to some criteria set by the United Nations. In the United Nations Habitat 2014-2019 Gender Equality Action Plan⁵¹ (2015) strategic targets are revised and presented under seven headings:

1. Urban legislation, land use and governance,
2. City planning and design,
3. City economy,
4. Basic urban services,
5. Housing and slum upgrading,
6. Risk mitigation and rehabilitation,
7. Research and capacity building.

In the context of fields of housing, mobility, urban democracy, safety and access to public services that our report focuses on, it will be useful to visit criteria related to strategic targets 1, 2, 4 and 5.

These criteria corresponding to strategic targets can be found in Table 2 below.

gender stereotypes, and whether they adequately take into account any specific needs of women and men.”

49 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

50 European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, 2006

51 https://issuu.com/unhabitat/docs/gender_equality_action_plan_2014-20

Table 2. Criteria in Urban Rights and Services

Strategic Target	Criteria
Urban legislation, land use and governance	Equal access to, use and control of land available to all by developing poor-friendly, gender-sensitive and scalable land instruments. Improving urban management through accountable, inclusive, democratic and gender-sensitive institutions and systems Ensuring women's and girl child's safe and autonomous access to quality urban services, public spaces and all forms of mobility - as a prerequisite for their active and meaningful participation to city planning, administration and governance
City planning and design	Developing policies and necessary structures for planning and designing gender-sensitive, compact, integrated and interconnected cities. Enhancing capacity of city, regional and national governments for development and implementation of gender-sensitive plans and projects to reach compact, socially inclusive, integrated and interconnected cities.
Basic urban services	Enhancing capacity of city, regional and national governments for the implementation of gender-sensitive policies to promote equality in access to basic services. Increasing investment flows to basic urban services with gender effect mobilized in partner countries through UN-Habitat programmes. Ensuring increase in the utilization of sustainable basic urban services (i.e. increases in the utilization of drinking water, electricity, etc.)
Housing and slum upgrading	Development of global framework for progress and effectiveness in inclusive housing and slum upgrading Integrating/mainstreaming sustainable and inclusive housing, slum upgrading and protection approach in national policies, strategies and development plans. Integrating/mainstreaming sustainable and inclusive housing, slum upgrading and protection approach in local development plans.

3. Good Examples

Good examples around the axis of the rights to urban housing and democracy^{52 53}

Kuyasa fund, Cape Town, South Africa⁵²

The Kuyasa Fund is a micro scale housing improvement loan scheme targeting low income households with women as household head. 76% of its beneficiaries are women not found eligible for receiving loans from the formal banking system. The Kuyasa offered the opportunity for borrowing with low repayment interest in terms of 30 months and also delivered trainings related to the use of the fund. As a result, upgrading that house owners made in their houses both improved their living standards and increased the economic value of their houses.⁵³

⁵² UN-Habitat 2004 best practice award

⁵³ <http://housingfinanceafrica.org/app/uploads/Kuyasa-Fund-case-study1.pdf>, Accessed: 1 February 2018.

Brighton and Hove, housing, safety and urban democracy for the LGBTI

In 2015, as a result of negotiations between official authorities, service providers, various communities and local residents in the city of Brighton and Hove a new strategy document was prepared for housing. The strategy document clearly states the aim of creating a safe, healthy and environment-friendly city that maintains high standards while offering housing opportunities at reasonable prices to all including property owners or tenants, those in social housing or homeless. This approach fully coinciding with the concept of the right to the city constitutes a good example that can be easily linked to the fields of housing and safety.

Meanwhile, it is worth noting that there is explicit emphasis on gender differences.

- Being sensitive to the needs of LGBTI individuals by providing accessible, inclusive and safe housing opportunities that will strengthen social welfare (HOUSING)
- Providing housing and support services to eliminate crimes of hatred, discrimination and harassment targeting the LGBTI community (SAFETY)
- Providing planned and renewed housing and support services by consulting to the LGBTI community (URBAN DEMOCRACY)⁵⁴

Good examples around the axis of the right to urban mobility

Vienna, data production for urban mobility⁵⁵

On the basis of the principle “different individuals have different needs” the Vienna city management analysed urban mobility situations of individuals with different ages, sexes and identities including ones with or without disabilities on the basis of “mobility needs” and “mobility patterns” and, in the context of the sample examined, the questions “who, where, when and how” were included in the analysis with respect to mobility. Also questioned in this analysis is individuals’ safety perceptions and level of access to services (Irschiket al., 2013).

54 <http://www.brighton-hove.gov.uk/content/housing/general-housing/housing-strategy-2015>, Accessed: 1 February 2018.

55 http://www.un.org/womenwatch/ianwge/member_publications/gender_mainstreaming_in_local_authorities.pdf Accessed: 10 February 2018.

Vienna, "city of short distances"⁵⁶

The gender-sensitive city planning perspective in Vienna resulting from analyses and observations is formulated in 7 categories (Irschik et al., 2013: 25-29). These categories and their priority issues can be summarized as follows:

- 1. Strengthening of multi-centred urban infrastructure:** Preventing the clustering of shopping streets and live centres hierarchically at certain locations, locating urban infrastructure services (parks, gardens, schools, hospitals, universities, etc.) by due account of extensiveness and proximity of mass transportation network.
- 2. City of short distances:** The principle of the "city of short distances" seeks to harmonize responsibilities driving from work and family life and to ensure effective combination of paid work, domestic work, care, shopping and service utilization; it refers to planning that facilitates access by allotting critical spaces in a de-centralized way: Banks, markets, parks/open spaces, post offices, bill payment centres, etc.
- 3. High quality public space:** Planning responding to different needs of individuals. Design of parks, city squares and street landscape so as to respond to different needs.
- 4. Support to environment-friendly transportation:** Work carried out by the Coordination Office showed that the majority of pedestrians, bicycle and mass transportation users are women. Given this, instead of private car use or freeway-based infrastructure design, a planning that envisages more bicycle and pedestrian ways and easy access to mass transportation will both uphold gender equality and yield environment-friendly outcomes.
- 5. Safe city:** Making living spaces and residences safe-secure and attractive, ensuring that women, men, young and old persons can move freely at any time of the day. Identification and elimination of threatening blind points, improvement of lightening systems.
- 6. City without barriers:** Arranging spaces so as to respond to different needs and allocating resources accordingly including street landscape and urban square design (pedestrian corridors, width and height of sidewalks, paving stones, ramps, building entries without barriers, sitting benches with armrest in squares, etc.)
- 7. Planning and public works considerate of daily life requirements:** Under this category, distribution of paid and domestic work and needs of different groups are considered while planning for residences and public spaces. For example, the ways of using of and needs in relation to a house, an apartment, semi-public and public spaces may differ with respect to 12 years old children, adults, elderly people, those who commute every day and do housework as well. Also, for example, having a laundry drying place on the terrace or garden of an apartment building may offer occasions of going out and socialize for people after returning home from work. Further, the availability of flexible-different flat options in buildings, playgrounds, laundry-hobby rooms, sufficient green area and shopping places will provide facilities for individuals having their different daily life cycles.

Montreal model for distance between two stops⁵⁷

The *Comité Action Femmes et Sécurité Urbaine/CAFSU* launched in 1992 in Montreal, the second largest city in Canada is a joint project participated by feminist groups, academics, urban transportation authorities, health staff and the police. The committee cooperated with *La Société de Transport de la Communauté Urbaine de Montréal* to assess safety problems that women face in transportation at night. The solution was to shorten women's walking distance by enabling them to get off in-between stops. Originally covering women only, the project was reconsidered in 1994 and made permanent in December 1996 to be effective for longer hours in a day.⁵⁸

56 http://www.un.org/womenwatch/ianwge/member_publications/gender_mainstreaming_in_local_authorities.pdf Accessed: 11 February 2018.

57 http://www.un.org/womenwatch/ianwge/member_publications/gender_mainstreaming_in_local_authorities.pdf Accessed: 14 February 2018.

58 <http://cdeacf.ca/organisation/comite-action-femmes-securite-urbaine-cafsu>, Accessed: 5 February 2018.

Good examples around the axis of the right to urban safety

Seoul, safety and urban democracy

Integrated programme for making Seoul safer for women

When sexual violence that women are exposed to in public spaces assumed serious dimensions, the Seoul Metropolitan Government made a commitment in 2012 to make the city safer for women. Besides civil society organizations active in combating sexual violence against women, citizens and experts also participated to the process of designing this new policy. Criminal statistics were examined and areas and types of offences were identified. There were also public meetings and interviews exposing the experience of victims. The city management launched awareness building campaigns putting **human rights** in general and **women's rights** in particular at the centre of its policy instead of resorting to the way of making penalties heavier. The components of this integrated policy were as follows:

1. Training programmes and campaigns to build awareness in human rights in all age groups and sexes,
2. Creating environmental, human and transportation networks to make the city as a whole safe for women,
3. Establishing a centre for victims of violence to report and to seek protection.

Police officers, psychological counsellors, doctors and lawyers took part in the **Unit for Intervention to Sexual Violence Crisis** established along this line. In seeking integrated solution to the problem, importance was attached to public-private partnership and the support of citizens and private sector was ensured. For example, women's sheltering possibilities were increased upon the participation of 656 shops open for 24 hours to the programme

"Women's Safety Station." A private security firm installed cameras, infra-red sensors and shutters in low income areas. A human safety network was created: Neighbourhood watchers, persons working in sheltering shops and night companions all of whom were volunteers and some were men received training.

(Choi; 2014), (Choi et al. 2015), (Fulu, 2016), (Um; 2017), (Seoul Metropolitan Government, Yi; 2017).

Manchester, London & Bristol "more secure places"⁵⁹

The More Secure Places/MSP project was a three-year security project carried out by the WDS (Women's Design Service) in the period 1995-1998 to increase women's participation to decision making processes. In November 2004, the WDS was authorized by the Greater London Authority to identify necessary measures to safeguard women in open spaces and parks. Under the project aiming to supervise community security at local level women can present concrete policy suggestions to local governments. In this respect, the project can be mentioned as a good example in the field of urban democracy for enhancing participation. Practical policy suggestions were developed through mapping work and neighbourhood visits and observations. Further, the presence of academics, CSOs and city councils as project stakeholders gives it a multi-faceted character. Besides increasing the representation of minority groups, the project envisages encouraging suggestions related to arrangements in physical surroundings and examining the conceived and actual state of the issue of security on the basis of participation and commitment. In this respect it can be said that the field of the right to safety has its important place in the project. Priority issues addressed in ensuring safety include sexual harassment and assault that women have their concerns about being victims of in public spaces. Participation to relevant researches by local communities and women as well as emerging interaction creates a significant potential. Though the WDS continued its work up to 2012, projects were suspended for a time due to changes in internal procedures and limited funds.

59 http://www.un.org/womenwatch/ianwge/member_publications/gender_mainstreaming_in_local_authorities.pdf Accessed: 14 February 2018.

III. Analysis of Present Situation in Turkey: Normative-Policy Structure

The process of development of the right to the city which re-made itself to the world agenda in the 2000s can be traced in the context of international conventions and treaties that Turkey is a state party to and relations with international or supra-national organizations that she has membership. The process mentioned is given in quite detail in the Local Governments Special Expertise Commission Report which is the outcome of the preparation stage of the Tenth Development Plan covering the period 2014-2018. The process of development of the right to the city in Turkey is summarized below on the basis of this comprehensive report prepared by the Ministry of Development.

Turkey joined the Council of Europe in 1949 as a founding member the same year it was established. The European Congress of Local and Regional Authorities⁶⁰ is the advisory organ of the Council of Europe that has been working since its establishment for strengthening local governments and solving problems at local level, also steering member states' local and regional systems. The organ composed of elected local governors from countries encourages member states to change their local government systems in line with specific principles. The European Congress of Local and Regional Authorities consists of two assemblies as regional and local and Turkey is represented in both. The council also organizes, in every 2 or 3 years, the European Conference of Ministers Responsible for Local and Regional Development hosted by one member-country to discuss some selected themes. At these conferences, recent developments related to local governments are discussed, policies on relevant issues are developed and ministers from member countries exchange opinions. In 2000, İstanbul hosted the Conference of Ministers held on the theme "Role of Local Governments in Local Social Services" (Ministry of Development, 2014: 42-43).

The rationale of the European Charter for Local Self-Government aiming to blend traditions of local government in Europe which was opened to signing in 1985 is declared as ensuring citizen participation to the management of public affairs. Turkey ratified the European Charter for Local Self-Government by accepting some of its articles with the Law No. 3723 on the Ratification of the European Charter for Local Self-Government and authorized the Council of Ministers to adopt other articles or clauses. The Council of Ministers approved, with its decision no. 92/3398 dated 6 August 1992, the European Charter for Local Self-Government with some reservations. The "decision" adopted in 1997 by the European Congress of Local and Regional Authorities in relation to local government system in Turkey stressed that local and regional governments in the country are under a heavy state tutelage (Ministry of Development, 2014: 43-44).

As important regional documents related to urban rights the European Urban Charter-I and European Urban Charter-II were prepared by the Council of Europe. The Charter-I adopted and declared in 1992 and opened exclusively to the signature of local governments recognizes the following as fundamental rights of urban dwellers: Freedom from violence, from all kinds of pollution and contamination, distorted and unregulated urban environments; democratic

60 The theme of the 34th Session of the Congress of Local and Regional Authorities to convene on 27-28 March 2018 is "Right-based Governance at Local and Regional Level". <https://www.coe.int/en/web/congress/home>, Accessed: 16.02.2018.

control over urban spaces of living; decent housing; access to and use of health and cultural services and freedom of mobility. The document also asserts that these rights must be granted to all in equal terms without any distinction by age, sex, race and conviction. The European Urban Charter-II was adopted in 2008 under the heading "Manifesto for a New Urbanity" by considering changing national and international relations and changes in local governments associated with the former. Urban rights are a must for urban dwellers to lead a decent life. There is yet no local government in Turkey signing the charter (Ministry of Development, 2014: 45-46).

The European Landscape Convention is a framework agreement for preserving, managing and planning Europe's natural and cultural landscapes as a whole. It was opened to signature by the Council in 2000 and adopted by 29 countries. The convention taking effect internationally in 2004 was signed by Turkey in 2000; it was ratified upon the Council of Ministers Decision No. 2003/5908 published in the Official Gazette dated 27 July 2003 and given effect on 1 March 2004. The convention assigns responsibilities to both central and local governments. Given pressures on landscapes in Turkey including by urbanization, industrialization, mining, etc. it is expected that gaps in legislation, policy and practices in this field will be eliminated with commitments specified in the convention (Ministry of Development, 2014: 46-47).

Turkey's process of accession to the European Union that started with the Ankara Treaty in 1963 made a significant step ahead with the acceptance of her candidate status at the Helsinki Summit of 1999. The European Union's wide-ranging effects on public administration in Turkey emerged at this stage and gained further depth in the 2000s. According to the principle of 'good governance' adopted by the White Book published by the European Union in 2001, the work of local governments must be open to citizens scrutiny and public services must be delivered in effective, accessible and participatory ways. Upon the request of the European Union, the process of reform in restructuring public administration proceeded under the impact of such concepts as decentralization and regionalization. As a part of the local government reform launched in 2004, the Metropolitan Municipality Law No. 5216, Provincial Private Administration Law No. 5302, Municipalities Law No. 5393 and the Law no. 5449 on the Establishment, Coordination and Duties of Development Agencies took effect. The sharing of mandate and authority between central and local governments is restructured in this context and arrangements were made for the formation of city councils as a new mechanism for participation. As a result of the process of accession to the European Union comprehensive projects were developed in regard to "disadvantaged" groups through regional and local level initiatives and requirements of de-centralized governments were tried to be met by enhancing the capacity of local governments to deliver services to citizens commensurate with their scale (Ministry of Development, 2014: 14, 36-37, 42).

The United Nations is another important international organization established in 1945 with Turkey as one of its founding members. The UN General Assembly resolved in 1994 to hold the Habitat II as a city summit and the meeting hosted by Turkey took place in Istanbul on 3-14 June 1996 with its major themes as "Sustainable Human Settlements" and "Adequate Shelter for All" (Ministry of Development, 2014: 49).

The Local Agenda 21 Action Plan coordinated and supported by the United Nations Development Programme/UNDP is implemented in many countries including the countries of Europe in the

first place. The Local Agenda 21 aims to strengthen local governance by including civil society in decision making mechanisms of local governments. With the agreement signed at the end of 1997 by the International Union of Local Authorities-Section for the Eastern Mediterranean and Middle East Region/IULA-EMME, the UNDP launched the "Project on Encouraging and Promoting Local Agenda 21s in Turkey" (Ministry of Development, 2014: 51).

The IULA-EMME started its activities in Turkey in 1987 as one of its seven regional organizations in the world upon a decree issued by the Council of Ministers. The IULA-EMME connects many international organizations to local governments in Turkey and is a founding member of the WALD in the region. The IULA-EMME changed as UCLG-MEWA upon an amendment made in its bylaw in 2004. The UCLG to which Turkey is a member in regard to local governments is the official speaker of local governments before the United Nations. Having its members from over 100 countries, the UCLG is presently the most inclusive organization in the world covering cities and local governments. The UCLG is active on the basis of three principles as democracy, local autonomy and devolution in service delivery. Established in 1993, the WALD is a voluntary organization aiming to develop and ensure the sustenance of local democracy. With its research and cooperation projects in Turkey the WALD seeks to create examples of democratic governance in cities and address the problems of the urban poor, children, women and migrants. The following are some works carried out in this context: Youth and Local Government (1995-1996); Fifty Years of Democracy in Turkey (1946-1996); Local Agenda 21; Cultural and Political Formation of Urban Poverty in Turkey; Child Rights and Municipalities; Social Development- Capacity Building (2000-2001); Project on Strengthening Neighbours and Neighbourhood Heads (1997-2000); Woman and City: Adding "Gender" Dimension to Local Government Mechanisms in Turkey (1997-1999); Training in Gender and Democracy for Local Government Staff (2000-2001); Project on Promoting the Status of Women in Local Decision Making Mechanisms in Middle East and Eastern Mediterranean Regions (2003-2004) (Ministry of Development, 2014: 52-54).

The UCLG-MEWA established the Gender Equality Committee upon a decision taken by the joint meeting of the Managing Board and Council of the UCLG-MEWA held in Adana in December 2014. The co-chairs of the Committee are Şişli Municipality, Sarıyer Municipality and WALD. At the second meeting of the Committee held in January 2017 it was decided to promote the European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life, establish equality units in municipalities and prepare local equality action plans, and to localize the Sustainable Development Goal 5. The third meeting of the Committee took place in May 2017 with Şişli Municipality as its host. This meeting signed the "UCLG-MEWA Gender Equality Committee Commitment to Localize Sustainable Development Goal 5". The commitment requires signatory local governments to sign and implement the European Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life; establish permanent mechanisms like Equality Units, Women and Family Directorates and Women's Affairs Departments in municipalities and Gender Equality Commissions in Municipal Councils to translate gender equality into life; and to share relevant information with the Monitoring Committee (UCLG-MEWA, 2017, request for information).

In sum, the basic factor affecting the development of the right to the city in Turkey is international conventions that the country is a party to, and international and supra-national organizations. It must be kept in mind, however, that changing circumstances too affect, change and transform international arrangements and organizations. For example, as one of the most important

documents in the field of urban rights, the European Urban Charter-I first came to the agenda in 1992; but upon changing national and international relations which also brought about changes in local governments, this document was updated and the European Urban Charter-II was adopted in 2008. It was in 2004 that the Charter for Women's Right to the City was adopted. In other words, the right to the city started to come to the fore with its gender dimension starting from the early 2000s. Having said these, it must be noted that besides international trends, national and local characteristics too have their influence on the present shaping of the right to the city. In this context, the first relevant document to be considered in relation to the right to the city is the Constitution. As to legislation in the context of public administration reform in the early 2000s and the right to the city, we see the Metropolitan Municipality Law No. 5216, the Provincial Private Administration Law No. 5302, and the Law No. 5393 on Municipalities. The Law No. 5840 on Commission on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men adopted towards the end of the first decade of 2000s provides a significant basis for monitoring and evaluating rights with their gender dimension.

The recent report addresses the fields of urban rights defined as housing, safety, mobility, access to urban public services and urban democracy and their present state in Turkey firstly within the framework of central and local legislation. Accordingly, starting from the Constitution, regulations and circulars relating to the following pieces of legislation will be examined: The Law on Commission on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men, Law on Human Rights and Equality Institution of Turkey, Law on the Disabled, Law on the Right to Information, Public Finance and Fiscal Control Law, Zoning Law, Law on Municipalities, Metropolitan Municipality Law and Provincial Private Administration Law. Then, the present state in Turkey will be discussed in the context of public organizations and agencies related to the field of urban rights and services together with their policy documents. To assess the compliance of policy documents with human rights instruments, policy documents such as strategic plans, activity reports and action plans will be examined starting from top level central plans and going down regional and local level documents. The present state in Turkey will be finally addressed in the context of the capacity of civil society organisations and other public actors.

A. Mapping of legislation: Assessing the Compliance of Legislation with Relevant Human Rights Documents (Structural Monitoring)

This part examines legislation in effect in Turkey on the basis of norms compiled from international documents including equality-gender equality, respect for human dignity, non-discrimination and sustainability, and fields of urban rights as housing, safety, mobility, access to urban public services and urban democracy.

Starting from the Constitution, legislation, related regulations and circulars seem to be in conformity with norms such as equality, gender equality, non-discrimination, respect for human dignity and sustainability coming to the fore in international documents. Legislation is also evaluated with respect to housing, safety, mobility, access to urban public services and urban democracy as fields of urban rights and services.

Examining legislation in effect in Turkey with reference to widely accepted standards existing in international human rights and the right to the city documents, we find that legislation pertaining to the field of **housing** meets an important part of international standards including: identification of the needs of most disadvantaged groups; provision of low-cost housing opportunities; priority to the needs of women who are household heads; conveniences in mechanisms of loan and incentives in mass housing; shelters; and supply of safe water and sanitation services. However, there is still need to bring further the gender equality dimension of legislative arrangements related to housing. For instance, the term “households headed by women” can be used instead of “widowed spouse” presently used in setting priorities in the field of housing. By identifying different housing needs of women household heads more pertinent and inclusive arrangements can be introduced.

The major international standards in **safety** include street lightening, safety and lightening of transit points in transportation, identification of distinct perceptions of urban safety in women and men and measures to prevent violence against women. Looking at legislative arrangements in Turkey in this framework we can say that the General Regulations on Lightening, Circular on KENTGES Action Plan and Women’s Guest Houses are important. However, the Circular on KENTGES Action Plan focusing on the issue of safety and security omitted the differing dimensions of women’s and men’s perceptions about safety and security. A similar gap also exists in the General Regulations on Lightening.

Arrangements related to urban transportation are provided for by the Law on Municipalities and Metropolitan Municipality Law. While the Ministry of Interior Circular on Urban Roads focuses on the availability of safe urban roads, the Circular on Accessibility deals with ensuring accessibility to roads and giving priority to places where there are persons with disabilities in urban road constructions. In the field of **mobility**, given that relevant international standards focus on producing gender-disaggregated data relating to urban mobility, ensuring physical safety in urban transportation and identification of mobility needs and habits of using means of urban transportation by different individuals, it is observed that legislation in Turkey omits the gender dimension of the issue while focusing on the mobility needs of persons with disability in particular.

In terms of compliance with international standards related to **access to urban public services**, the provision of services responding to the needs of the disabled, elderly, women, youth, children and low-income citizens and associated standards are included in the Law on Municipalities, Metropolitan Municipality Law and Provincial Private Administration Law. Behavioural standards that relevant personnel are expected to observe are given in the Regulation on Monitoring and Supervising Accessibility. It is possible to say that circulars under the Protection of Women and Female Children are engaged in gender evaluation of existing policies. Besides legislation related to local governments, the Public Finance and Fiscal Control Law No. 5018 introduces some arrangements making decentralized planning policies possible. There is yet no arrangement for the collection of gender-disaggregated data on levels of access to urban public services.

Examining the legislation in in the context of **urban democracy** we can find many arrangements that can be used to meet relevant international standards in such areas as mechanisms facilitating participation, participatory planning processes, e-participation, and taking women

and their organizations as partners in city planning. In addition to local government laws, circulars under the Law on the Right to Information, Public Finance and Fiscal Control Law, City Council Regulations, Local e-Democracy Programme Circular and the Law on the Protection of Women and Female Children come to the fore as arrangements and mechanisms fit for participatory planning processes and addressing the gender dimension of participation. To conclude, it can be said that while the legislation in its present state provides an important basis for rights-based requests there is still need to strengthen its gender dimension.

B. Mapping of Relevant Policies: Assessing the Compliance of Policy Documents with Relevant Human Rights Documents (Structural Monitoring)

Policies relating to the field of urban rights and services and policy documents at national, regional and local levels are first examined in detail with respect to their compliance with norms and standards contained in international documents, and then the capacity of public organizations producing these documents and other public bodies in the field of urban rights and services to produce and maintain gender equality policies are given in Table 3 below.

Table 3. Public Organizations and Agencies Relevant to Urban Rights and Services

Public Organizations and Agencies/Title of Policy Document	Date	Gender Equality/ Equality of women and men		None
		Yes	No	
LEGISLATIVE				
TBMM-Commission on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men				
Mission		✓		
Vision		✓		
Strategic Plan				✓
Action Plan				✓
Gender Sensitive Budgeting Commission Report	2014	✓		
EXECUTIVE				
MINISTRIES				
Ministry of Family and Social Policies				
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan	2013-2017	✓ ⁶¹⁺		
Ministry of Family and Social Policies- General Directorate on the Status of Women				
Gender Equality National Action Plan 2008-2013	2008-2013	✓		
National Action Plan on Combating Violence against Women 2016-2020	2016-2020	✓		
Ministry of Development				
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan	2014-2018		✓	
2015-2018 Information Society Strategy and Action Plan	2015-2018	✓ ⁶²		
Tenth Development Plan 2014-2018	2014-2018	✓		
Local Governments Special Expertise Commission Report 2023	2014	✓		
Tenth Development Plan Gender Equality Working Group Report	2013	✓		
Ministry of Interior				
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan	2015-2019		✓	
Action Plan				✓
Ministry of Environmental and Urban Affairs				
Mission			✓	

61 "Equality of women and men", yes, "gender equality" none.

62 "Equality of women and men", yes, "gender equality" none.

Public Organizations and Agencies/Title of Policy Document	Date	Gender Equality/ Equality of women and men		None
		Yes	No	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan	2018-2022		✓	
KENTGES Integrated Urban Development Strategy and Action Plan 2010-2023	2010-2023		✓	
Ministry of Transportation, Maritime Affairs and Communication				
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan	2017-2021		✓	
Road Traffic Safety Strategy and Action Plan	2012		✓	
AFFILIATED AGENCIES				
Presidency of Mass Housing Administration				
Mission				✓
Vision				✓
Strategic Plan				✓
Toki Institutional	2016		✓	
RELATED ORGANIZATIONS				
General Directorate of Provinces Bank Inc.				
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan	2015-2019		✓	
ORGANIZATIONS UNDER STATE SUPERVISION AND INSPECTION				
DEVELOPMENT AGENCIES				
İstanbul Development Agency				
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan	2016-2020		✓	
2014-2023 İstanbul Regional Plan	2014-2023	✓		
LOCAL ADMINISTRATIONS				
UNIONS OF LOCAL ADMINISTRATIONS				
Union of Municipalities of Turkey				
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan	2015-2019	✓		
METROPOLITAN MUNICIPALITIES				
İstanbul Metropolitan Municipality				

Public Organizations and Agencies/Title of Policy Document	Date	Gender Equality/ Equality of women and men		None
		Yes	No	
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan	2015-2019	✓ ⁶³		
İzmir Metropolitan Municipality				
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan	2015-2019	✓		
Activity Report	2016	✓		
PROVINCE MUNICIPALITIES				
Kars Municipality				
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan	2015-2019	✓		
Local Equality Action Plan 2013-2015	2013-2015	✓		
PROVINCIAL PRIVATE ADMINISTRATIONS				
Kars Provincial Private Administration				
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan	2015-2019	✓		

The most important conclusion that can be drawn from this part on the mapping of policies and organizations related to the field of urban rights and services is that with the exception of policy documents focusing directly on gender equality, the dimension of gender equality is either totally absent or not internalized in the text as a whole despite some mentions in other policy documents. This situation can be seen clearly in Table 3. For example, the Ministry of Development which prepared the Tenth Development Plan (2014-2018) as a higher scale policy document that contains gender equality norm also developed the Strategic Plan covering the period 2014-2018 and this plan contains neither gender equality nor equality/inequality of women and men. Another striking example can be given in reference to the Ministry of Interior: The Ministry which implemented the Women Friendly Cities Programme together with the United Nations makes no reference to gender equality or equality/inequality of women and men in its 2015-2019 Strategic Plan. In general, we can say that strategic plans of Ministries we have examined have no gender dimension.

Another conclusion we can draw from Table 3 is the presence of gender equality dimension, which we cannot find at central level, in strategic plans of local level governmental organizations

63 "Equality of women and men", yes, "gender equality" none.

and agencies. Although it is difficult to speak about the existence of an equalitarian perspective internalized in plans or policy documents it is important that the concept of gender equality is adopted.

Municipalities come to mind first when the issue is public organizations that develop or implement projects at various scales in order to improve the exercise and use of urban rights and services. However, there are too many projects of this kind that prevents evaluating each one by one. Important examples in this regard include Women Friendly City Projects that have been completed in selected cities under the administrative coordination of the United Nations and the Ministry of Interior addressing the issue of gender equality in the context of empowerment of women.⁶⁴ We are going to evaluate these projects below in the context of the activities of the Sabancı Foundation that financially supported them. Women Friendly City Projects aimed to enhance the institutional capacity of municipalities in such fields as gender mainstreaming, developing and implementing Local Equality Action Plans, establishing equality units or commission and gender budgeting. It must be noted that no information in this regard exists in web pages of the Ministry and the Directorate concerned.

The TUSELOG project aimed to improve governance and participation at local level through working groups and trainings. The sub-project titled "Turkish-Swedish Gender Equality Network" was implemented by Ordu, Giresun and Osmangazi Municipalities in cooperation with Kalmar Municipality in Sweden. The project focused on gender equality in enhancing the awareness and capacity of municipal personnel and local politicians related to equal service delivery to women and men.⁶⁵ Importance was attached to the development of Gender Equality Working Group and to enhance the gender equality capacity of selected municipalities through this group.

Under the United Nations Joint Programme for Promoting the Human Rights of Women (UNJP), the United Nations Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment Unit (*UN Women*), implemented a project in cooperation with the Ministry of Interior and the Union of Municipalities of Turkey in 11 pilot provinces to enhance the capacity of municipalities in Gender Responsive Budgeting (GSB) and to encourage civil society in this regard. The overall objective of the UNJP is to ensure swift implementation of commitments, support sustainable capacity building and to contribute to gender equality in different spheres of life by ensuring the promotion, protection and exercising of women's rights. The UN Women undertook the task of enhancing the capacity of local governments in 11 pilot provinces selected in the context of the GSB

64 See, <http://www.kadindostukentler.com/proje.php>, Accessed: 16.02.2018

65 See, <http://projects.sklinternational.se/tuselogs/tr/hakkimizda/>, Accessed: 16.02.2018 <http://projects.sklinternational.se/tuselogs/tr/belediye-ortakliklari/> Accessed: 16.02.2018

component. Capacity building activities covered city councils, local women’s CSOs including women’s assemblies and academics active at Women Studies Centres in universities. Under the project, the UN Women supported capacity building in GSB in all municipalities of pilot provinces through trainings and workshops and ensured, in some selected municipalities, the incorporation of GSB principles into municipal budgets. This work contributed to the capacity of pilot municipalities to analyse, improve and monitor local development plans by using gender sensitive budgeting skills, information and instruments (Klatzer et al., 2015: 7).

Table 4. Projects Implemented by Public Organizations⁶⁶

Project name	Year	Project objective	GE	
			Yes	No
Ministry of Interior General Directorate of Local Administrations United Nations Joint Programme on Protecting and Promoting the Rights of Women and Girls Women-Friendly Cities Project Women-Friendly Cities Project II	2006-2010 2011-2014	Mainstreaming of gender equality in local governments and selected cities, development of Local Equality Action Plans, and pilot work on Gender Sensitive Budgeting	✓	
Union of Municipalities of Turkey Turkish-Swedish Partnership for Local Governance (TUSELOG)	2011-2015	Supporting the development of local governance in Turkey	✓	
Gender Sensitive Budgeting (GSB) Project implemented by the UN Office for Women-Turkey in cooperation with Ministry of Interior, Union of Municipalities of Turkey with the support of Sabancı Foundation under the United Nations Joint Programme on Human Rights of Women” (UNJP)	2013-2014	Enhancing GSB capacities of municipalities	✓	

C. Mapping Capacities of Civil Society Organizations and Other Public Actors (Structural Monitoring)

The contribution of civil society through participation and monitoring to the realization of human rights in the field of urban rights and services is important. In this part of the mapping report that we expect to contribute to CSO efforts in developing strategy for their advocacy activities, the objective is to identify the capacity of civil society in Turkey. In this context, firstly there are CSO cases given below related to urban rights, and then women’s organizations, LGBTI organizations and right-based organizations coming to the fore with their activities in the field are analysed with respect to both their activities in this specific thematic field and their sensitivity to gender issues and multiple-discrimination.

1. CSO cases in relation to urban rights

The major fields of activity of rights-based organizations in Turkey include human rights, environment, gender, youth, disability, child rights, culture/cultural rights, rights of HIV-infected individuals, animal rights, rights of the elderly people, refugee rights and the right to the city (Gökmen, 2011). However, when we evaluate the city level activities of CSOs with respect

⁶⁶ Projects implemented since 2008 which is available in their Websites

to gender the emerging group is quite limited. In the following part, we address leading organizations and institutions that we could identify while preparing the monitoring report and in which there is cross-cutting of the field of urban rights and services and dimensions of gender quality.

The Chamber of City Planners of the Union of Chambers of Architects and Engineers of Turkey is a professional organization coming to mind first when the issue is the arrangement and utilization of urban spaces.⁶⁷ The Women's Commission is not addressed here since at present its activities are limited to organizing symposiums.

We can also mention two organizations that have recently become visible with their activities in the field of the right to the city. The activities of the Urban Social Movement (İMECE), concentrate on the utilization of city centres, the rights to housing, employment, health, education, etc., and ensuring equal access to public services for all. The Solidarity Workshop has conducted such works as surveys and mapping in neighbourhoods where urban transformation projects were being implemented (Uzunçarşılı Baysal, 2011: 376). However, these two are not institutionalized yet and there are some problems in updating of their websites. There is some brief account of the Sokak Bizim Association that is active on the right to the city.

Meanwhile, associations and other organizations engaged in gender equality issues cannot be said to be concentrating on city-level monitoring work. Nevertheless, reports by women's organizations provide significant hints concerning regions or cities that are under observation. A similar function of information and awareness building is also performed by LGBTI organizations and rights-based organizations. Monitoring activities of women's, LGBTI and rights-based organizations are briefly evaluated and summarized below in Tables 5, 6 and 7.

67 See, <http://www.spo.org.tr>, Accessed:16.02.2018

Table 5. Women's Organizations

CSO	Rights-based Monitoring		Monitoring Report	Year	Content	Inclusion of multiple-discrimination and LGBTI	
	Yes	No				Yes	No
Association for Supporting Women Candidates (KA- DER)	✓		Overview of Political Party Documents from the Perspective of Gender Equality (KA- DER Ankara Committee, May 2011, Ankara)	2011	Approach of political parties to gender issues		✓
			Report on local policies for gender equality	2006	Evaluation of local policies with respect to gender		✓
Mor Çatı Women's Shelter Foundation	✓		Impressions of State of Emergency Practices related to Combating Violence against Women	2018	Evaluation of practices of public institutions in combating violence		✓✓
			Mor Çatı 2017 6 Monthly Activity Report	2017	Violence faced by women		✓
			Monitoring Report on Mechanisms for Combating Masculine Violence in Turkey	2016	Monitoring and evaluation of policies and activities of public institutions with authority and responsibility in combating violence against women		✓
Association on New Solutions to Women's Human Rights (KİH-YÇ)	✓		CEDAW Combined Shadow Report on Turkey Covering 4th and 5th Periods	2005	CEDAW's general monitoring and assessment related to gender equality in Turkey	✓	
			CEDAW Shadow Report on Turkey	2010			
			Shadow Report submitted to 2016 High Policy Forum on Sustainable Development Goals	2016	Evaluation of gender equality indicators and data in Turkey in the context of Sustainable Development Goals		
KAMER Foundation	✓		Refugee Women- Report on Five Provinces		Women's human rights, violence against women		✓
			Report on Appeals for Violence	2015-2016			✓
			Report on "Honour Killings"	2006, 2011			

CSO	Rights-based Monitoring		Monitoring Report	Year	Content	Inclusion of multiple-discrimination and LGBTI	
	Yes	No				Yes	No
Women's Labour and Employment Initiative Platform (KEİG)	✓		Gender Equality Perspective in Strategic Plans of Municipalities	2015	Evaluating to what extent requests for rights raised before local elections found echo in strategic plans prepared by 24 municipalities after elections	✓✓	
			Daily Life Problems of Women Living in Mamak and Suggestions for Solution	2015	Problems that women living in Mamak Tuzluçayır face in the context of local services		✓
			Experience in intervening to the process in which municipalities prepare their strategic plans	2015	Women's requests for city rights and services conveyed to 94 municipalities prior to local elections	✓	

Table 6. LGBTI Organizations⁶⁸

CSO	Rights-based Monitoring		Monitoring Report	Year	Content	Inclusion of multiple-discrimination and women	
	Yes	No				Yes	No
Association for Social Policy, Gender Identity and Sexual Orientation Studies (SPoD)	✓		2012 Monitoring Report on Sexual Orientation and Sexual Identity Related Human Rights Violations	2012	Rights and freedoms from the axis of identity and social policy	✓	
			Precedent case analyses related to the violation of the rights of the LGBTI	2013			
			SPOD Municipal Equality Index ⁶⁸	2017	Profile of Municipality; Municipal activities and practices; communication with LGBTI community; presence of LGBTI in participatory local government; LGBTI awareness in services delivered by Municipality; ensuring public visibility of LGBTI rights before municipalities.	✓	
Kaos-GL Association	✓		State of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans and Intersex Individuals Employed by Private Sector in Turkey	Various 2017	Problems confronted in daily urban life related to sexual orientation	✓	
			State of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans and Intersex Individuals Employed by Private Sector in Turkey	2017		✓	

⁶⁸ The project on SPOD Municipal Equality Index Development was carried out with the support of Open Society Foundation, Heinrich Böll Foundation and US Consulate and finalized through workshops and trainings with the participation of LGBTI individuals and field experts from different cities of Turkey. The final version of the Index is expected to be shared with the public within 2018.

Table 7. Rights-Based Organizations

CSO name	Rights-based Monitoring		Monitoring Report	Year	Content	GE Sensitivity	
	Yes	No				Yes	No
Economic Policy Research Foundation of Turkey (TEPAV)	✓		Gender Equality Report Card for 81 provinces	2014, 2016	Measuring equality of women and men in Turkey at province level and assessing the status of provinces in terms of equality for women	✓	
Sokak Bizim Association	✓		Current policy appraisals on the basis of the right to urban public space	2009	Use of urban public spaces		✓
Human Rights Association	✓		2016 Annual Report on Human Rights Violations in Turkey	2016	Human rights	✓	
			2013 Report on Violence against Women	2013	Human rights	✓	
Amnesty International	✓		Turkey: Women in Combat against Domestic Violence	2004		✓	
			Turkey: Stop sexual Violence against Women in Detention	2003		✓	
			LGBTI Rights, 'Neither illness nor Crime'	2004	Victimization and violation of the right to urban housing as a result of sexual orientation	✓	
Association of Industrialists and Businessmen of Turkey (TÜSİAD)	✓		Gender Inequality in Turkey: Problems, Priorities and Suggestions for Solution	2008	Data, indicators and situation assessment for Turkey	✓	
			March Towards Equality of Women and Men: Education, Employment and Politics	2000	Data, indicators and situation assessment for Turkey	✓	

CSO name	Rights-based Monitoring		Monitoring Report	Year	Content	GE Sensitivity	
	Yes	No				Yes	No
Sabancı Foundation	✓		United Nations Joint Programme on Protection and Promotion of Human Rights of Women and Girls (UNJP) Woman-Friendly Cities	2010	Empowerment of Women in Pilot Provinces	✓	
			United Nations Joint Programme on Protection and Promotion of Human Rights of Women and Girls (UNJP) Implementation Guide on local Planning and Service Delivery Model for Woman-Friendly Settlements	2009	Empowerment of Women in Pilot Provinces	✓	

2. Management structure of CSOs

There is no information with open access about management structures of many civil society organizations that we examined in the context of monitoring activities. Available information is presented in Table 8. It will not be correct to evaluate the management structures of SPoD and Kaos GL associations with respect to woman-men distinction.

Table 8. Management Structure of CSOs

2017 data	President/Chair			Managing Board			
	Woman		Man	Woman		Man	
	(i)	nn	n	n	%	n	%
Association for Supporting Women Candidates (KA.DER)	1			8	100	0	0
Mor Çatı Women's Shelter Foundation							
Association on New Solutions to Women's Human Rights (KİH-YÇ)							
KAMER Foundation							
Women's Labour and Employment Initiative Platform (KEİG)	collective			collective	100	0	0
Association for Social Policy, Gender Identity and Sexual Orientation Studies (SPoD)							
Kaos GL Association							

2017 data	President/Chair		Managing Board				
	Woman		Man	Woman		Man	
	(i)	nn	n	n	%	n	%
Economic Policy Research Foundation of Turkey (TEPAV)			1			7	100
Sokak Bizim Association							
Human Rights Association							
Amnesty International	1						
Association of Industrialists and Businessmen of Turkey (TÜSİAD)			1	3	23.1	10	76.9
Sabancı Foundation	1			4	57.1	3	42.9

IV. Indicator and Data Sources

A. Mapping of Sources of Indicators

Indicators related to urban rights and services are classified on the basis of international documents and indexes and suggested sources of data are specified. These are as follows: In the field of **housing**, UN-HABITAT Gender Issue Guide, Housing and Slum Upgrading Indicators; in the field of **safety**, UN-HABITAT Urban Governance Index and UN-HABITAT City Planning and Design-Gender Indicators; in the field of **mobility**, Urban Mobility Index, Safe Cities Index and Asian Development Bank-Transportation Gender Indicator; in the field of **access to urban public services**, UN-HABITAT Urban Governance Index, and in the field of **urban democracy**, UN-HABITAT City Planning and Design-Gender Indicators and UN-HABITAT Urban Governance Index. Further, for compiling these internationally supported indicators in Turkey, data sources that can be used include TÜİK; strategic plans of central and local government bodies, their relevant units and websites; works of CSOs and public actors, participatory observations and surveys.

B. Mapping of Relevant Data

The most important instrument in ensuring the applicability and measurability of indicators to be collected in the field of urban rights and services are sources of data. Although urban services remain in the domain of local governments in Turkey, we can reach data related to urban life and users of urban services in the statistics of TÜİK and other central government units. As can be seen in Table 9 below, sources or urban rights and services can be accessed largely through information collected by relevant units of local governments.

Table 9. Data Sources

Data Source	Subject of data	Access	Missing data if any
Sources Providing Data at National Level			
TÜİK	Life in provinces index	http://tuik.gov.tr	
YÖK	Higher education	www.yok.gov.tr/web/guest/2016-2017-yuksekogretim-istatistikleri	
TÜİK	Education statistics	http://tuik.gov.tr	
Union of Municipalities of Turkey	Municipal statistics	www.tbb.gov.tr	
General Directorate of Local Administrations	Municipal statistics	www.migm.gov.tr	
Field specific sources			
Municipalities	Service delivery and beneficiary data	Information Processing Directorates of Municipalities	May not be kept on gender basis

Data Source	Subject of data	Access	Missing data if any
Municipalities	Data relating to lightening of streets, squares, underpasses and stops	Public Works and Engineering Directorates of Municipalities	
Municipalities	Data relating to lightening of parks	Parks and Gardens Directorates of Municipalities	
Municipalities	Slum data	Public Works and engineering Units of Municipalities	
Municipalities	Data relating to users of mass transportation	Transportation units of municipalities	
Municipalities	Participation, urban democracy	Information and data from municipal secretary relating to municipal council and commission meetings held as open to people's participation	
Municipalities	City planning and infrastructure projects	Municipal Plan-Project Unit	

However, the limitation here is that municipalities' level of detailed data collection differs and they are without a system or mechanism collecting information about services offered, their beneficiaries and feedback. In such situations the way of collecting data on urban rights and services could be possible only by directly requesting data from units of the municipality that are in charge of activities in the field of rights and services concerned. Another difficulty that may be faced in this context is in case data are not disaggregated by age, gender and neighbourhood. The availability of disaggregated data relating to users of a specific urban service is important in terms of monitoring equality in that field, and if there is any special practice or measure, identifying what kind of a concept of equality it depends on and which concepts of equality it excludes.

V. Gender Equality Mapping in Turkey: Urban Rights and Services

Including Constitution in the first place, legislative arrangements at central and local government levels given effect particularly in the 2000s in Turkey are in compliance with such norms as equality, gender equality, respect for human dignity and sustainability. Examining local legislation with respect to housing, safety, mobility, access to urban public services and urban democracy which we identify as the area of urban rights and services, it is possible to say that weight is given to urban democracy while there are gaps in gender dimension in all rights concerned. Besides, the needs of the most disadvantaged group come to the fore among standards related to urban rights and the diversity we find in sets of standards mentioned above cannot be observed.

Meanwhile, the Tenth Five-Year Development Plan and relevant local government and gender reports provide very important bases for local governments to build capacity with gender equality perspective in the field of urban rights and services. Headings of the Gender Report including decision making mechanisms and observations concerning the status of women vis á vis employment, health, violence against women and education throw light upon efforts to develop standards and indicators in urban rights and services.

Regional plans that are prepared under the coordination of Development Agencies also give direction to strategies geared to ensuring these rights with their evaluations on urban rights and services. However, the prevailing tendency is to include women in disadvantaged groups and gender perspective in not immanent in regard to rights.

As to city level, gender equality perspective does not exist as broader framework in five-year Strategic Plans and annual Performance Programmes prepared by municipalities. Nevertheless, it is possible to say that both main policies and associated activities related to women's empowerment appear more and more in these documents. It is not always easy to associate activities with areas of urban rights, but they can still be taken as starting points in monitoring. Information on outcomes of activities (for example making 100 women literate) will throw light upon analyses to be made in relation to existing needs (for example 2,500 illiterate women).

An important output of Women Friendly City projects launched under United Nations Joint Programmes is Local Equality Action Plans. In cities where these plans have been phased in, it is a common practice to define urban rights and services from the perspective of gender equality and they constitute important policy documents in terms of both indicator and monitoring.

Civil society organizations active in issues related to gender equality are also active in the field of monitoring and reporting current policy practices. These activities also cover groups of different sexual orientation not mentioned at all in legislation. Although civil society organizations specialized in urban rights and services and whose activities in this field are continuous are rare, it is still possible to make use of accumulated experience of rights-based organizations existing in provinces where monitoring is to be made. It is clear that there is no civil society organization that is active in areas where urban rights and services intersect gender.

Of course, activities in monitoring gender equality are based on the convergence of indicators and data. It is difficult to say there is regular production of gender disaggregated data at city level in general and in the context of urban services in particular in Turkey (Şener & Demirdirek, 2014). Table 10 shows sources of indicators and data that connect the state of women in Turkey with fields of urban rights and services that are presently gathered. It must be noted that these data reflect subjective assessments instead of objective indicators. As can be seen, it is highly probable to find data from different sources belonging to different periods. Ensuring the gender-disaggregated production in Turkey of data relating to international indicators we mentioned above is of great importance in identifying the level of utilization of public services by different individuals. As can be seen in Table 10, however, data related to many of these rights are not collected as disaggregated by gender.

In addition to these, we can also mention indicators from Ministry of Development's Socioeconomic Development Index (SEGE). This work which mainly covers demographic and material living conditions in cities, there are only two indicators used on the basis of gender: women's literacy and average daily earning. In this context, Women-Friendly Cities Project has its indicators while the Project on Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey under the Association for Monitoring Gender Equality (CEID) has indicators and tabulated data related to İzmir and Kars which are among pilot cities in the project (Günlük-Şenesen et al., 2014). Gender-disaggregated data related to indicators of socioeconomic structure and, though limited, of urban democracy are available. However, there is no data relating to rights and services with the exception of housing. At city level, municipalities are expected to create their databases.

In addition to these, local governments in Turkey too are engaged in data collection initiatives. For example, the Beylikdüzü Municipality in İstanbul which is one of the pilot settlements of the CEID project has its indicators and data collection work including park supervision checklists to arrange parks so as to respond to the needs of different beneficiaries and satisfaction surveys. It will be very useful if such cases are extended to different areas of rights and services. Due to the largeness of scale, however, district level initiatives may be suggested for tracing different facilities in metropolitan cities like İstanbul.

Table 10. Turkey: Sample Indicators and Data Sources Relating to the Status of Women in Cities

Note: There is no gender-disaggregated data in indicators without the expression "WOMAN"		
Indicator	Data source	Field of urban right
Number of rooms per person, proportion of houses with their toilets inside (%), proportion of people facing problems in housing quality, (%)	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values 2015, TÜİK Http://www.tuik.gov.tr/pretablo.do?Alt_id=1106	Housing
Level of satisfaction with public security services (%)	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values 2015, TÜİK Http://www.tuik.gov.tr/pretablo.do?Alt_id=1106	Safety
Proportion of those feeling safe while walking alone at night	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values 2015, TÜİK Http://www.tuik.gov.tr/pretablo.do?Alt_id=1106	Safety
Level of satisfaction with municipal mass transportation services	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values 2015, tüik http://www.tuik.gov.tr/pretablo.do?alt_id=1106	Access to urban public services Mobility
Level of satisfaction with municipality's sanitation and waste collection services	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values 2015, tüik http://www.tuik.gov.tr/pretablo.do?alt_id=1106	Access to urban public services
Proportion of population given waste collection services (%)	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values 2015, tüik http://www.tuik.gov.tr/pretablo.do?alt_id=1106	Access to urban public services
Proportion of people disturbed by noise coming from without (%)	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values 2015, tüik http://www.tuik.gov.tr/pretablo.do?alt_id=1106	Access to urban public services
Access to sewage and water supply networks (%)	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values 2015, tüik Http://www.tuik.gov.tr/pretablo.do?alt_id=1106	Access to urban public services
Rate of illiteracy in women (%)	TÜİK	Urban democracy
Women's rate of secondary education enrolment (%)	TÜİK	Urban democracy
Women's rate of employment (%)	SGK annual statistics	Urban democracy
Proportion of women in municipal councils (%)	Urban municipalities	Urban democracy
Proportion of women in municipal employment (%)	Urban municipal strategic plan and performance programmes	Urban democracy

VI. Indicators

This part of the report contains both those indicators accepted at international level and original indicators developed by authors under the present mapping work that are suggested for use in gender equality monitoring in Turkey in the context of urban rights and services. Before presenting these indicators, however, taking a look at indicators that are already used as backed up by relevant data in the field of urban rights and services will be useful in terms of emphasizing the meaning of the new set of indicators suggested and giving an idea about the present state of affairs in this field. Table 11 below gives indicators whose data are presently collected.

Table 11. Indicators for which Data is Collected and Used in Turkey ⁶⁹

Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Data Source	Data Collection Method	Data Collection Frequency
IC1	Indicators related to institutional capacity	Gender Equality	Proportion of women among personnel working in the Union of Turkish Municipalities,%	TBB	TBB website, Strategic plan and performance programmes	Annual
IC2	Indicators related to institutional capacity	Gender Equality	Proportion of women in Provincial Councils, %	TÜİK, Election and Judicial Statistics	TÜİK website	Local Elections Period
IC3	Indicators related to institutional capacity	Gender Equality	Proportion of women in municipal councils (metropolitan or district), %	City Municipalities	Municipal website	Annual
IC4	Indicators related to institutional capacity	Gender Equality	Proportion of women personnel employed by municipalities, %	Municipality Strategic Plan and Performance Programmes	Municipal website	Annual
H1	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Number of rooms per person	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values, TÜİK	TÜİK website	TÜİK, Survey Period
H2	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Toilet presence percentage in dwellings, (%)	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values, TÜİK	TÜİK website	TÜİK, Survey Period
H3	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of households by toilet use facilities, outside the house, %	TÜİK Population and Housing Survey database ⁶⁹	TÜİK website	TÜİK Survey Period

⁶⁹ TÜİK Population and Housing Survey statistics were derived under population censuses conducted in 2011 and not repeated since then. To be considered in the next survey our new indicator suggestions that revise indicators used in this database so as to incorporate the dimension of gender equality can be found in the continuation of the table below.

Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Data Source	Data Collection Method	Data Collection Frequency
H4	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of households by toilet use facilities, inside the house, %	TÜİK Population and Housing Survey database	TÜİK website	TÜİK Survey Period
H5	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of households by toilet use facilities, no toilet, %	TÜİK Population and Housing Survey database	TÜİK website	TÜİK Survey Period
H6	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Proportion of those having problems related to the quality of housing %	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values, TÜİK	TÜİK website	TÜİK, Survey Period
H7	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of households by bathroom facilities, Outside the house, %	TÜİK Population and Housing Survey database	TÜİK website	TÜİK Survey Period
H8	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of households by bathroom facilities, Inside the house, %	TÜİK Population and Housing Survey database	TÜİK website	TÜİK Survey Period
H9	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of households by bathroom facilities, No bathroom, %	TÜİK Population and Housing Survey database	TÜİK website	TÜİK Survey Period
H10	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of households by heating systems used, Stove, %	TÜİK Population and Housing Survey database	TÜİK website	TÜİK Survey Period
H11	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of households by heating systems used, Other, % (natural gas, central heating, etc.)	TÜİK Population and Housing Survey database	TÜİK website	TÜİK Survey Period
H12	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of households by water use facilities, Outside the house, %	TÜİK Population and Housing Survey database	TÜİK website	TÜİK Survey Period
H13	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of households by water use facilities, Within the house, %	TÜİK Population and Housing Survey database	TÜİK website	TÜİK Survey Period

Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Data Source	Data Collection Method	Data Collection Frequency
H14	Housing	Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of households by water use facilities, No facility, %	TÜİK Population and Housing Survey database	TÜİK website	TÜİK Survey Period
M1	Mobility	Respect for Human Dignity	Satisfaction rate with municipal public transport services, %	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values, TÜİK; Website and activity report of the municipality concerned	TÜİK website; Examining activity report of the municipality concerned, , website	TÜİK, Survey Period
M2	Mobility - Safety	Respect for Human Dignity	Percentage of people feeling safe when walking alone at night, %	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values, TÜİK	TÜİK website	TÜİK, Survey Period
S1	Safety	Respect for Human Dignity	Satisfaction rate with public safety, %	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values, TÜİK	TÜİK website	TÜİK, Survey Period
AUS1	Access to urban public services	Respect for Human Dignity and Sustainability	Satisfaction rate with sanitation and hygiene services delivered by Municipality, %	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values, TÜİK	TÜİK website	TÜİK, Survey Period
AUS2	Access to urban public services	Respect for Human Dignity and Sustainability	Proportion of population receiving waste disposal services, %	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values, TÜİK	TÜİK website	TÜİK, Survey Period
AUS3	Access to urban public services	Respect for Human Dignity and Sustainability	Those who have the problem of noise coming from streets, %	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values, TÜİK	TÜİK website	TÜİK, Survey Period
AUS4	Access to urban public services	Respect for Human Dignity and Sustainability	Rate of access to sewage and water supply networks, %	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values, TÜİK	TÜİK website	TÜİK, Survey Period

In addition to international indexes and documents mentioned in part four above and indicators that are presently collected at local level in Turkey that are presented in Table 11, it is also possible to develop some other indicators relating to the gender dimension of the rights covered. Measurable, comparable, balanced and reliable indicators are all essential for any rights-based monitoring. In this context, the participation of representatives from the government and civil society, researchers and academics active in the field to the process of identifying new indicators is found meaningful. Again, long the same line, a meeting of common understanding was organized on 25 December 2017 with the participation of staff

from central and local units, civil society organizations and academics from respective thematic areas under the CEID Project on the Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey. In this meeting participants and thematic area experts in each thematic area were divided into working groups and discussed meaningful indicators needed in rights-based gender equality monitoring. Also containing contributions from this discussion, indicators we suggest for the thematic area urban rights and services are given below in Table 12.⁷⁰

Table 12. Indicators Suggested for Use in Turkey⁷¹

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
IC5 ⁷²	Indicators related to institutional capacity	Gender Equality	Data related to gender distribution of personnel in the Ministry of Interior, General Directorate of Local Administrations, % **	General Directorate of Local Administrations	Requesting data from the relevant unit in General Directorate of Local Administrations	Annual
IC6	Indicators related to institutional capacity	Gender Equality	Ministry of Interior, General Directorate of Local Administrations, Proportion of women at top management level %**	General Directorate of Local Administrations	Requesting data from the relevant unit in General Directorate of Local Administrations	Annual
IC7	Indicators related to institutional capacity	Gender Equality	Proportion of women personnel working in municipalities, %**	TBB personnel statistics	Requesting information from the relevant unit in TBB	Annual
H15	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity, Sustainability	Proportion of single-parent households, % (Number of single-parent households / Total number of households)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK	Annual

70 Besides these meeting and international indexes, other sources used in developing indicator suggestions are as follows: United Nations portal (<https://unstats.un.org/unsd/gender/default.html>; <https://unhabitat.org/urban-themes/gender/>), Deike (2013), World Bank portal (<http://datatopics.worldbank.org/gender/indicators>), ELGE indexes, İstanbul Regional Plan (p.470-476), Tenth Development Plan Gender Equality Working group Report (pp.51-52), Günlük-Şenesen et al. (2017), Yücel and Yakar Önal (2017),

71 Of indicators presented in the table those marked (*) are indicators used internationally which we suggest their use in Turkey. Indicators marked (**) are those developed by the authors of this report (original indicators) for use in Turkey.

72 Code numbers here are given so as to follow indicators gathered in Table 11.

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
H16	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity, Sustainability	Proportion of households headed by women in single-parent households, % (Number of single-parent households with woman as household head / Total number of single-parent households)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK additional to its population and housing survey database	Annual
H17	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of single-parent households with women as household head by facility in toilet use, outside the house, % (Number of women headed single-parent households with toilet outside the house / Total number of single-parent households with woman as household head)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK additional to its population and housing survey database	TÜİK Survey Period
H18	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of single-parent households with women as household head by facility in toilet use, Within the house, % (Number of women headed single-parent households with toilet inside the house / Total number of single-parent households with woman as household head)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK additional to its population and housing survey database	TÜİK Survey Period

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
H19	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of single-parent households with women as household head by facility in toilet use, No toilet, % (Number of women headed single-parent households with no toilet / Total number of single-parent households with woman as household head)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK additional to its population and housing survey database	TÜİK Survey Period
H20	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of single-parent households with women as household head by facility in bathroom use, Bathroom outside the house, % (Number of women headed single-parent households with bathroom outside the house / Total number of single-parent households with woman as household head)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK additional to its population and housing survey database	

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
H21	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of single-parent households with women as household head by facility in bathroom use, Bathroom inside the house, % (Number of women headed single-parent households with bathroom inside the house / Total number of single-parent households with woman as household head)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK additional to its population and housing survey database	TÜİK Survey Period
H22	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of single-parent households with women as household head by facility in bathroom use, No bathroom, % (Number of women headed single-parent households without bathroom / Total number of single-parent households with woman as household head)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK additional to its population and housing survey database	TÜİK Survey Period

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
H23	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of single-parent households with women as household head by heating facility, Stove, % (Number of women headed single-parent households with stove as heating facility / Total number of single-parent households with woman as household head)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK additional to its population and housing survey database	TÜİK Survey Period
H24	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of single-parent households with women as household head by heating facility, Other (central heating, natural gas, etc.), % (Number of women headed single-parent households with central heating facility / Total number of single-parent households with woman as household head)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK additional to its population and housing survey database	TÜİK Survey Period

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
H25	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of single-parent households with women as household head by water use facilities, Outside the house, % (Number of women headed single-parent households with water facility out of house / Total number of single-parent households with woman as household head)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK additional to its population and housing survey database	TÜİK Survey Period
H26	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of single-parent households with women as household head by water use facilities, Inside the house, % (Number of women headed single-parent households with water facility inside the house / Total number of single-parent households with woman as household head)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK additional to its population and housing survey database	TÜİK Survey Period

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
H27	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution of single-parent households with women as household head by water use facilities, No water supply, % (Number of women headed single-parent households without water supply / Total number of single-parent households with woman as household head)**	TÜİK	Requesting information from TÜİK additional to its population and housing survey database	TÜİK Survey Period
H28	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Capacity of women's shelter, % (shelter capacity-person /Number of women in the age group 18+ **	ASPB, KSGM, Municipality, CSO	KSGM, Provincial Directorate of Family and Social Policies, CSOs, Municipalities, publications, interviews if necessary	Annual
H29	Housing	Gender Equality	Proportion of women with title deed, % **	Development and Urban Affairs Unit of Municipality and Land Registry and Cadastre Directorate	Requesting information from the Development and Urban Affairs Unit of Municipality and from Land Registry and Cadastre Directorate	Annual
H30	Housing	Gender Equality	Proportion of women holding title deed in slum areas officially recognized %* (UN-HABITAT HOUSING AND SLUM UPGRADING GENDER INDICATORS)	Development and Urban Affairs Unit of Municipality and Land Registry and Cadastre Directorate	Requesting information from the Development and Urban Affairs Unit of Municipality and from Land Registry and Cadastre Directorate	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
H31	Housing	Gender Equality	Proportion of women sharing title deed in officially recognized slum areas %* (UN-HABITAT HOUSING AND SLUM UPGRADING GENDER INDICATORS)	Development and Urban Affairs Unit of Municipality and Land Registry and Cadastre Directorate	Requesting information from the Development and Urban Affairs Unit of Municipality and from Land Registry and Cadastre Directorate	Annual
H32	Housing	Gender Equality	Proportion of women to be affected by urban transformation processes whose opinion is solicited, % (Number of women to be affected by urban transformation processes whose opinion is solicited / Total number of persons to be affected by urban transformation processes whose opinion is solicited)* (UN-HABITAT HOUSING AND SLUM UPGRADING GENDER INDICATORS)	Municipality, Plan and Project Directorate	Municipality, Planning and Project Directorate	Annual
H33	Housing	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Proportion of housing related petitions and requests coming from women beneficiaries, % (Number of housing related petitions and requests coming from women / Total number of housing related petitions and requests)**	Municipality	Requesting information from relevant unit in Municipality	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
M3	Mobility	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution by sex of satisfaction with municipal mass transportation services , %**	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values, TÜİK; Website and activity report of relevant municipality	Requesting gender disaggregated data from TÜİK	TÜİK, Survey Period
M4	Mobility-Safety	Respect for Human Dignity	Distribution by sex of feeling safe while walking alone at night, %* (The Economist, SAFE CITIES INDEX)	Life in Provinces Index, indicator values, TÜİK	Requesting gender disaggregated data from TÜİK	TÜİK, Survey Period
M5	Mobility	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity, Non-discrimination	Proportion of pushchair and wheelchair friendly sidewalks with respect to sidewalk width, % (Length of pushchair and wheelchair friendly sidewalks complying with sidewalk width standards, in meters / Total sidewalk length in the city, in meters)**	Municipality	Requesting information from Civil Works Directorate	Annual
M6	Mobility	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity, Non-discrimination	Proportion of ramped sidewalks in the city, % (Length of ramped sidewalks / Total sidewalk length in the city)**	Municipality	Requesting information from Civil Works Directorate	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
M7	Mobility	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity, Non-discrimination	Proportion of pedestrian-friendly sidewalks with respect to sidewalk width, % (Length of pedestrian-friendly sidewalks complying with sidewalk width standards, in meters / Total sidewalk length in the city)**	Municipality	Requesting information from Civil Works Directorate	Annual
M8	Mobility	Gender Equality, Respect for Human Dignity, Non-discrimination	Proportion of pedestrian-friendly sidewalks with respect to sidewalk height, % (Length of pedestrian-friendly sidewalks complying with sidewalk height standards / Total sidewalk length in the city)**	Municipality	Requesting information from Civil Works Directorate	Annual
M9	Mobility	Gender equality, Non-discrimination, Respect for human dignity	Proportion of women in total number of persons over age 65 with cut-rate transportation card % (Number of women over age 65 with cut-rate transportation card / Total number of persons over age 65 with cut-rate transportation card)**	Municipality	Requesting information from Transportation Unit	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
M10	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of stops in mass transportation in compliance with TSE standards on distance between stops ⁷³ , % (stops in mass transportation in compliance with TSE standards on distance between stops / Total number of stops)**	Municipality	Requesting information from Transportation Unit	Annual
M11	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of underpasses with sufficient lightening and camera equipment, % (Number of underpasses with sufficient lightening and camera equipment / Total number of underpasses)**	Municipality	Requesting information from Civil Works Unit	Annual
M12	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of women personnel working in municipal transportation unit % (Number of women personnel, working in municipal transportation unit / Total number personnel working in municipal transportation unit) ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK GENDER INDICATORS IN TRANSPORTATION)	Municipality	Requesting information from the transportation unit of the municipality	Annual

73 According to standards No. 11783 relating to urban roads and selection of sites for bus stops adopted by the Turkish Institute of Standards on 2 January 2014, places of bus stops must be selected at locations close to pedestrian arteries along bus routes and passenger access must be facilitated. To keep the traffic going, the distance between two bus stops must be 400-500 meters which can be 600-700 meters along primary roads. These distances may be reduced by 100 meters where there is passenger density.

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
M13	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of women working as tram driver in transportation, % (Number of woman tram drivers/ Total number of tram drivers) **	Municipality	Requesting information from the transportation unit of the municipality	Annual
M14	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of women drivers in transportation, % (Number of women drivers in transportation/ Total number of drivers in transportation)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the transportation unit of the municipality	Annual
M15	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of women drivers working in transportation services, % (Number of women drivers working in transportation services / Total number drivers working in transportation services) **	Municipality	Requesting information from the transportation unit of the municipality	Annual
M16	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of women ticket clerks working in transportation services, % (Number of women ticket clerks working in transportation services / Total number ticket clerks working in transportation services)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the transportation unit of the municipality	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
M17	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of women working as security officers in transportation services, % (Number of women working as security officers in transportation services / Total number of security officers in transportation services) * (ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK GENDER INDICATORS IN TRANSPORTATION)	Municipality	Requesting information from the transportation unit of the municipality	Annual
M18	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of personnel working in mass transportation who have been trained in issues related to sexual assault and harassment, % (Number of personnel working in mass transportation who have been trained in issues related to sexual assault and harassment / Number of personnel assigned to duties in mass transportation) * (ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK GENDER INDICATORS IN TRANSPORTATION)	Municipality	Requesting information from the transportation unit of the municipality	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
M19	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of personnel working in mass transportation who have been trained in gender equality, % (Number of personnel working in mass transportation who have been trained in gender equality / Number of personnel assigned to duties in mass transportation)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the transportation unit of the municipality	Annual
M20	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of personnel working in mass transportation who have been trained in equalitarian service delivery, % (Number of personnel working in mass transportation who have been trained in equalitarian service delivery/ Number of personnel assigned to duties in mass transportation)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the transportation unit of the municipality	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
M21	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of complaints about sexual assault and harassment in petitions and requests related mass transportation, % (complaints about sexual assault and harassment in petitions and requests related mass transportation/ Number of petitions and requests related mass transportation)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the transportation unit of the municipality	Annual
M22	Mobility	Gender equality	Proportion of transportation related petitions and requests coming from women users,% (Number of transportation related petitions and requests coming from women users / Total number of transportation related petitions and requests coming from users)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the transportation unit of the municipality	Annual
UD1	Urban Democracy	Gender equality	Proportion of women participating to open meetings of Municipal Council % (Number of women participating to open meetings of Municipal Council / Total number of participants)**	Municipality	Requesting information from Private Secretariat of Municipality	Quarterly

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
UD2	Urban Democracy	Gender equality	Proportion of women members in City Council General Assembly % (Number of women members in City Council General Assembly / Total number of members in City Council General Assembly)**	City Council	City Council website	Local Elections Period
UD3	Urban Democracy	Gender equality	Proportion of women neighbourhood heads, % (Number of women neighbourhood heads / Total number of neighbourhood heads)**	Municipality	Municipal Directorate of Neighbourhood Headmen, Municipal Private Secretariat	Local Elections Period
UD4	Urban Democracy	Gender equality	Proportion of women's CSOs participating to municipal strategic plan meetings as external stakeholders, % (Number of women's CSOs participating to municipal strategic plan meetings as external stakeholders / Total number of CSOs participating to municipal strategic plan meetings as external stakeholders)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of preparing strategic plans	Local Elections Period, Strategic plan revision period

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
UD5	Urban Democracy	Gender equality	Proportion of LGBTI CSOs participating to municipal strategic plan meetings as external stakeholders, % (Number of LGBTI CSOs participating to municipal strategic plan meetings as external stakeholders / Total number of CSOs participating to municipal strategic plan meetings as external stakeholders)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of preparing strategic plans	Local Elections Period, strategic plan revision period
UD6	Urban Democracy	Gender equality	At the end of external stakeholder meetings, proportion of suggestions by women's CSOs that are incorporated into strategic plan objectives and targets, % (Number of suggestions by women's CSOs that are incorporated into strategic plan / Total number of CSO suggestions incorporated into strategic plan at the end of external stakeholder meetings)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of preparing strategic plans	Local Elections Period, Strategic plan revision period

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
UD7	Urban Democracy	Gender equality,	At the end of external stakeholder meetings, proportion of suggestions by LGBTI CSOs that are incorporated into strategic plan objectives and targets, % (Number of suggestions by LGBTI CSOs that are incorporated into strategic plan / Total number of LGBTI CSO suggestions incorporated into strategic plan at the end of external stakeholder meetings)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of preparing strategic plans	Local Elections Period, Strategic plan revision period
UD8	Urban Democracy	Gender equality	Proportion of women in the team in charge of preparations for strategic plan % (Number of women in the team / Total number of team members)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of preparing strategic plans	Local Elections Period, Strategic plan revision period
UD9	Urban Democracy	Gender equality	Proportion of women in Municipal Council's Women-Men / Gender Equality Commission % (Number of women members in the commission / Total number of commission members)**	Municipality	Requesting information from Municipal Secretariat	Local Elections Period

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
UD10	Urban Democracy	Gender equality	Proportion of women in General Provincial Council's Women-Men / Gender Equality Commission % (Number of women members in the commission / Total number of commission members)**	Provincial Private Administration	Requesting information from Secretariat of Provincial Private Administration	Local Elections Period
UD11	Urban Democracy	Gender equality	Proportion of decisions originally proposed by Equality Commission in decisions taken by Municipal Council, % (Number of decisions originally proposed by Equality Commission / Total Number of Municipal Council Decisions)**	Municipality	Requesting information from Municipal Commission on Equality	Monthly
UD 12	Urban Democracy	Gender equality	Proportion of women students in education institutions teaching architecture, landscape architecture, city and regional planning, % (Number of women students studying in related departments / Total number of students in related departments) **	Universities	Requesting information from relevant faculties in universities and from student affairs	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
AUS5	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality, Respect for human dignity	Proportion of women benefiting from municipal dry food supply services, % (Number of women benefiting from municipal dry food supply services / Total number of people benefiting from municipal dry food supply services)* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of social assistance	Annual
AUS6	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality, Respect for human dignity	Proportion of women benefiting from municipal hot meal supply services, % (Number of women benefiting from municipal hot meal supply services / Total number of benefiting from municipal hot meal supply services)* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of social assistance	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
AUS7	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality, Respect for human dignity	Proportion of women benefiting from municipal clothing support services, % (Number of women benefiting from municipal clothing support services / Total number of people benefiting from municipal clothing support services)* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of social assistance	Annual
AUS8	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality, Respect for human dignity	Proportion of women benefiting from municipal heating fuel supply services, % (Number of women benefiting from municipal heating fuel supply services / Total number of people benefiting from municipal heating fuel supply services)* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of social assistance	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
AUS9	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality, Respect for human dignity	Proportion of women benefiting from municipal home-based care services, % (Number of women benefiting from municipal home-based care services / Total number of total people benefiting from municipal home-based care services)* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of social assistance	Annual
AUS10	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality, Respect for human dignity	Proportion of women benefiting from municipal patient transfer services, % (Number of women benefiting from municipal patient transfer services / Total number of people benefiting from municipal patient transfer services)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of health services	Annual
AUS11	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality, Respect for human dignity	Proportion of women benefiting from municipal health services, % (Number of women benefiting from municipal health services / Total number of people benefiting from municipal health services)* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of health services	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
AUS12	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality	Proportion of women benefiting from municipal vocational training courses, % (Number of women benefiting from municipal vocational training courses / Total number of people benefiting from municipal vocational training courses)* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of cultural affairs	Annual
AUS13	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality	Proportion of women benefiting from municipal hobby courses (for adults and children), % (Number of women benefiting from municipal hobby courses (for adults and children)/ Total number of people benefiting from municipal hobby courses)* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of cultural affairs	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
AUS14	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality	Proportion of women benefiting from municipal library services, % (Number of women benefiting from municipal library services / Total number of people benefiting from municipal library services)* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of cultural affairs	Annual
AUS15	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality	Proportion of women benefiting from municipality's cultural activities and services (cinema, theatre, museum, concert, panel discussion, etc.), % (Number of women benefiting from municipality's cultural activities and services (cinema, theatre, museum, concert, panel discussion, etc.) / Total number of people benefiting from municipality's cultural activities and services (cinema, theatre, museum, concert, panel discussion, etc.))* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of cultural affairs	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
AUS16	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality	Proportion of women benefitting from municipality's sports school services, % (Number of women benefitting from municipality's sports school services / Total number of people benefitting from municipality's sports school services)* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of sports services	Annual
AUS17	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality	Proportion of women benefitting from sports courses delivered by the municipality % (Number of women benefitting from sports courses delivered by the municipality / Total number of people benefitting from sports courses delivered by the municipality)* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of sports services	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
AUS18	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality	Proportion of women benefiting from municipality's summer sports school services, % (Number of women benefiting from municipality's summer sports school services / Total number of people benefiting from municipality's summer sports school services)* (UN-HABITAT URBAN GOVERNANCE INDEX)	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of sports services	Annual
AUS19	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality, Non-discrimination, Respect for human dignity	Proportion of toilets for persons with disabilities in public buildings, % (Total number of toilets for persons with disabilities in public buildings / Total number of toilets in public buildings)**	Municipality	Requesting information from municipal civil works and equality units	Annual
AUS20	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality, Non-discrimination, Respect for human dignity	Proportion of public buildings with infant care rooms, % (Number of public buildings with infant care rooms / Total number of public buildings)**	Municipality	Requesting information from municipal civil works and equality units	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
AUS21	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality, Non-discrimination, Respect for human dignity,	Proportion of women's toilets in public buildings, % (Total number of women's toilets in public buildings / Total number of toilets in public buildings)**	Municipality	Requesting information from municipal civil works and equality units	Annual
AUS22	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality, Non-discrimination, Respect for human dignity	Proportion of women's toilets with hangers in public buildings, % (Number of women's toilets with hangers in public buildings / Total number of women's toilets in public buildings)**	Municipality	Requesting information from municipal civil works and equality units	Annual
AUS23	Access to Urban Public Services	Gender equality	Proportion of girls benefiting from municipal study centres and libraries, % (Number of girls benefiting from municipal study centres and libraries / Total number of children benefiting from municipal study centres and libraries)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of cultural affairs	Annual
AUS24	Access to Urban Public Services	Respect for human dignity	Proportion of city parks with convenient sports equipment,% (Number of parks with sports equipment / Total number of parks)**	Municipality	Requesting information from municipal unit in charge of parks and gardens	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
AUS25	Access to Urban Public Services	Respect for human dignity	Proportion of city parks with convenient walking-tracks,% (Number of parks with walking-track / Total number of parks)**	Municipality	Requesting information from municipal unit in charge of parks and gardens	Annual
S2	Safety	Gender equality,	Proportion of safety-related complaints and requests coming from women users, % (Number of safety-related complaints and requests coming from women users / Total number of petitions related to safety issues)**	Municipality	Requesting information from municipal unit receiving requests and complaints	Annual
S3	Safety	Gender equality	Proportion of women reporting to have experienced safety problems in mass transportation, % (Number of women reporting to have experienced safety problems in mass transportation / Total number of users reporting to have experienced safety problems in mass transportation)**	Municipality	Requesting information from municipal unit receiving requests and complaints	Annual
S4	Safety	Gender equality, Non-discrimination	Proportion of parks with panic button, % (Number parks with panic button /Total number of parks)**	Municipality	Requesting information from municipal unit in charge of parks and gardens	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
S5	Safety	Gender equality, Non-discrimination	Proportion of bus stops with panic button, % (Number of bus stops with panic button / Total number of bus stops)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of mass transportation	Annual
S6	Safety	Gender equality, Non-discrimination	Proportion of subway-train stations with panic button, % (Number of subway-train stations with panic button / Total number of subway-train stations)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of mass transportation	Annual
S7	Safety	Gender equality, Non-discrimination	Proportion of parks with surveillance camera, % (Number of parks with surveillance camera / Total number of parks) **	Municipality	Requesting information from municipal unit in charge of parks and gardens	Annual
S8	Safety	Gender equality, Non-discrimination	Proportion of subway-train stations with surveillance camera, % (Number of subway-train stations with surveillance camera / Total number of subway-train stations)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of mass transportation	Annual
S9	Safety	Gender equality, Non-discrimination	Proportion of bus stops with surveillance camera, % (Number of bus stops with surveillance camera / Total number of bus stops)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of mass transportation	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
S10	Safety	Non-discrimination	Proportion of stations and stops where battery-operated cars for disabled persons can be charged , % (stations and stops where battery-operated cars for disabled persons can be charged / Total number of stops and stations)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the municipal unit in charge of mass transportation	Annual
S11	Safety	Gender equality, Non-discrimination	Proportion of women reporting to have experienced safety problems in city parks, % (Number of women reporting to have experienced safety problems in city parks / Total number of users reporting to have experienced safety problems in city parks)**	Municipality, Provincial/ District Security Directorate	Requesting information from municipal unit receiving requests and complaints, Requesting information from Provincial/ District Security Directorate	Annual
S12	Safety	Gender equality, Non-discrimination	Proportion of women reporting to have experienced safety problems in streets, main roads and spaces in the city, % (Number of women reporting to have experienced safety problems in streets, main roads and spaces in the city / Total number of users reporting to have experienced safety problems in streets, main roads and spaces in the city)**	Municipality, Provincial/ District Security Directorate	Requesting information from municipal unit receiving requests and complaints, Requesting information from Provincial/ District Security Directorate	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
S13	Safety	Gender equality, Non-discrimination	Proportion of women reporting to have experienced safety related problems in bus stops in the city , % (Number of women reporting to have experienced safety related problems in bus stops in the city / Total number of users reporting to have experienced safety related problems in bus stops in the city)**	Municipality, Provincial/ District Security Directorate	Requesting information from municipal unit receiving requests and complaints, Requesting information from Provincial/ District Security Directorate	Annual
S14	Safety	Gender equality, Non-discrimination	Proportion of women reporting to have experienced safety related problems in subway-train stations in the city, % (Number of women reporting to have experienced safety related problems in subway-train stations in the city / Total number of users reporting to have experienced safety related problems in subway-train stations in the city)**	Municipality, Provincial/ District Security Directorate	Requesting information from municipal unit receiving requests and complaints, Requesting information from Provincial/ District Security Directorate	Annual

Indicators whose data need to be collected in Turkey						
Code	Theme	Relevant Human Right(s) and Norms	Indicator	Suggested Data Source	Suggested Data Collection Method	Suggested Data Collection Frequency
S15	Safety	Gender equality, Respect for human dignity	Proportion municipal billboards used for the purpose of information building in preventing violence against women % (Number of municipal billboards used for the purpose of information building in preventing violence against women / Total number of municipal billboards)**	Municipality	Requesting information from the relevant unit of the municipality	Monthly

Besides suggested indicators for urban rights and services presented in Table 12 above, the following monitoring questions formulated by the authors of the present report may also be used in monitoring quality in urban rights and services.

Monitoring Questions

Questions related to urban democracy

1. Are there regulations or instructions to clearly set and institutionalize rules relating to the working of the Commission on Equality of Women and Men / Gender Equality?
2. Is there any unit monitoring policies, plans and budgets with respect to special needs and priorities of different individuals?
3. Does the monitoring unit have its instructions?
4. Does the monitoring unit prepare annual reports?
5. Does the municipality have its local equality action plan?
6. Is there any sanction applied to municipal personnel violating commitments made in local equality action plan?

Questions related to access to urban services

1. Are there specifically women related measures to eliminate existing inequalities in accessing municipal services?
2. Are there measures specific to women with disabilities to eliminate existing inequalities in accessing municipal services?
3. Are there measures specific to women with children to eliminate existing inequalities in accessing municipal services?
4. Are there measures specific to LGBTI individuals to eliminate existing inequalities in accessing municipal services?
5. Are there measures specific to migrant women to eliminate existing inequalities in accessing municipal services?
6. Are there measures specific to elderly women to eliminate existing inequalities in accessing municipal services?
7. Is there reduced charge in water supply services to poor neighbourhoods?
8. Do service buildings of the municipality have child day-care facilities for municipal personnel?
9. Are there child day-care or playing room services in municipal facilities for cultural activity, vocational training sports facilities of the municipality?
10. Does the municipality deliver child day-care services in neighbourhoods?
11. Is there a child playing rooms in municipal buildings for clients visiting the municipality for their daily affairs?

12. Is there a day-care service delivered by a specific centre or at home upon request for the elderly, ill and disabled persons that neighbourhood residents have to take care of?

Questions related to safety

1. In terms of safety, are spaces monitored and evaluated for necessary improvements and arrangements (i.e. eliminating blind spots, insufficient lightening, panic button, camera installation, etc.)?
2. In urban transformation processes, are possible safety gaps for people living around or passing by considered?

Questions related to mobility

1. In municipal bussing services, is there the practice of letting women get off at any point they want after dark?
2. Are there private shared-taxi and minibus services providing for short-distance transportation in the city?

This publication is produced with the financial support of European Union. Its contents are the sole responsibility of the Association for Monitoring Gender Equality and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union or the Directorate for EU Affairs - Department of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Republic of Turkey.