



This project is funded by the European Union

Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey:
Gender Equality Monitoring Project

Gender Equality in Access to Religious Services

Mapping and Monitoring Study
Full Summary

Editor

Prof. Dr. Serpil Sancar

Authors

Dr. Mine Yıldırım

Assoc. Prof. Özgür H. Çınar

Dr. Zehra Yılmaz

Dr. Hilal Arslan



CEİD PUBLICATIONS

Gender Equality in Access to Religious Services
Mapping and Monitoring Study
Full Summary

The present text is the informative summary of "Gender Equality in Access to Religious Services Mapping and Monitoring Study" prepared under the "Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Gender Equality Monitoring Project. Turkish version of this summary, main text and bibliography is available at: www.ceidizleme.org

ISBN: 978-605-69015-2-2

It can be reproduced and used by referring to the source.

CEİD ADDRESS:

Cinnah Caddesi, No: 75/7 Çankaya, 06690
Ankara, Turkey
Tel: + 312 440 04 84-85
www.ceid.org.tr
www.ceidizleme.org
December 2018

Ankara

Cover/Text Design: Elma Teknik Basım Matbaacılık Tic. Ltd. Şti.
İvedik OSB Matbaacılar Sitesi
1516/1 Sokak No:35
Yenimahalle/Ankara
Tel: 0 312 229 92 65

Translation: Metin Çulhaoğlu

This publication is produced with the financial support of European Union. Its contents are the sole responsibility of the Association for Monitoring Gender Equality and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union or the Directorate for EU Affairs - Department of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Republic of Turkey.

PROF DR SERPİL SANCAR Professor Sancar is a faculty member in Ankara University Faculty of Political Sciences, Department of Political Science and Public Administration. Following her doctoral dissertation in Political Science. Prof Sancar taught in Political Theory, Political Sociology, Global Political Dynamics, Religion-Politics Relationship, and Research Methodology in Social Sciences. Conducting her academic studies also in women's and gender research, Prof Sancar took active part in post-graduate programmes in women's studies in Ankara University by delivering courses in "Feminist Theory", "Gender and Politics", "Women's Rights Movements" "Gender of Turkish Modernization" and "Methodology in Women Researches". She is one of the founder of Ankara University Women's Studies Centre (KASAUM) and is presently the director of the centre. Professor Sancar was visiting researcher in Georgetown University in the US in the period 2011-2012, delivering courses in "Religion and Gender." Sancar is the founding chairperson of the Gender Equality Monitoring Association (CEİD) is active in the association since its establishment. Sancar' publications and researches focus on the intersection point of women studies and political science. Some recent books by Prof Sancar are as follows: *Religion, Politics and Women: Iranian Revolution*, 1990 Belge Publication (second edition: 2016, Nika Publication); *Gender of Turkish Modernization: Men Establish State and Women Establish Family*, 2012, İletişim Publication (second edition: 2014, İletişim Publication); *Feminist Studies in Turkey at the Beginning of 21st Century*, Edited, Parts I and II 2011, Koç University Publication; *Impossible Masculinity: Men in Families, Market and Streets*, 2009 Metis Publication, (third edition: 2016 Metis Publication); *Concept of Ideology: False Consciousness, Hegemony and Discourse*, 1997, İmge Publication (third edition: 2016, İmge Publication, Ankara).

ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR ÖZGÜR H. ÇINAR Assoc. Prof. Çınar works at the BPP University in the United Kingdom. He received his doctoral degree in 2012 from University of Essex, School of Law. He conducted his post-doctoral research fellowship at the University of Oxford (St Antony's College, Law Department and Kellogg College) from November 2012 to September 2016. Since 2008 he also works as a legal expert for the Council of Europe. Besides his articles published in various journals and his reports, books by Assoc. Prof Çınar include *Conscientious Objection to Military Service and Turkey's Obligations under International Human Rights Law (Palgrave Macmillan, 2014)*, *Uluslararası İnsan Hakları Hukukunda Vicdani Red ve Türkiye (Conscientious Objection in International Human Rights Law and Turkey, Bilgi University Publication, 2014)*, *Conscientious Objection to Military Service in International Human Rights Law (Palgrave MacMillan, 2013)* and *Avrupa İnsan Hakları Mahkemesi Kararlarının Türk Hukukuna Etkisi (The Effects of the European Court of Human Rights Decisions' on the Turkish Legal System, İHD, 2005)*. He is also the co-editor of several books as follows: *Freedom of Religion and Belief in Turkey (Cambridge Scholars, 2014)*, *Conscientious Objection: Resisting Militarized Society (Zed Books, 2009)* and *Çarklardaki Kum: Vicdani Red (Sand in the Wheels: Conscientious Objection, İletişim Publication, 2008)*.

DR MİNE YILDIRIM Dr Yıldırım is the Director of Norwegian Helsinki Committee Freedom of Belief Initiative. She received her doctoral degree (*cum laude*) in 2015 from Abo Academy University in Finland. Her doctoral dissertation “The Collective Dimension of Freedom of Religion: A Case Study on Turkey” was published in English by Routledge in 2017. She participated as advisor and researcher in many projects in the field of freedom of religion or belief in international law conducted by various organizations Oslo Coalition of Freedom of Religion or Belief, Educational Reform Initiative, Centre for Studies in Politics and Democracy and organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe. She is also the co-editor of the book *Freedom of Religion or Belief in Turkey* (Cambridge Scholar, 2014). Mine Yıldırım has her articles published in academic journals at national and international levels, popular daily papers and websites addressing various aspects of freedom of religion and belief which include the following: “The Return of Property to Community Foundations in Turkey - The Restitution Decree” (European Yearbook of Minority Issues, 2013), “The Right to Establish Places of Worship in Turkey” (Religion & Human Rights, 2013), “Religion in the Public and Private Workplace: The Approach of the Turkey Judiciary” (Ashgate, 2012) “Conscientious Objection to Military Service in International Law and the Case of Turkey”, Religion & Human Rights, Brill Publications, 2010), Visions of Political Parties on Freedom of Belief (Agos, 2018), Is it a Right to Have Religious Wedlock with Official Validity? (Bianet, 2017).

DR ZEHRA YILMAZ Dr Yılmaz is an instructor in International Relations Department of Van Yüzüncü Yıl University. She received her PhD in 2013 From the Department of International Relations of Ankara University Faculty of Political Sciences. She conducted her doctoral study in Georgetown University for a year in 2010. Besides her articles on Muslim women’s movement and Islamic feminism published in various journals and edited books, her book *Feminine Piety: Transformation of Islamic Women Movement in Turkey* was published by İletişim in 2015.

DR HİLAL ARSLAN Dr Arslan is an instructor in Social Research Methodologies in Hacettepe University Institute of Population Studies. Graduating from the Middle east Technical University (METU) with BA in sociology and with diploma in statistics as sub-branch, Arslan had her MA in METU social Sciences Institute while working there as research assistant. Her doctoral thesis in sociology Department of Jacobs University Bremen, BIGSSS was on inequality in happiness in post-socialist countries. Her studies concentrate on welfare, well-being, social indicators, social inequalities and gender statistics. Besides her academic studies, Dr Arslan also took part in various research projects supported by national and international organizations including “Violence against Women in Turkey” (T.C. Ministry of Family and Social Policies and Hacettepe University Institute of Population Studies, 2014); and UNDP’s Life Quality in Eurasia: Azerbaijan and Kyrgyzstan, METU KORA and TÜBİTAK, 2007).

PREFACE

The present report is the outcome of a series of thematic mapping work and efforts to develop gender equality (GE) monitoring indicators under the *Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Gender Equality Monitoring Project*. The project took shape in the period 2013-2017 in a process involving meetings and exchange of opinion with many institutions and persons. The common point emerging in this process was the necessity of developing independent mechanisms for monitoring and evaluation at the stage that gender equality (GE) policies reached in Turkey. In other words, what was needed was an independent monitoring mechanism to assess the appropriateness and effectiveness of national legislation and action plans developed so far in translating GE into life. This also entailed the development of tools satisfying relevant scientific and technical requirements and facilitating systematic monitoring free from political and ideological polemics. To ensure compliance with international norms and sustainability, it was also necessary to develop monitoring indicators and assess these indicators through mapping and periodic reporting, which became the roadmap of the project. It was also among the objectives of the project to take initial steps to ensure the institutionalization needed for the sustainability of these efforts.

While delineating its field of work the *Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Gender Equality Monitoring Project* adopted a “gender sensitive rights-based” approach. The basic objectives of the project include the following: Supporting the inclusion of international norms and standards developed for GE in legislation, practices and monitoring policies in Turkey; reporting of GE related problem areas through mapping; contributing to institutionalization in Turkey of an independent, scientific and mainstreamed strategy by developing GE specific monitoring indicators; and enhancing government-civil society cooperation and monitoring capacity in the field of GE.

Starting in March 2017, the project was planned so as to be completed in 24 months. In the project funded by the European Union, the beneficiary is the Ministry of Foreign Affairs Directorate for EU Affairs, contracting authority is the Central Finance and Contracts Unit(CFCU) and the implementing party is the Association for Monitoring Gender Equality (CEİD). The target group of the project comprises gender-focused civil society organizations, other right-based civil organizations engaged in rights-based monitoring, relevant governmental agencies, governorates and metropolitan municipalities, and district municipalities that have gender equality units. Project stakeholders include the Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services- General Directorate on the Status of Women (AÇŞHB-KSGM), Turkish Grand National Assembly- Commission on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men (TBMM-KEFEK), Human Rights and Equality Institution of Turkey (TİHEK), and Ombudsman Institution (KDK).

Mapping reports and **monitoring indicators** were developed in ten thematic areas identified in line with the objective of the project (combating gender-based violence against women; gender equality in participation to political decision making, to

education, employment, religious activities, sports, access to urban rights/services, media and combat against trafficking in women/human beings). Besides, to make project outputs as well as many sources and data in relevant fields accessible to all, a **Gender Equality Monitoring Centre (CEİM)**¹ was set up and made functional with its e-library. Mapping Reports on ten thematic areas and their summaries were made available in the electronic environment, printed in Turkish and their informative summaries were released in Turkish and English. On the basis of Mapping Reports, 1337 GE monitoring indicators were presented to the public for use, 515 of which have their presently available or accessible data and 822 proposed to be developed.

One important component of the project was intensive work carried out in selected pilot provinces for local-level sharing of data from reports and indicators developed. Training in gender-sensitive rights-based monitoring and in mapping reports and monitoring indicators accompanied by preparatory workshops on local equality monitoring action plans were the activities carried out in selected seven pilot provinces. Efforts were made to establish and maintain **Local Equality Monitoring Platforms**. In Adana, Ankara, İstanbul, İzmir, Kars, Gaziantep and Trabzon as pilot provinces, **Local Equality Monitoring Plans** were developed to assess and monitor whether services delivered at local level observe gender equality and a **National Equality Monitoring Plan** was prepared to scale up this work countrywide and ensure its sustenance.

The longer-term durability of services developed by the project is possible with the presence of sustained support. We believe that this support will be available as project outputs are used and further improved by large sections of society.

There are so many organizations and individuals contributing to the project without which it would be simply an impossible endeavour. We are grateful to the project team working with full commitment and engagement throughout the process, experts completing mapping reports and indicators in a long and tiresome work, and to CEİD members supporting the management of the project in harmony from its start to completion. CEİD local coordinators and training experts facilitated the implementation of the project by their hard work at both central and local levels. Staff from public organizations and representatives from civil society organizations who prepared Local Equality Monitoring Plans by taking part in work conducted by Local Monitoring Platforms put this work in practice at the local level. In case this project is to be attributed any success, it is the outcome of efforts and contributions of many including those we could not mention here. We are indebted to all for what they have added to the *Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Gender Equality Monitoring Project*.

Association for Monitoring Gender Equality

Board of Directors

¹ <http://www.ceidizleme.org/>

Contents

Biography	3
Preface.....	5
List of Tables	9
List of Acronyms.....	10
I. Introduction	13
II. International Norms and Standards	15
A. Norms	15
1. Equality, Non-discrimination and Gender Equality Norm	15
2. Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion Norm	16
3. International Documents on Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion.....	16
B. Standards	17
1. Standards Related to Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion and Gender Equality	17
2. Implementation Areas of Standards Envisaged for Ensuring Jointly the Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion and Gender Equality	19
2.1. Preventing the Presentation of Sexist Stereotypes and Cultural Practices as Requirements of Religion	19
2.2. Women’s Equal Positioning in the Management of Religious Institutions and Processes	20
2.3. Preventing Violations of Women’s Rights within the Framework of Family Law	21
2.4. Religious Education of Children.....	21
2.5. State Authority to Regulate and Restrict.....	22
III. Present State in Turkey	23
A. Legislative Framework in Turkey Related to Freedom of Conscience, Religious Faith and Opinion and Gender Equality	23
1. Freedom of Conscience, Religious Faith and Opinion and Gender Equality in the Constitution.....	23
2. Freedom of Conscience, Religious Faith and Gender Equality in the Turkish Penal Code.....	23
3. Freedom of Conscience, Religious Faith and Gender Equality under the Law on Political Parties	24
4. The Law of Directorate of Religious Affairs (DİB) and Gender Equality	24
4.1. DİB-Family and Religious Guidance Offices	25

4.2. New Arrangements on Marriage Law: Authorizing Muftiate to Conduct Official Marriage Procedures	25
4.3. Religious Foundation of Turkey (TDV), KAGEM and Gender Equality	26
5. Law on the Human Rights and Equality Institution of Turkey (TIHEK) and Gender Equality	26
6. Ministry of National Education- General Directorate of Religious Teaching and Gender Equality (MEB-DÖGM)	26
7. Higher Education Board (YÖK), Higher Religious Education and Gender Equality	27
B. Religious Services as a Public Service in Turkey and Gender Equality	27
1. Harmonization of Religious Services with Gender Equality Policies.....	28
2. Public Servants Delivering Religious Services and Gender Equality.....	28
3. Religious Education and Gender Equality	29
3.1. Non-formal Religious Education: Quran Reading Courses	30
3.2. Formal Religious Education: Religious Schools	30
3.3. Higher Religious Education and Faculties of Theology.....	32
4. Counseling Women and Family Issues as a Task of Religious Guidance	34
5. Religious Comments of DİB on Family Law	34
6. Management of Places of Prayer - Women's Equal Access to Mosque Services..	35
7. Management of Religious Rituals - Organization of Hajj and Umrah	35
C. Capacity of Civil Society Organizations in Monitoring Gender Equality	36
1. Capacity of Civil Organizations Engaged in Gender-Based Monitoring	36
2. Gender Equality Monitoring Capacity of Local CSOs Engaged in Rights-Based Monitoring.....	36
3. Civil Organizations Based on Different Faiths and Gender Equality	36
D. Areas Intersecting between Freedom of Religion and Belief and Gender Equality in Turkey	37
1. Freedom to Use Religious Symbols.....	37
2. Civil Women Actions for Access to Mosque Prayers	37
IV. Data Sources	38
V. Indicators	39
Annex Tables	46

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Increase in DİB’s Women Preacher Employment in the Period 1991-2018.....	29
Table 2: Number of Secondary Schools of Religious Education and Students under MEB-DÖGM.....	31
Table 3: Number of High Schools of Religious Education and Students under MEB-DÖGM.....	31
Table 4: Number of Open High Schools of Religious Education and Students under MEB-DÖGM.....	31
Table 5: Rate of Increase in Students Assigned to Secondary and High Schools under MEB-DÖGM.....	32
Table 6: T.C. Increase in Teaching Staff in Open Religious High Schools under MEB-DÖGM.....	32
Table 7: Higher Religious Education: Academic Staff in Schools of Theology, 2017-2018	33
Table 8: Higher Religious Education: Increase in Academic Staff of Schools of Theology: 2013-2018	33
Table 9: Distribution of Students of Theology by Type of Education, Years and Gender	34
Table 10: National Sources of Data	38
Table 11: Sources Providing Comparative Data at International Level.....	38
Table 12: Gender Equality in Religious Services: Indicators that are accessible or with recorded data.....	39
Table 13: Indicators for which Data Collection and Use is Suggested	44
ANNEX Table: Department of Religious Affairs, Current Data as of July 2018	46

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AÇŞHB	Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services (Aile, Çalışma ve Sosyal Hizmetler Bakanlığı)
ADRB	Family and Religious Guidance Offices (Aile ve Dini Rehberlik Büroları)
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CEİD	Gender Equality Monitoring Association (Cinsiyet Eşitliği İzleme Derneği)
CEPA	Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly
CEİM	Gender Equality Monitoring Centre (Cinsiyet Eşitliği İzleme Merkezi)
CECM	Council of Europe Committee of Ministers
CoEGES	Council of Europe Gender Equality Strategy
CSO	Civil Society Organizations
DİB	Department of Religious Affairs (Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı)
DKAB	Religion and Moral Course (Din ve Ahlak Bilgisi Dersi)
DİYK	Supreme Council of Religious Affairs (Din İşleri Yüksek Kurulu)
DPB	Directorate of State Personnel
EU	European Union
EU-GEI	European Gender Equality Index-EU-GEI
EU-AmsT	Treaty of Amsterdam
ECGELL	European Charter for Gender Equality in Local Life
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
EU-CFR	European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights
EC	Council of Europe
ESC	European Social Charter
EC - EDUR	European Urban Charter and Declaration of Urban Rights
ECoHR	European Court of Human Rights
EP	European Parliament
Eurostat	European Statistics
EIGE	European Institute for Gender Equality
ESHİD	Equal Rights Monitoring Association (Eşit Haklar İçin İzleme Derneği)
GDI	Gender Development Index
GII	Gender Inequality Index
HDI	Human Development Index

HSYK	Supreme Board of Judges and Prosecutors (Hakimler ve Savcılar Yüksek Kurulu)
İHL	Religious High School (İmam Hatip Liseleri)
KDK	Ombudsman Institution (Kamu Denetçiliği Kurumu)
MEB-DÖGM	Ministry of National Education - General Directorate of Religious Education (Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı, Din Eğitimi Genel Müdürlüğü)
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MEB	Ministry of National Education (Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı)
OSCE	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe
SIGI	Social Institutions and Gender Index
TCEUEP	Gender Equality National Action Plan (Toplumsal Cinsiyet Eşitliği Ulusal Eylem Planı) 2008-2013
TDV	Religious Foundation of Turkey (Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı)
TDV-KAGEM	Turkey Foundation of Religion- Women, Family and Youth Centre (Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı-Kadın ve Gençlik Merkezi)
TBMM	Turkish Grand National Assembly (Türkiye Büyük Millet Meclisi)
TÜİK	Turkish National Statistics Institute (Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu)
UN	United Nations
UN-BPFA	United Nations Beijing Platform for Action
UN-BD	Beijing Declaration
UN-SDG	United Nations Sustainable Development Goals
UN- CoCPR	Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
UN-CRC	United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child
UN -MDG	Millennium Development Goals
UN-SDG	Sustainable Development Goals
UN- CRPD	United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
UN- CESCPR	United Nations Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
UN-UDHR	United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN-ICCPR	United Nations International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
UN-CHR	United Nations Committee on Human Rights
UN-CPRW	United Nations Convention on the Political Rights of Women
YÖK	Higher Education Board (Yüksek Öğretim Kurumu)

Information on the Names of Institutions

Since this report was completed before the decrees mentioned below it does not reflect changes made in the names of some major institutions. The Decree No. 703 in Force of Law on 'Amendment of Some Laws and Decrees to Ensure Compliance with Constitutional Amendments' was published in the Official Gazette No. 30473 dated 9 July 2018. The decree introduced changes to the organization and mandate of some Ministries and institutions.

With the Presidential Decree No. 1 dated 10 July 2018 on the Organization of the Office of Presidency and the Presidential Decree No. 4 dated 15 July 2018 on the Organization of Agencies and Institutions Under, Related and Attached to Ministries and other Agencies and Institutions, organizational structure and mandate of some ministries and institutions were modified.

The ministries and institutions subject to modifications are listed below.

- The Ministry of Family and Social Policies (*Aile ve Sosyal Politikalar Bakanlığı*) and Ministry of Labour and Social Security (*Çalışma ve Sosyal Güvenlik Bakanlığı*) were merged and renamed as 'Ministry of Labour, Social Services and Family.' (*Çalışma, Sosyal Hizmetler ve Aile Bakanlığı*)

Upon the Presidential Decree (Decree No. 15) dated 4 August 2018 on Amendments to Some Presidential Decrees, the Ministry of Labour, Social Services and Family (*Çalışma, Sosyal Hizmetler ve Aile Bakanlığı*) was renamed as Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services (*Aile, Çalışma ve Sosyal Hizmetler Bakanlığı*).

- The Ministry of European Union (*Avrupa Birliği Bakanlığı*) was closed and the Department of European Union (*Avrupa Birliği Başkanlığı*) was established within the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.
- The Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology (*Bilim, Sanayi ve Teknoloji Bakanlığı*) and Ministry of Development (*Kalkınma Bakanlığı*) were merged and named as Ministry of Industry and Technology (*Sanayi ve Teknoloji Bakanlığı*).
- The Ministry of Customs and Trade (*Gümrük ve Ticaret Bakanlığı*) and Ministry of Economy (*Ekonomi Bakanlığı*) were merged and renamed as Ministry of Trade (*Ticaret Bakanlığı*).
- The Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Animal Husbandry (*Gıda, Tarım ve Hayvancılık Bakanlığı*) and Ministry of Forestry and Hydraulic Works (*Orman ve Su İşleri Bakanlığı*) were merged and renamed as Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (*Tarım ve Orman Bakanlığı*).
- The Ministry of Finance (*Maliye Bakanlığı*) was renamed as Ministry of Treasury and Finance (*Hazine ve Maliye Bakanlığı*), and the Undersecretary of Treasury (*Hazine Müsteşarlığı*) which used to be under Deputy Prime Minister was transferred in the new structuring to the Ministry of Treasury and Finance.
- The Ministry of Transportation, Maritime Affairs and Communication (*Ulaştırma Denizcilik ve Haberleşme Bakanlığı*) was renamed as Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure (*Ulaştırma ve Altyapı Bakanlığı*).

I. Introduction

The present report is related to joint consideration of two fundamental rights which historically constitute the most belated ones in the field of fundamental human rights safeguarded by international conventions and also the most problematic ones in their translation into life: Freedom of religion and belief and gender equality. In the historical background of these two fundamental human rights we find the development of laicism and the concept of equal citizenship in the world.

Freedom of thought, conscience and religion is a fundamental human right. Besides being under the obligation of States to protect freedom of religion or belief, this right also constitutes a normative reference to be observed by policies of religion in various areas. The obligations of the state not to make any distinction with respect to different religions and faiths and to fulfil gender equality in private sphere constitute the basis of international norms in the implementation of the right to equal access to religious services.

It is an important duty to modern states of our time to ensure the fulfilment of the freedom of religion and belief which is universally recognized by international human rights law. The fundamental and indispensable norm in fulfilling this public duty is the neutrality of the state. Meanwhile, the fulfilment of gender equality as the latest but one of the most important norms of international human rights law is, as in other norms, a duty assigned to modern, democratic and secular states.

As the present report will try to show, the neutrality of the state is essential for the fulfilment of individuals' freedom of religion and belief. Yet, there are cases where religious beliefs, traditions or culture may violate women's human rights directly or indirectly. Consequently, the state is obliged both not to interfere with individuals' way of living according to their faith and protect this freedom and to prevent and prohibit instances where this freedom violates women's human rights. To be more specific, the state is obliged, for example, to take measures against such violations as polygamy, child marriage, female genital mutilation, religious marriages denying equal civil right to women and equality in inheritance. The fundamental norm of international human rights law is that there can be no legitimization of any practice violating women's human rights directly or indirectly and such practices must be prevented by states.

Besides addressing international norms and standards relating to these two fundamental rights, the present report seeks to identify the position of Turkey in the process of translating international norms to domestic norms. The report will try to expose legal and institutional framework regulating the intersection of the two fundamental human rights areas and the present state of policies and practices geared to implementation. In Turkey, public institutions provide services to enable Moslem citizens to participate to religious worshipping, religious education and rituals without leaving these to civil society organizations. Hence, the report focuses on points of intersection of religious services delivered by the state and gender

equality only. In this context the report will also briefly address the capacity of leading civil society organizations in including and giving effect to gender equality.

II. International Norms and Standards

Relative to the historical background and present universal recognition of many other fundamental human rights we observe that norms that exist at the intersection of freedom of religion or belief and gender equality are not clearly defined and specified in detail. There are efforts to safeguard human rights in these two areas including conventions, declarations, decisions taken by internationally recognized and authorized committees, recommendations and some other legal instruments. The most important instruments include the following: UN Universal Declaration of Human Rights, EU Amsterdam Treaty; EU Fundamental Rights Charter; EC Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms and its Annex Protocol No.1; EC European Social Charter; UN Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW); UN Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.

Important international documents interpreting these conventions are as follows: Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) Document of the Copenhagen Meeting on the Human Dimension; Council of Europe Strengthened Commitment to Equality between Women and Men (Women's Charter); Europe 2020 Strategy; UN Beijing Declaration and Action Plan; UN Millennium Development Goals 2000-2015; UN Sustainable Development Goals 2015-2030; UN- Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief.

A. Norms

The following are international norms geared to ensuring freedom of religion or belief and gender equality:

1. Equality, Non-discrimination and Gender Equality Norm

The norm covers the following:

- Each has his/her value and dignity;
- Each has the right to equal access to law;
- Right to equal protection under the law;
- Respect to the rights of each and every individual;
- Right to participate on equal terms with all others to economic, social, political, cultural and civil life.

Relevant Convention articles:

- UN- Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Articles 2 and 7,
- UN Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Articles 2, 3, 24 and 26,

- UN Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Article 3,
- UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) Article 1,
- European Union Amsterdam Treaty, Articles 2 and 3,
- European Convention on Human Rights, Article 14 and Article 1 in Protocol No. 12,
- European Union Fundamental Rights Charter (EU-FRC), Articles 21, 22 and 23

Related policy documents:

Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) Document of the Copenhagen Meeting on the Human Dimension, Article 25,

2. Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion Norm

Relevant international conventions:

- UN-Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), Article 18,
- UN- Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (CoCPR), Article 8,
- EU-Fundamental Rights Charter(EU-CFR), Article 10,
- European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR),Article 9.

Interpreting relevant articles in the UDHR and CoCPR'in together it can be concluded that the freedom of thought, conscience and religion has to different dimensions. The first is the individual sphere of freedom which is *forum internum* and the other is *forum externum* which is related to the exercise of this freedom in public sphere.

<i>forum internum</i>	<i>forum externum</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Right to have a religion or belief;▪ Right to change religion or belief;▪ Right not to have any belief;▪ Right not to be forced to express religious belief;▪ Right not to be forced to religious worshipping,	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Right to express one's religion or belief;▪ Right to access to places of worship;▪ Right to learn or transfer religious beliefs through education and teaching;▪ Right to use religious symbols;▪ Right to elect one's religious leaders.

3. International Documents on Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion

- Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE)- Document of the Copenhagen Meeting on the Human Dimension (1990), Article 9(4)
- UN- Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief² (1981 Declaration)

² UN General Assembly (1981). *Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief*. http://www.uhdigm.adalet.gov.tr/sozlesmeler/coktarafliisoz/bm/bm_21.pdf (accessed: 01.08.2018)

Article 6 in the 1981 Declaration defines the content of the freedom of thought, conscience or religion as follows:

- *To worship or assemble in connection with a religion or belief, and to establish and maintain places for these purposes;*
- *To establish and maintain appropriate charitable or humanitarian institutions;*
- *To make, acquire and use to an adequate extent the necessary articles and materials related to the rites or customs of a religion or belief;*
- *To write, issue and disseminate relevant publications in these areas;*
- *To teach a religion or belief in places suitable for these purposes;*
- *To solicit and receive voluntary financial and other contributions from individuals and institutions;*
- *To train, appoint, elect or designate by succession appropriate leaders called for by the requirements and standards of any religion or belief;*
- *To observe days of rest and to celebrate holidays and ceremonies in accordance with the precepts of one's religion or belief;*
- *To establish and maintain communications with individuals and communities in matters of religion and belief at the national and international levels.*

The Declaration introduces no arrangement related to gender equality.

B. Standards

1. Standards Related to Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion and Gender Equality

In documents setting international standards, the "right to equal participation to decisions" related to gender equality covers equal participation to the planning, management and implementation of religious services. Relevant international documents are as follows:

UN -Millennium Development Goals (UN-MDG) 2000-2015 Criteria: The third in eight Strategic Goals: "Promoting Gender Equality and Empowering Women".

UN-Sustainable Development Goals (UN-SDG) 2015-2030 Criteria: The fifth in 17 Goals: "Achieving gender equality and empowering all women and girls."

UN- Beijing Action Plan (UN-BPFA):

- Strategic Goal G: Women in Power and Decision Making,
- Strategic Goal H: Institutional Mechanisms in the Advancement of Women.

UN Human Rights Council and Commission on Human Rights Resolutions

- Human Rights Council Resolution 6/37,
- Commission on Human Rights Resolution 2005/40,
- Human Rights Committee General Comment No. 22 on CoCPR Article 18,
- Human Rights Committee General Comment No. 28 on CoCPR Article 3.

Decisions by the European Court of Human Rights

The Court states that the freedom of thought, conscience and religion is, in line with the purpose of the convention, is one of the fundamentals of a 'democratic society'.

Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly Resolutions

- The Resolution No. 2076 (2015) describes the freedom of thought, conscience and religion as an established, universal and inviolable human right.
- The Recommendation No. 2080 (2015) draws attention to the importance of this freedom and set up a stable and officially recognised platform for dialogue with the senior representatives of religions and non-denominational organisations in order to combat religious fanaticism under the philosophy of 'living together.'³
- Resolution No. 1464 (2005) states that women's rights are violated in the name of religion.⁴

Decisions by the Council of Europe Committee of Ministers

- Recommendation (2002)5 on violence against women in the name of religion.⁵
- The Recommendation (2007)17 touches upon the importance of equality of sexes in ensuring democracy and social justice as a part of international human rights standards and states that no one should face any form of discrimination for his/her sex and religious belief. In the light of this principle, the Recommendation also points to the right of women to religious services on equal footing with men.⁶

Decisions by EU Mechanisms

- The decision of the European Parliament dated 8 September 2015 underlines the role of a laic and neutral state to prevent discrimination against religious, agnostic or atheist beliefs. The same decision states that inter-cultural dialogue and tolerance must be encouraged.⁷

3 Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly (2015). *Recommendation 2076*. <http://assembly.coe.int/nw/xml/XRef/Xref-XML-2HTML-en.asp?fileid=22199&lang=en> (accessed: 09.06.2018)

4 Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly (2005). *Recommendation 1464*. <http://assembly.coe.int/nw/xml/XRef/Xref-XML-2HTML-EN.asp?fileid=17372&lang=en>; Avrupa Konseyi (2011). *Combating Discrimination on Grounds of Sexual Orientation or Gender Identity*. <https://rm.coe.int/168047f2a6> (accessed: 09.06.2018)

5 *Recommendation (2002)5*, 30 April 2002, <https://www.coe.int/en/web/genderequality/recommendation-rec-2002-5-and-other-tools-of-the-council-of-europe-concerning-violence-against-women> (accessed: 09.06.2018)

6 Council of Europe (2015). *Gender Equality Glossary*. <https://rm.coe.int/16805a1cb6> (accessed: 09.06.2018)

7 European Parliament Resolution of 8 September 2015, (2014/2254(INI), <http://www.europarl.europa.eu/sides/getDoc.do?type=TA&reference=P8-TA-2015-0286&language=EN&ring=A8-2015-0230> (accessed: 09.06.2018)

The European Union issued in 2013 the document “EU Guidelines on the Promotion and Protection of Freedom of Religion or Belief.” According to this document, the duty of the state to prevent discrimination against religious, non-theist or atheist beliefs finds its meaning in the light of following principles: “1) This freedom has its universal values; 2) This freedom is an individual one that can be exercised with other individuals in the community; 3) It is one of the principal duties of the state to protect this freedom; 4) Together and in strong connection with other freedoms, this freedom furthers the principles of diversity, tolerance and democratic society.”⁸ In the light of these principles there is also stress on the obligations of states in relation to discrimination that women face for their religious beliefs.⁹

The Court of Justice of the European Union ruled on two cases in 2017 whether employers can ban the wearing of specific political, philosophical or religious symbols by their employees.¹⁰

2. Implementation Areas of Standards Envisaged for Ensuring Jointly the Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion and Gender Equality

According solutions proposed or advised by international norms, associated policy documents, decisions taken by relevant agencies and reports prepared by specialists in relation to the realization of the freedom of thought, conscience and religion together with gender equality, the following standards should be observed by stated and relevant public actors:

2.1. Preventing the Presentation of Sexist Stereotypes and Cultural Practices as Requirements of Religion

An important reference drawing attention to the need to prevent sexist prejudices can be found in Article 5 of the CEDAW. The article obliges states to adopt relevant measures to eliminate prejudices and sexist traditions in the following areas:

(a) To modify the social and cultural patterns of conduct of men and women, with a view to achieving the elimination of prejudices and customary and all other practices which are based on the idea of the inferiority or the superiority of either of the sexes or on stereotyped roles for men and women;

(b) To ensure that family education includes a proper understanding of maternity as a social function and the recognition of the common responsibility of men and women in the upbringing and development of their children, it is being understood that the interest of the children is the primordial consideration in all cases.

8 EU Guidelines on the Promotion and Protection of Freedom of Religion or Belief (2013). <https://eeas.europa.eu/sites/eeas/files/137585.pdf> (accessed: 09.06.2018)

9 EU Guidelines on the Promotion and Protection of Freedom of Religion or Belief, paragraph 36. <http://www.insanhaklari-hukuku.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/D%C3%BC%BC5%9F%C3%BCnce-Din-ve-Vicdan-%C3%96zg%C3%BCrl%C3%BC%C4%9F%C3%BC.pdf> (accessed: 09.06.2018)Din ve İnanç

10 Samira Achbita - Belgium, Court of Cassation Application No. C157/15, 14 March 2017, <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX%3A62015CA0157> and Asma Bougnaoui - France, Court of Cassation Application No. C188/15, 14 Mart 2017, <https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX%3A62015CN0188> (accessed: 09.06.2018)

In combating sexist stereotypes, there is also need to target sexist thinking and practices in the justice system, media and education besides sexist language, legislation and practices. It is also necessary to *mainstream gender equality* besides efforts to build awareness in equality of the girl child and women.

One of the most important steps to be taken in this regard is to stand against discriminatory and harmful practices against women in the name of culture or tradition sometimes defended in the context of freedom of religion and belief. Reports by the UN Special Rapporteur point out to the necessity of combating traditions including female genital mutilation, female infanticide, violence against widowed women and so called honour killings that violate the fundamental rights of women.¹¹

Suggested measures include the following:

- Developing legislation as required to prevent and penalize practices detrimental to women's life and health and of discriminatory nature,
- Abolition of laws violating women's rights and adoption of penal code measures to protect women,
- Strengthening capacity in monitoring mechanisms and in governmental and non-governmental organizations that have their important place in protecting and promoting women's rights,¹²
- Encouraging the lifting of derogations based on religious concerns if put to conventions related to women's human rights in general and to CEDAW in particular,
- Preventing religious leaders and/or laic actors from encouraging gender-based discrimination on the basis of religious teaching and traditional values,¹³
- Elimination of gaps in public worshipping places where women can pray,
- Preventing bans on wearing religious outfit.¹⁴

2.2. Women's Equal Positioning in the Management of Religious Institutions and Processes

The freedom of thought, conscience and religion entails the right of individuals and groups of individuals to establish religious institutions in line with their religious understanding and traditions. In reality, officials of many groups of religion or faith (imams, bishops, preachers, rabbis, etc.) are men. And management of religious schools and worshipping places are mostly undertaken by men as well. Given this reality, norm-setting documents for gender equality set

11 Report of the UN Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief, A/65/207, paragraph 14. These issues are also addressed in detail in letters sent to governments, thematic reports and country visits. See, /CN.4/2002/73/Add.2; A/64/159, paragraph 59-63; and A/HRC/10/8, paragraph 25-28

12 Report of the UN Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief, A/65/207, paragraph 15.

13 Report of the UN Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief on his mission to Albania, A/HRC/37/49/Add.1 , 16 January 2018, s. 16.

14 Report of the UN Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief on his mission to Uzbekistan, A/HRC/37/49/Add.2, 22 February 2018, p. 9 and 16.

the target of ensuring women's participation to decision-making in all areas.¹⁵ In spite of this, it is still mostly men in both Turkey and in other countries governing civil organizations from different religions and faiths and managing religious institutions and temples.

2.3. Preventing Violations of Women's Rights within the Framework of Family Law

Some religious communities in the world have the tendency of following their own religious rules regardless of equalitarian legislative arrangements existing in family law. Such religious practices have in fact no binding nature and they can survive upon the tolerance or permission of states. Practices violating women's human rights in the context vary. Even in a country with secular family law based on gender equality, religious groups (particularly those in different faith) choose to act in line with their faith in such issues as marriage, divorce, custody of children, child raising, fertility, etc. even if they are prohibited. Examples include woman's forced marriage with an unwanted person as decided by her family; exclusively religious wedlock which deprives her of many legal rights; having no say in matters like divorce and denial of custody of her children. Not prevented albeit no legal basis, such practices mean significant violation of the rights of women and girls.

2.4. Religious Education of Children

Under article 18 (4) of the UN Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and articles 5 and 14 (2) of the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, families or legal guardians have the responsibility of guiding children in line with their developmental needs. While rightfully pointing out to access to the right of education, these provisions also embody the right of families to have their children educated according to their faith and beliefs families, and therefore defines striking a delicate balance between the two as the responsibility of States Parties.¹⁶ The following are necessary under these provisions:

- ▶ Parental rights to ask for their children's education in line with their faith and religion; in other words interpreting child's right to freedom of belief in the context of child's "evolving capacities" and "best interest";
- ▶ Ensuring girls' equal access to religious services;
- ▶ Protecting girls' individual rights also in access to worshipping places or religious education;
- ▶ Avoiding any prevention of the right to access education of girls and women in particular with references to religion and faith,¹⁷ and therefore ensuring equal access by girls and boys to both secular and religious education as required by international norms;

15 Strategic goals in the Beijing Plan of Action include "G.1: Measures to ensure women's equal Access and full participation to positions of authority and decision-making processes; G.2: Enhancing women's capacity to participate to decision-making and leadership positions."

16 Committee on the Rights of the Child (2003). *General Comment No. 4, CRC/GC/2003/4*. <http://www.refworld.org/docid/4538834f0.html>, paragraph 28. (accessed: 01.08.2018)

17 Kate Hodal, "Revealed: the 10 worst countries for girls to get an education", *The Guardian*, 11 October 2017. <https://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2017/oct/11/revealed-the-10-worst-countries-for-girls-to-get-an-education-international-day-girl>. (accessed: 01.08.2018)

- ▶ Avoiding and preventing any content with gender stereotypes in programs and curricula in religious education and teaching.

2.5. State Authority to Regulate and Restrict

In fulfilment of the freedom of thought, conscience and religion, the authority of the state to limit the exercise of freedoms on justified grounds¹⁸ is an important point of debate in the context of international norms. This authority of states to introduce limitation is expressed in article 18 (3) of the UN Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and Article 9 (2) of the European Convention on Human Rights.

Taking these two paragraphs together, States have to observe the following principles while using their authority to bring restrictions:

- ▶ Restrictions must be specified by law; in other words it must be based on pressing social needs as public security and order.
- ▶ Bans must be proportional as required by any democratic society.

Limitations and bans introduced by states on the use of religious symbols are firstly related to women's veiling in public domain as required by their faith. If this practice is banned, women's right to education and work will be blocked. It may involve double discrimination against women both for their religious belief and gender. States are expected to comply with the principle of "proportionality" while using their authority to bring limitations. The European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) has its substantive rulings on this issue involving United Kingdom, France, Greece and Turkey.

¹⁸ EU Guidelines, paragraph 36.

III. Present State in Turkey

Turkey is a country that internalized international human rights norms and gave them a concrete character in her legal system. The fulfilment of the freedom of religion and belief and gender equality is a responsibility assigned by the Constitution to the state by some other legislation to some special institutions and agencies.

In our legislation including the Constitution in the first place, it is established as a public duty norm for the state to protect the freedom of religion and conscience of citizens, ensure that individuals can exercise their right to worship freely and to guarantee access to such practices. This public duty is shared as a responsibility by different governmental institutions.

A. Legislative Framework in Turkey Related to Freedom of Conscience, Religious Faith and Opinion and Gender Equality

1. Freedom of Conscience, Religious Faith and Opinion and Gender Equality in the Constitution

The secular nature of the State as expressed in Article 2 as one of the fundamental tenets of the republic cannot be amended nor its amendment can be proposed under Article 4.

Articles 24 and 25 in the Constitution provides for “freedom of conscience, religious belief and opinion.” Legal norms included in these Constitutional articles can be summarized as follows:

- ▶ Freedom of religion and belief is, in general, a fundamental part of freedom of conscience and thought.
- ▶ Religious and moral education and instruction is a “public duty” to be performed by the State.
- ▶ Education in religious culture and morals is compulsory in primary and secondary education institutions.
- ▶ Legal order of the State cannot be based on religious rules.

Constitutional Article 10 titled “Equality before the law” defines the norm on equality in all issues including religious belief and gender equality in general. With a new provision added to this article with the law no. 5170 in 2004, ensuring equality is given to the State as a “public duty” (as in the case of education in religion and morals).

2. Freedom of Conscience, Religious Faith and Gender Equality in the Turkish Penal Code

The Turkish Penal Code safeguards the freedom of religion and conscience by bringing penal sanctions to the following:

- ▶ Article 115 related to the offence of preventing the exercise of freedom of thought and conscience,
- ▶ Article 125/3 (c) and (b) related to “Defamation”,
- ▶ Article 153/1, 2 and 3 related to “Damage to worshipping places and cemeteries”, and
- ▶ Article 122 related to “Discriminatory behaviour.”

By referring to underlying principles and considering gender equality and secularism as the two fundamental principles adopted by the state we can say that Constitutional Article 10 and relevant provision of the Turkish Penal Code must be enforced with a view to gender equality without any distinction in regard to religion, faith and sex.

3. Freedom of Conscience, Religious Faith and Gender Equality under the Law on Political Parties

An important part of legislative arrangements related to freedom of religion and conscience is included in the Law on Political Parties.

4. The Law of Directorate of Religious Affairs (DİB) and Gender Equality

According to the Constitution, the Directorate of Religious Affairs (DİB) is the leading agency responsible for religious services extended by the state. The legal status and mandate of the DİB are provided for by Article 136 in the Constitution. According to this article, the DİB “shall exercise its duties prescribed in its particular law, in accordance with the principles of secularism, removed from all political views and ideas, and aiming at national solidarity and integrity.” The law on the DİB underwent substantial amendments in 2010: It was lifted from the level of general directorate up to undersecretary; the domain of its services and activities were expanded and rights of its personnel were improved.

This expansion was towards women, children and family in particular starting from the 2000s. With the new arrangement the DİB was assigned the task of “enlightening and guiding families, women, youth and other sections of society in religious issues” (Article 7 of the Law No. 6002). Within the framework of this new policy, National Action Plans developed by the Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services (AÇŞHB) to ensure gender equality and prevent violence against women assigns some duties to the DİB.

While the DİB enjoys a rather new and widened domain of duty, it is not clear which principles are to guide its actions. In reports and statements by the DİB we observe that these principles are defined narrowly in the context of protecting family and preventing violence against women.

The institutional structure and functions of the DİB in relation to women and family affairs are as follows:

4.1. DİB-Family and Religious Guidance Offices

The DRA established under each provincial muftiate a Family and Religious Guidance Office (ADRB) as a counselling unit. The domain of duty of the ADRB is defined as follows: *Ensuring that society is informed correctly about family from the perspective of religion; contributing to the preservation of family unity; contributing to the solution of religion related problems and questions concerning the family as an institution and family members; and conducting, when necessary, joint work with relevant governmental agencies, universities and civil society organizations.*

There is no regulation on how the ADRB should perform its duty to “realize gender equality” while delivering the service defined above under Article 10 in the Constitution.

4.2 New Arrangements on Marriage Law: Authorizing Muftiate to Conduct Official Marriage Procedures

A practice that comes from the past in relation to marriages in Turkey is the existence of religious marriage together with official wedlock. In 2006, 86% of marriages in Turkey were through both procedures. A more recent survey conducted in 2011 found that 94% of all marriages were acted in both ways. The rates of exclusively religious or exclusively official marriage are 3 per cent.¹⁹

In Turkish legislation it is only civil (official) marriage that entails rights and responsibilities for married couples. Wedlock related rights and responsibilities such as lineage, custody, alimony, inheritance, etc. can be realized only through official wedlock. Official wedlock is regarded as compulsory not only in the context of marriage related rights and responsibilities but also for the compliance of family law with the principle of secularism. Earlier penalties with deprivation of liberty were envisaged for couples having religious wedlock exclusively under paragraph (5) of article 230 in the Turkish Penal Code No. 5237 and religious officials conducting religious wedlock without seeing the official marriage document under paragraph (6) of the same law. In 2015 the Constitutional Court annulled these provisions with majority vote and religious marriage without civil wedlock ceased to be an offence.²⁰

With an amendment made in 2017 in Article 22 of the Law on Population Services²¹ provincial and district muftis were authorized to conduct wedlock just as mayors and muftars in order to “facilitate marriage ceremonies and extend rapid services.” Parallel to this, an addition was made to Article 7 in the Marital Regulations introducing the provision “*The ministry can authorize provincial population and citizenship directorates, provincial and district muftis, and relevant official missions abroad to conduct marriage procedures.*”²²

19 *Türkiye’de Kadına Yönelik Aile içi Şiddet Araştırması* (Study on Violence against Women in Turkey), 2014 <http://www.hips.hacettepe.edu.tr/TKAA2008-AnaRapor.pdf> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

20 Constitutional Court Decision 2014/36 No: 2015/51 Date: 27.5.2015 https://bianet.org/system/uploads/1/files/attachments/000/001/420/original/AYM_karar%C4%B1.pdf?1432911977 (accessed: 01.08.2018)

21 Law No. 7039 dated 19 October 2017 amending Population Services Law and some other laws, Official Gazette No.30229 dated 3 November 2017 (accessed: 01.08.2018)

22 For amendment in Marriage Regulations, see. <http://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/3.5.859747.pdf> (accessed: 01.08.2018)
For a legal assessment on this issue, see Fikret İlkiz, “Kanunlarla Gelen”, *Bianet*, 6 November 2017. <https://bianet.org/bianet/bianet/191260-kanunlarla-gelen> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

4.3. Religious Foundation of Turkey (TDV), KAGEM and Gender Equality

The Religious Foundation of Turkey (TDV) is the most important subsidiary of the DİB. The duty domain of the Foundation is similar to that of DİB. The foundation has many local branches in the country. Within the TDV, a “Women, Family and Youth Centre” (KAGEM) was established to address issues related to women and family in particular. Originally established with the mandate of “reaching all segments of society, supplying religious knowledge, thinking, culture and arts from the main sources of Islam and providing information, discourse and projects to solve social problems” in 1991, the KAGEM was re-structured in 2011 by expanding its fields of interest and responsibility. There is no specification as to how TDV- KAGEM should translate gender equality into life as foreseen by Constitutional Article 10 while delivering its services.

5. Law on the Human Rights and Equality Institution of Turkey (TİHEK) and Gender Equality

The most recent legislative arrangement related to equality in Turkey is the Law No. 6701 on the Human Rights and Equality Institution of Turkey (TİHEK) adopted in 2016.²³ Under this law “equality” is defined, in line with international norms, on the basis of the principle of “non-discrimination.” In compliance with Constitutional Article 10, Article 3 in the law states that “discrimination on the basis of gender is prohibited.” The 1st paragraph of Article 5 titled “Scope of Prohibition on Discrimination” lists public service areas where there should be no discrimination. While there is no specific mention of “religious services”, the list is open-ended stating...and similar services.”

Article 6 in the TİHEK Law related to employment states that there shall be no discrimination in public employment. However, Article 7 (b) providing for cases where “no claim of discrimination can be made” mentions cases “where only persons from a single gender should be employed.”

6. Ministry of National Education- General Directorate of Religious Teaching and Gender Equality (MEB-DÖGM)

It is the Ministry of National Education General Directorate of Religious Teaching (MEB-DÖGM) that is responsible for religious education institutions under Article 17 of the Law No. 3797 on the Organization and Duties of the Ministry of National Education.²⁴ The duties of the MEB-DÖGM are as follows: *Conducting all duties and services related to education, teaching and management in Religious High Schools; and preparing and presenting to the opinion of the Board of Education and Discipline programmes and textbooks of religious culture and ethics to be used in primary and secondary education institutions under the Ministry.*

There is no regulation on how the MEB-DÖGM should perform its duty to “realize gender equality” while delivering the service defined above under Article 10 in the Constitution.

²³ Law No. 6701, Adopted at: 6/4/2016. <https://www.tbmm.gov.tr/kanunlar/k6701.html> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

²⁴ http://mevzuat.meb.gov.tr/html/imamhatliseyon_1.html [Accessed: 01.07.2018]

7. Higher Education Board (YÖK), Higher Religious Education and Gender Equality

The Higher Education Board (YÖK) is authorized to open schools of theology to develop and implement religious education programmes at all levels (i.e. two-year degree, graduate, post-graduate, and doctorate). Hence, the YÖK is also a public organization delivering religious services along with others.

Within the YÖK, there is **Women Studies in Academia Unit**²⁵ to support gender equality policies in universities. This unit is in fact a commission set up by the YÖK on 29 May 2015 with its mandate defined as: “to stress the need for implementation by the state of gender equality policies in public sphere and for inclusion of gender equality principles in national human rights documents, international conventions and legislation given that gender equality and justice is one of the fundamental principles of democracy and a crucial element in development and welfare society.”

One of the most important functions of the Women Studies in Academia Unit was the preparation of the “YÖK Gender Equality Position Document”²⁶ and its presentation to all universities and colleges for discussion and adoption to firmly ground gender equality in higher education institutions. The policies in the document that are suggested for implementation by all institutions under the YÖK are: *Inclusion of the course in gender equality in the curriculum as a must course; creation of campus atmosphere sensitive to gender equality; creation of combat and support units in sexual harassment and assault; and extension of women studies as an academic discipline.*

B. Religious Services as a Public Service in Turkey and Gender Equality

According to updated data for the year 2018, there are 88,455 mosques under the DiB. 60 456 of these mosques have their spaces of prayer for women (68%) whereas 25 470 (29%) have no placas for ablution by women.

Recently the number of women between both providers and beneficiaries of religious services of all types delivered by the state is rapidly increasing in both absolute and relative terms. Religious services organized by the DRA (education, religious counselling/guidance, organization of mosque prayers, hajj/umrah visits, etc.) have mainly turned into a public service by and for women. There are two significant exceptions, however: The managerial positions of religious services are still largely overtaken by men, and there is much higher utilization of mosque services by men.

25 <http://www.yok.gov.tr/web/akademide-kadin-calismalari-birimi/ana-sayfa> (accessed: 01.07.2018)

26 http://www.yok.gov.tr/documents/10279/22712333/YOK_Tutum_belgesi.pdf(accessed: 01.08.2018)

See, for example, Position Document of Ankara University, <http://cts.ankara.edu.tr/files/2015/12/Tutum-Belgesi-1.pdf> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

1. Harmonization of Religious Services with Gender Equality Policies

The state institution in charge of designing and implementing gender equality policies in Turkey are the Ministry of Labour, Social Services and Family (AÇSHB) and the General Directorate of Women's Status (KSGM). As to institutions that determine the place of religion in public sphere and duties and responsibilities of public services in the field of religion include the Department of Religious Affairs (DİB), its Family and Religious Guidance Offices (ADRB), Ministry of National Education General Directorate of Religious Teaching (MEB-DÖGM) and schools of theology under Higher Education Board (YÖK).

Duties assigned to the DİB by Gender Equality National Action Plans:

Starting from the 2000s, National Action Plans developed by the AÇSHB-KSGM to promote gender equality included DİB as a partner in policies on gender equality and women's empowerment. Priority areas assigned to the DİB by the Gender Equality National Action Plan 2008-2013, National Action Plan on Combating Violence against Women (2016-2020) and Women's Empowerment Strategy Document and Action Plan 2018-2023 are as follows:

- ▶ Raising the level of education of girls and women,
- ▶ Preventing violence against women,
- ▶ Preventing early and forced marriages,
- ▶ Building awareness in women's health,
- ▶ Religious guidance in the fields of women's rights and protection of family.

Firstly, there is need "monitoring-reporting" work to follow progress in targeted policies and to guide policy-makers in problems confronted.

2. Public Servants Delivering Religious Services and Gender Equality

Starting from the early 2000s, women and girls have become main service providers and receivers in the DİB; however, there is no parallel increase in the proportion of women at top management levels of this agency. So far there has been no woman at the head of the DİB, but in 2018, for the first time, a woman theologian was appointed as deputy-head. There is no woman heading any of 12 general directorates while 7 out of 37 divisions are headed by women.

There is only one woman expert among 47 persons serving in the Supreme Board for Religious Affairs (DİYK). There are 26 inspectors in the DİB-Inspection Board and none of them is woman. 14 out of 59 senior/junior specialists working in the DİB are women (24%). Only 2 out of 27 ministerial advisors are women.

According to 2018 data there is no woman among muftis in 81 provinces. There are 20 women deputy muftis among 177 provincial mufti deputies appointed in recent years (11%). There is only one woman among 334 branch directors currently holding this position.

Examining gender distribution of persons employed by the DİB from 2010 to 2017 we observe increase in women’s employment in both absolute and relative terms. This increase is quite striking particularly at local level with 382%. There is 700% increase in women’s employment in education services. In 2018, only 10% of total personnel (1,472) at the central organization of DİB are women. There is no woman employed in DRS branches abroad. These data suggest that the DİB assigns specific importance to women’s employment at domestic-local level.

According to DİB official data for the year 2018, there is rapid increase in the share of women among specialized religious officials (trainers, preachers, etc.) who are employed in both general administration and religious services classes.

Table 1: Increase in DİB’s Women Preacher Employment in the Period 1991-2018

Years	Women Preachers	Preachers	Increase in Share of Women Preachers
1991	4 (5%)	603 (95%)	0%
2000	31 (6%)	460 (94%)	87%
2002	78 (12%)	574 (88%)	151%
2009	221 (18%)	986 (82%)	183%
2018	851 (30.5%)	1940 (69.5%)	285%

Data Source: <http://rehberlikteftis.diyagnet.gov.tr/sayfa/99> [Accessed: 19.06.2018]

Looking at DİB’s religious services in terms of service providers and service beneficiaries we observe a rapid increase in proportion of women in both. It is still men who make decisions and hold top positions, but in the meantime religious services are assuming the character of a “public service” mainly related to women.

3. Religious Education and Gender Equality

Non-formal and formal religious education has to be conducted under the supervision of the state (Constitutional Article 24). Types of religious education delivered as public service and associated institutions are as follows:

- ▶ Quran and Quran reading courses under the DİB,
- ▶ “Non-formal religious education” by the DİB targeting to impart religious information, culture and ethics to persons at all ages through preaching, courses, conferences, seminars and the media,
- ▶ Education by the DİB through the media: Diyanet Journal, Diyanet Radio, TRT Diyanet TV,
- ▶ Religious Secondary and High Schools under the Ministry of National Education General Directorate of Religious Teaching (MEB-DÖGM),
- ▶ “Courses in “Religious Culture and Morals” (DABD) that are compulsory in all primary and secondary education institutions under the MEB-DÖGM,
- ▶ Two-year degree, graduate, postgraduate and doctoral level studies in schools of

theology under state universities under the YÖK or foundations.

3.1. Non-formal Religious Education: Quran Reading Courses

14 142 218 persons benefited from skill building courses and social activities in Turkey in the period 2013-2014. Of this total, 7.6% are students attending Quran courses. While women make up 49% of trainees attending vocational courses, women's share in Quran courses is 93%.

In the education year 2014- 2015, there were 17 560 courses in non-formal religious education by the DİB. 92% of total 1,148,521 trainees were women.

In the term 2015-2016, 89% of 1 088 724 trainees were women. The highest share of trainees is primary school graduates with the weight of 40%.

Comparing data for academic years of 2014-2015 and 2015-2016 we find increase in both number of courses and students attending courses. What is specifically noteworthy is the increase in the number of children attending courses in their preschool years. While the share of preschool children attending courses was 1.6% in the period 2014-2015, it increased to 5.8% in the next period.

In the school year 2015-2016 there were 1 138 378 children in the age group 4-6 attending 27,782 religious courses. Girls make up 88% of this total (998 131). In the context of non-formal religious education, 3 016 instructors in courses for children in the age group 4-6 are all women and the number of women instructors increased by 25% over the previous year. The total number of courses increased by 26.9% and reached 2 053. The annual rate of increase in girl trainees is by 282%.

In the term 2015-2016, there were 59 349 students in 1 195 courses in Quran reading and 45.4% of these students were girls (26 945 students).²⁷

Data related to non-formal religious education delivered by the DİB suggest that women constitute the majority in both preschool religious teaching and service providers-receivers in Quran courses as a traditional field of religious service.

3.2. Formal Religious Education: Religious Schools

In Turkey formal religious education is organized under the Ministry of Education General Directorate of Religious Education (MEB-DÖGM) whereas non-formal religious teaching is by mosques and relevant units of the DİB. Formal religious education under the MEB-DÖGM is mainly delivered by religious schools (İmam-Hatip Schools-İHL). This education is at secondary and high school levels as well as through open education.

²⁷ For data, see:

-Religious Education Index 2015-2016 Basic Indicators in Religious Education and Teaching, YEKDER Non-formal Education and Culture Association https://www.yekder.org/images/pdf/yayinlar/din_egitimi_indeksi_web_7273.pdf; (accessed: 01.08.2018)

-DRA Report of Activities, <http://www2.diyinet.gov.tr/StratejiGelistirme/Faaliyet/2017%20Y%C4%B1%C4%B1%20Faaliyet%20Raporu.pdf> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

Data related to religious teaching delivered by the MoNE-GDRE is as follows:

Table 2: Number of Secondary Schools of Religious Education and Students under MEB-DÇGM

	2006-2007	2016-2017	Total rate of increase
Number of schools	455	2777	510%
Total number of students	120668	657020	444%
Number of male students	58500	309406	429%
Number of female students	62168	347614	459%

Data Source: T.C. Ministry of National Education Strategy Development Department Official Statistics (2006-2017) <http://sgb.meb.gov.tr/www/resmi-istatistikler/kategori/23/1/> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

Table 3: Number of High Schools of Religious Education and Students under MEB-DÖGM

	2006-2007	2016-2017	Total rate of increase
Number of schools	455	1452	219%
Total number of students	120668	645318	435%
Number of male students	58500	284218	386%
Number of female students	62168	361100	481%

Data Source: T.C. Ministry of National Education Strategy Development Department Official Statistics (2006-2017) <http://sgb.meb.gov.tr/www/resmi-istatistikler/kategori/23/1/> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

Table 4: Number of Open High Schools of Religious Education and Students under MEB-DÖGM

	2006-2007	2016-2017	Total rate of increase
Total number of students	1536	138802	8937%
Number of male students	472	51717	10857%
Number of female students	1054	87085	8162%

Data Source: T.C. Ministry of National Education Strategy Development Department Official Statistics (2006-2017) <http://sgb.meb.gov.tr/www/resmi-istatistikler/kategori/23/1/> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

At secondary education level, 7.31% of 5 278 107 students attend 1 597 religious secondary schools and of 385 830 students receiving religious education 198 194 (51%) are girls.

According to data for the period 2014-2015, secondary religious schools constituted 9.41% of all secondary education institutions in Turkey and 7.31% of all secondary level students were attending schools under the MEB-DÖGM. According to data for the period 2015- 2016, 11.31% of all secondary education institutions are placed under the MEB-DÖGM. 10.06 % of secondary students started to attend schools under this General Directorate. Relative to the previous year there is increase in both the number of secondary education institutions and students attending.

Taking a comparative look at secondary school data for the school years 2015- 2016 and 2014- 2015 we observe that the share of secondary religious schools and their students in total has increased. This increase is by 2.75% in the number of students under the MEB-DÖGM and by 1.9 % in the number of education institutions.

274 054 (52%) of 524 295 students attending religious secondary education are girls.

From 2014/2015 to 2015/2016 the number of female students enrolled to secondary religious education schools increased from 198 194 to 274 054 (by 72%). The increase in the number of male students is from 187 636 to 250 241' (by 75%).

In the school year 1996-1997 there were 464 Religious High Schools, 108 Anadolu Religious High Schools (seven of which were independent), 2 Religious High Schools with foreign language weight and 37 multi-programme Religious High Schools. In the intermediate part of these schools there were 301 983 students (43% girls) and 247 376 in the supper part (38% girls). From the school year 2006-2017 to 2016-2017, there is increase by 510% in the number of religious schools and by 110% in the number of students. While increase in male students is by 51%, it is as high as 201% for girls.

Table 5: Rate of Increase in Students Assigned to Secondary and High Schools under MEB-DÖGM

	2006-2007	2016-2017	Total rate of increase
Number of schools	455	2777	510%
Total number of students	15049	31530	110%
Number of male students	9498	14313	51%
Number of female students	5551	17217	210%

Data Source: T.C. Ministry of National Education Strategy Development Department Official Statistics (2006-2017) <http://sgb.meb.gov.tr/www/resmi-istatistikler/kategori/23/1/> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

In open religious high schools, the increase in the number of female teachers is two and a half

Table 6: T.C. Increase in Teaching Staff in Open Religious High Schools under MEB-DÖGM

	2011-2012	2016-2017	Total rate of increase
Number of schools	537	1452	170%
Total number of teachers	15049	40891	172%
Number of male teachers	9498	20719	118%
Number of female teachers	5551	20172	263%

Data Source: T.C. Ministry of National Education Strategy Development Department Official Statistics (2006-2017) <http://sgb.meb.gov.tr/www/resmi-istatistikler/kategori/23/1/> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

In the school year 2015- 2016, 132 new schools were added to secondary level religious schools under the MEB-DÖGM.

3.3. Higher Religious Education and Faculties of Theology

Higher religious teaching or teaching in theology is by schools (faculties) of theology administered by the Higher Education Board (YÖK). While the number of women academics with top positions in these schools is very few, a balance appears as going from upper to lower levels.

Table 7: Higher Religious Education: Academic Staff in Schools of Theology, 2017-2018

Academic staff	Men		Women		Total
	No.	%	No.	%	
Professor	388	97	12	3	400
Associate Professor	209	88.9	26	11.1	235
Assistant Professor	703	84.2	132	15.8	835
Teaching Assistant	175	84.1	33	15.9	208
Research Assistant	515	62.3	312	52.3	827
Total	1990	100.0	515	100.0	2505

Data Source: Higher Education Board (YÖK) Higher Education Statistics (2017-2018) <https://istatistik.yok.gov.tr/>(accessed: 01.08.2018)

Looking at academic staff in Schools of Theology from 2013/14 to 2017/18 we observe that increase in the number of female academics is much higher than increase in the number of male academics. In spite of this, however, male academic staff still outnumbers females.

Table 8: Higher Religious Education: Increase in Academic Staff of Schools of Theology: 2013-2018

	2013-14		2017-18		Total Increase		Rate of Increase	
	Men	Women	Men	Women	Men	Women	Men	Women
Professor	389	5	388	12	-	7	-	140%
Associate Professor	160	14	209	26	49	12	31%	86%
Assistant Professor	563	73	703	132	140	59	25%	81%
Teaching Assistant	114	10	175	33	61	23	54%	230%
Research Assistant	391	205	515	312	124	107	32%	52%
Total	1617	307	1990	515	373	208	23%	68%

Data Source: Higher Education Board (YÖK) Higher Education Statistics (2013-2018) <https://istatistik.yok.gov.tr/>(accessed: 01.08.2018)

Taking a look at gender distribution of students of theology for the academic years 2012-2013 and 2017-2018 we see that women concentrate in two-year degree and graduate studies while men constitute the majority at postgraduate and doctorate levels. Within these five years, the rate of increase in female students at two-year degree and graduate levels is above 70 per cent.

Table 9: Distribution of Students of Theology by Type of Education, Years and Gender

Type of Education	2012-2013				2017-2018				Total Increase		Rate of Increase	
	M	M %	F	F %	M	M %	F	F %	M	F	M	F
Two-year degree	66775	43.2	87797	56.8	101624	40.4	149627	59.6	34849	61830	52%	70%
Graduate	20078	38.5	32134	61.5	38428	40.2	57188	59.8	18350	25054	91%	78%
Post graduate	4580	64.5	2520	35.5	7688	61	4910	39	3108	2390	68%	95%
Doctorate	1723	79.4	446	20.6	2435	77.9	692	22.1	712	246	41%	55%

Data Source: Higher Education Board (YÖK) Higher Education Statistics (2013-2018) <https://istatistik.yok.gov.tr/> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

The number of female students at two-year degree **level of higher education** is about two times that of male students.

New enrolments to undergraduate programmes in Religion and Religious Sciences in the academic year of 2015- 2016 indicates and increase by 0.17% relative to the previous academic year.

At undergraduate level, the number of female students is higher than that of male students although the margin in-between is getting smaller.

At graduate level, there is increase in the number of students in departments of Religion and Religious Sciences from 2014- 2015 to 2015-2016. In spite of this absolute increase, however, there is decrease in percentage terms.

At postgraduate/doctorate level, the number of female students rapidly falls and males gain majority.

4. Counseling Women and Family Issues as a Task of Religious Guidance

Family and Religious Guidance Offices (ADRB) are operational in 81 provinces and their districts. It is observed that it is mostly women who apply to these offices. These applications are mostly on such matters as marriage and divorce, problems of couples, domestic violence, sexual problems, woman's employment, inheritance, honour killings, having tube-baby, marriage programmes and internet use. In this context, it is also important to cooperate with the AÇSHB in issues that fall into its domain.

5. Religious Comments of DİB on Family Law

Quite different issues related to gender equality are addressed in opinions (fetva) declared by the Supreme Council of Religious Affairs (DİYK) that is in charge of responding to questions on

religious issues forwarded by citizens. In fact, interpretations made by such issues as marriage, divorce, inheritance and custody which are provided for by the Civil Code are accepted as the official opinion of the DİB. Similar opinions can also be found in *Diyanet Dergisi*²⁸ and *Aile Dergisi*²⁹ published by the DİB. Sermons (khutba) written by the DİB from time to time to be read out in all mosques reflect the opinion of Islam religion on various issues. It is therefore important to look at how the issue of gender equality is addressed in sermons prepared by the DİB. We see in these sermons that they mainly address relations within family and the main approach is to “protect the family”. They usually recommend the fulfilment of mutual responsibilities and duties within the framework of a traditional family concept. An important reference in this context is the stress placed on “moral deterioration and collapse of family” and the need to counter this tendency. It is an important public service area to follow these activities of the DİB with respect to their compliance with gender equality norms.

6. Management of Places of Prayer - Women’s Equal Access to Mosque Services

The DİB is authorized to launch mosques and manage prayers there in Turkey. Personnel and other costs of about 90,000 mosques in Turkey are covered by the DİB budget. Recently there have been significant initiatives to facilitate the use of mosques by women for worshipping purposes. The basis of these initiatives is the assertion that mosque-going women face discrimination in these venues.

Starting in 2000, the DİB assigns priority to efforts to make mosques fit for use by women. As of 2018, there are 60 456 mosques in Turkey with sections where women can pray and 25 470 mosques with facilities for women’s ablution.

7. Management of Religious Rituals - Organization of Hajj and Umrah

Hajj and umrah visits to Mecca and Medina as holy places of Islam are the most important of all religious rituals. The DİB identifies by casting lots citizens to visit these places each year (according to a quota given by Saudi Arabia) and organizes for their travel to, accommodation and return back to Turkey. The state provides guides, assistants and counsellors (including in health matters) to accompany citizens doing their hajj and umrah visits.

In 2017 there were 96 567 citizens going for umrah under the organization of the DİB; 60% of these citizens were women (58 178) and 40% were men (38 397). In 2018 there were 42 388 applicants of whom 55% were women (23 143) and 45% are men (19 195). In 2017, 4 397 public servants were assigned by the DİB to accompany travellers for various services and assistance. These include group leaders, religious officers, women enlighteners and organizing personnel. Also 15 women deputy-muftis were present in the hajj travel of the year 2017. As is the case with other religious services, the number of men is declining among hajj and umrah travellers in recent years.

28 <http://www.diyandertgeri.com/>(accessed: 01.08.2018)

29 <http://www.diyandertgeri.com/aile> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

C. Capacity of Civil Society Organizations in Monitoring Gender Equality

1. Capacity of Civil Organizations Engaged in Gender-Based Monitoring

In Turkey, the leading ones among civil organizations that aim to fulfil gender equality on the basis of freedom of religion and conscience are those starting out from Islam to defend the rights of women. Distinct from internationally active Islam-based women organizations (many of these international organizations seek to eliminate discrimination against women in Islamic countries by women-centred reading of Quran), Moslem women organizations in Turkey take the existing secular family law as given. Thus, such organizations in Turkey emerged as criticism of religious behaviour that subordinates women in social life by using religion as reference in spite of existing legal arrangements based on gender equality rather than making religion-based family law sensitive to women's rights. While the number of such civil women organizations active in this way is limited in Turkey, the present report covers the following: "Association for Women's Rights against Discrimination" (AK-DER), "Başkent Women's Platform, Rainbow Women's Platform" (GİKAP), "Women's Education and Culture Foundation" (HEKVA), "Hazar Education, Culture and Solidarity Association" (HAZAR), "İstanbul Association of Women and Women's Organizations" (İKADDER), "Moslem Initiative against Violence against Women" and "Women and Democracy Association." Among these, the "Başkent Women's Platform" is distinguished with its organizational capacity in conducting activities within the framework of gender equality.

2. Gender Equality Monitoring Capacity of Local CSOs Engaged in Rights-Based Monitoring

It is also important in the context of freedom of religion and belief to see to what extent gender equality is included in the agenda of leading civil organizations engaged in rights-based activities. The present report covers the leading ones among these organizations including İHH Humanitarian Relief Foundation, Association for Solidarity for Human Rights and the Oppressed (MAZLUM-DER), Association for Free Thinking and Rights to Education (ÖZGÜR-DER), Federation of Alevi Associations, Hacı Bektaş Veli Anatolian Culture Foundation, Cem Foundation and Pir Sultan Abdal Culture Association. There is no woman member in governing bodies of majority of these organizations and they do not seem to be sensitive to problems arising from gender inequalities with the exception of MAZLUM-DER.

3. Civil Organizations Based on Different Faiths and Gender Equality

Rights-based associations of different faith groups include the Armenian Culture Solidarity Association, Chief Rabbinate Foundation of Turkey, Association for Supporting Greek Community Foundations, Association of Protestant Churches, Bahai Community of Turkey and Hrant Dink Foundation. With the exception of Hrant Dink Foundation, no information could be obtained from many of these civil society organizations as to inclusion of gender equality in their activities.

D. Areas Intersecting between Freedom of Religion and Belief and Gender Equality in Turkey

1. Freedom to Use Religious Symbols

The issue whether public servants should be allowed to use religious symbols during their duty is widely debated worldwide and in Turkey from the point of freedoms, rights and public order.

The *Regulation on Dressing of Personnel Employed in Public Organizations and Agencies* issued by the council of Ministers on 16 July 1982 (Council of Ministers Decree No.8/5 dated 16 July 1982) had introduced the rule that women should not cover their head under Article 5. This arrangement was amended by Article 1 in the Annex Regulation of the Council of Ministers No. 2013/5443 dated 4 October 2013 and the following paragraph (c) was added: "However, in case there are special working clothes for some services, these may be used while on duty with the permission of the superior." This meant the lifting of the ban of head cover by public employees.

Following this amendment the ban on headwear was lifted for members of security and military forces as well. Upon women deputies attending the Grand National Assembly session on 31 October 2013, the ban on members of this institution also became void.

2. Civil Women Actions for Access to Mosque Prayers

Complaints and requests exist given that women's participation to ceremonies held in mosques remains limited.

A group of women launched the campaign "Women are in mosques" in October 2017 to improve the position of women in these worshipping spaces.³⁰ On the internet site of the campaign there is the list of mosques with necessary organization to enable women's Friday prayer, suggestions to cope up with any maltreatment at mosques and the position of women in mosques according to Islamic sources.³¹

According to a public opinion survey on religious public services 65% of respondents affirmed the statement "Places allocated to women in mosques are insufficient" while 25 % were in different opinion. 48% of respondents agreed with the statement "Spaces must be allocated to women in Friday prayers" while 34% found it wrong. In sum, people consider services extended to women by the DiB insufficient and want to see more women among service providers.³²

30 <http://kadinlarcamilerde.com/hakkimizda/> (accessed: 01.08.2018)

31 <http://kadinlarcamilerde.com/category/yazi/faydali-bilgiler/> (accessed: 12.09.2018)

32 In KONDA Research and Counselling, *Department of Religious Affairs Study: Perceptions, Contentment, Expectations*, November 2014, Helsinki Citizens Association, *Department of Religious Affairs in the Context of Socioeconomic Policies: Public Outlook to Religious Affairs - Debates, Suggestions*, İstanbul: Helsinki Citizens Association.

IV. Data Sources

Table 10: National Sources of Data

Data Source	Data Theme	Access
Higher Education Board Higher Education Information Management System	Higher education level religious education data	https://istatistik.yok.gov.tr/
T.C. Ministry of National Education Department of Strategy Development Official Statistics (2006-2017)	Secondary education level religious education data	http://sgb.meb.gov.tr/www/resmi-istatistikler/ kategori/23/1/
Department of Religious Affairs Department of Strategy Development Statistics and Activity Reports (2010-2017)	Religious Services data	http://stratejigelistirme.diyenet.gov.tr/sayfa/57/ istatistikler http://stratejigelistirme.diyenet.gov.tr/sayfa/22/ Faaliyet-Raporlari
Turkish Religious Foundation (TDV)	Religious services	https://www.tdv.org/

Table 11: Sources Providing Comparative Data at International Level

Data Source	Data Theme	Access
International Social Survey Program	Religion Module	http://www.issp.org/data-download/by-topic/
Religion and Public Life	The World's Muslims: Religion, Politics and Society 2013	http://assets.pewresearch.org/wp-content/uploads/ sites/11/2013/04/worlds-muslims-religion-politics-society-full- report.pdf

V. Indicators

Table 12: Gender Equality in Religious Services: Indicators that are accessible or with recorded data

Relevant Human Rights and Norms	Theme	Service Description	Indicator (by gender)	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency
Freedom of religion and belief, State's duty to realize gender equality	1. Religious services extended by public organizations	1.1. Management and supervision of religious services	<p>1.1.1. Department of Religious Affairs (DİB):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ W/M ratio in top level DİB staff ■ W/M ratio in hands of sections within DİB ■ W/M ratio in muftis, deputy muftis ■ W/M ratio in the board of inspectors <p>1.1.2. Turkish Religious Foundation (TDV)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ W/M ratio in foundation presidents and governors ■ W/M ratio in branch leaders of foundations <p>1.1.3. Ministry of National Education, General Directorate of Religious Teaching (MEB-DÖGM):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ W/M ratio in directors, deputy directors, section chiefs in central and branch organizations of MEB-DÖGM ■ W/M ratio in directors and deputy directors of religious schools at all levels under MEB-DÖGM <p>1.1.4. Higher Education Board Schools of Theology (YÖK) W/M ratio in staff of schools of theology (deans, deputy deans, department heads, institute and research centre directors, etc.)</p>	DİB statistics TÜİK statistics, MEB statistics, DPB statistics, YÖK statistics	Once a year

Relevant Human Rights and Norms	Theme	Service Description	Indicator (by gender)	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency
		1.2. Personnel delivering religious services	<p>1.2.1. Department of Religious Affairs (DİB)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ W/M ratio in personnel working at central and local organizations of DİB ■ W/M ratio in preachers, muezzin, counsellors, experts, etc. ■ W/M ratio in Quran course teachers <p>1.2.2. Ministry of National Education, General Directorate of Religious Teaching (MEB-DÖGM):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ W/M ratio in İHL teachers ■ W/M ratio in religion teachers delivering compulsory religion courses in MEB <p>1.2.3. Turkish Religious Foundation (TDV)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ W/M ratio in persons employed by central and branch organizations of TDV <p>1.2.4. Higher Education Board-Schools of Theology (YÖK) W/M ratio in academic staff in schools of theology (professor, associate and assistant professor, lecturer, instructor, research assistant)</p>	DİB statistics TÜİK statistics, MEB statistics, DPB statistics, YÖK statistics	Once a year

Relevant Human Rights and Norms	Theme	Service Description	Indicator (by gender)	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency
		1.3. Persons benefitting from religious services extended by public organizations	<p>1.3.1. Department of Religious Affairs (DİB)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ W/M ratio in students attending DİB's Quran courses ■ W/M ratio in students enrolled to DİB's boarding schools in Quran teaching ■ W/M ratio in students enrolled to İHL and other religious schools ■ Weekly hours of compulsory religion courses in MEB schools ■ Number and total amount of scholarships granted to female and male students receiving religious education <p>1.3.2. Turkish Religious Foundation (TDV)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of commissions, boards, etc. within the foundation focusing on gender equality issues ■ Extent to which women can benefit from foundation's religious services ■ Foundation budget and spending made for services utilized by women <p>1.2.3. Ministry of National Education, General Directorate of Religious Teaching (MEB-DÖGM)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ W/M ratio in students receiving religious education in İHL and other religious schools ■ Number of students in MEB schools who apply to be exempt from compulsory religion courses <p>1.3.4. Higher Education Board -Schools of Theology (YÖK)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ W/M ratio in students of theology 	DİB statistics TÜİK statistics, MEB statistics, DPB statistics, YÖK statistics	Once a year

Relevant Human Rights and Norms	Theme	Service Description	Indicator (by gender)	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency
		1.4. Number and content of complaints about services extended to women by mosques	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proportion of women receiving services from mosques To what extent (percentage) mosques/worshipping places are fit for equal utilization by women (i.e. availability of proper prayer, toilet, ablution place , etc. for women) Number and content of complaints about services extended to women by mosques 	DİB statistics Reports by relevant civil society organizations	Once a year
		1.5. Counselling in religious matters	Directorate of Religious Affairs (DİB): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> W/M ratio in members of the DİYK W/M ratio in experts working in ADRB W/M ratio in applicants to ADRB 	DİB statistics	Once a year
		1.6. Compliance with gender equality of religious services extended by civil organizations	1.6.1. Directorate of Religious Affairs (DİB): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To what extent the issue of gender equality is covered by preaches, trainings, conferences, etc. delivered by DİB personnel In how many sermons in mosques prepared by the DİB there is mention of gender equality 1.6.2. Ministry of National Education, General Directorate of Religious Teaching (MEB-DÖGM): Mention of gender equality norm in DKAB textbooks 1.6.3. Higher Education Board -Schools of Theology (YÖK): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of courses in gender equality in schools of theology 	DİB data, relevant survey reports	Once a year
	2. Religious services extended by civil organizations	2.1. Religious services extended by civil organizations	2.1.1. CSOs guided by the principle of rights-based religious services: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> W/M ratio in membership W/M ratio in managing boards 2.1.2 Of religious CSOs protecting women's rights: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sensitivity to gender equality 	Records of related civil organization	Once a year

Relevant Human Rights and Norms	Theme	Service Description	Indicator (by gender)	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency
	3. Indicators with Importance at National Level		3.1. Annual changes in DiB budget relative to general budget 3.2. Share of DiB budget spent for services that women use 3.3. W/M ratio among those benefiting from services by religious organizations (zakat, subsistence assistance, educational scholarships, etc.) 3.4. Amount that religious organizations can use in public funds (TL, annual) 3.5. Number of mosques under DiB 3.6. Number of other worshipping places not under DiB	DiB statistics, Relevant civil monitoring reports	Once a year

Table 13: Indicators for which Data Collection and Use is Suggested

Relevant Human Rights and Norms	Theme	Service description	Indicator (by gender)	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency
Freedom of religion and belief, State's duty to realize gender equality	1. Religious services extended by public organizations	1.3. Persons benefiting from religious education delivered by public organizations	<p>MEB-DÖGM:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Incorporation/mainstreaming of gender equality in developing the programme, curriculum and textbooks in DKAB and elective religious courses. <p>YÖK-Schools of Theology</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Inclusion of courses in gender equality in programmes and mainstreaming the concept of human rights ■ Avoiding teaching of gender stereotypes as religious tenets in courses ■ Checking whether subjects like "women's rights in Islam" addressed in compliance with gender equality norms 	Data from relevant surveys, statistics	Once in every three years
		1.5. Counselling in religious issues	<p>DİB-ADRB:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Whether experts in ADRB are assigned during their in-service training the task of identifying and combating against beliefs and opinions that may stem from religion or traditions that prevent women's equal enjoyment of their human rights (early marriage, violence against women, inequality in the right to inheritance, forced or polygamous marriage, etc.) 	Data from relevant surveys	Once a year

Relevant Human Rights and Norms	Theme	Service description	Indicator (by gender)	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency
Freedom of religion and belief, State's duty to realize gender equality		1.6. Compliance with gender equality norms in the conduct of religious services	<p>DİB, MEB-DÖGM, YÖK</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Whether public servants in religious services are informed about and assigned during their in-service training the task of identifying and combating against beliefs and opinions that may stem from religion or traditions that prevent women's equal enjoyment of their human rights ■ Number of DİB preaches and sermons , Friday sermons, gatherings, etc. dealing with issues of women's human rights, gender equality and violence against women ■ Content (quality) of DİB preaches and sermons dealing with issues of women's human rights, gender equality and violence against ■ Within DİB whether women can equally participate to processes of interpreting religious sources ■ Whether relevant institutions are engaged in work geared to preventing the violation of women's human rights by gender stereotypes 	Data from relevant surveys	Once a year
	3. Significant Indicators at National Level		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Share in DİB budget allocated to services for women ■ W/M ratio among those benefiting from services by religious charity organizations (zakat, subsistence assistance, educational scholarships, etc.) ■ Amount that religious organizations can use in public funds (TL, annual) 	DİB statistics, Relevant civil monitoring reports	Once a year

Annex Tables

ANNEX Table: DİB, Current Data as of July 2018

DEPARTMENT OF RELIGIOUS AFFAIRS			
TITLE	FEMALE	MALE	TOTAL
Vice President	1	4	5
General Director	0	12	12
Department Head	7	30	37
Members of DİYK	0	14	14
Experts/Junior Experts in DİYK	1	46	47
Board of Inspection/Inspector	0	26	26
Presidential Advisor	2	25	27
Province Mufti	0	81	81
Deputy Mufti	20	157	177
Expert/Junior Expert in Religious Affairs	14	45	59
Preacher	851	1940	2791
Religious Services/Education Expert	44	140	184
Auditor	49	410	459
Branch Director	1	333	334
Quran course students	16274	9281	25554
İmam Hatip	0	62208	62208
Muezzin Caretaker	0	11952	11952
Personnel at the centre	139	1332	1472
Local organizations			
ADRB Personnel	521	243	764
ADRB Counselees	14643	2174	16817
Number of mosques under the DİB			88445
Number of mosques with places of praying for women			60456
Number of mosques with places of ablution for women			25740
Umrah travellers in 2017 (as organized by the DİB)			
Number of hajj travellers in 2018	23143	19195	42338
TURKISH RELIGIOUS FOUNDATION			
President and Board Members	2	7	9
Provincial directors of the foundation are provincial muftis	0	81	81
Unit in the Foundation in charge of gender equality issues (KAGEM)			1
Foundation budget and total spending for services to women	No indicator data		

This publication is produced with the financial support of European Union. Its contents are the sole responsibility of the Association for Monitoring Gender Equality and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union or the Directorate for EU Affairs - Department of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Republic of Turkey.