



This project is funded by the European Union

Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey:
Gender Equality Monitoring Project

Gender Equality in the Media Sector

Mapping and Monitoring Study
Full Summary

Prof. Dr. Seil Bker



CEİD PUBLICATIONS

Gender Equality in the Media Sector
Mapping and Monitoring Study
Full Summary

The present text is the informative summary of "Gender Equality in the Media Sector, Mapping and Monitoring Study" prepared under the "Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Gender Equality Monitoring Project. Turkish version of this summary, main text and bibliography are available at: www.ceidizleme.org

ISBN: 978-605-69015-5-3

It can be reproduced and used by referring to the source.

CEİD ADDRESS:

Cinnah Caddesi, No: 75/7 Çankaya, 06690
Ankara, Turkey
Tel: + 312 440 04 84-85
www.ceid.org.tr
www.ceidizleme.org
December 2018

Ankara

Cover/Text Design: Elma Teknik Basım Matbaacılık Tic. Ltd. Şti.
İvedik OSB Matbaacılar Sitesi
1516/1 Sokak No:35
Yenimahalle/Ankara
Tel: 0 312 229 92 65

Translation: Metin Çulhaoğlu

This publication is produced with the financial support of European Union. Its contents are the sole responsibility of the Association for Monitoring Gender Equality and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union or the Directorate for EU Affairs - Department of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Republic of Turkey.

PROF DR ATİYE SEÇİL BÜKER was a faculty member in Anadolu University Faculty of Communication, Department of Cinema and Television from 1982 to 2000 and in Gazi University Faculty of Communication Department of Cinema and Television from 2000 to 2014. B ker has her books, articles and academic presentations on cinematic representation, narrative forms and meaning making in cinema, star image and violence against women and semiology.

PREFACE

The present report is the outcome of a series of thematic mapping work and efforts to develop gender equality (GE) monitoring indicators under the *Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Gender Equality Monitoring Project*. The project took shape in the period 2013-2017 in a process involving meetings and exchange of opinion with many institutions and persons. The common point emerging in this process was the necessity of developing independent mechanisms for monitoring and evaluation at the stage that GE policies reached in Turkey. In other words, what was needed was an independent monitoring mechanism to assess the appropriateness and effectiveness of national legislation and action plans developed so far in translating GE into life. This also entailed the development of tools satisfying relevant scientific and technical requirements and facilitating systematic monitoring free from political and ideological polemics. To ensure compliance with international norms and sustainability, it was also necessary to develop monitoring indicators and assess these indicators through mapping and periodic reporting, which became the roadmap of the project. It was also among the objectives of the project to take initial steps to ensure the institutionalization needed for the sustainability of these efforts.

While delineating its field of work the *Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Gender Equality Monitoring Project* adopted a "gender sensitive rights-based" approach. The basic objectives of the project include the following: Supporting the inclusion of international norms and standards developed for GE in legislation, practices and monitoring policies in Turkey; reporting of GE related problem areas through mapping; contributing to institutionalization in Turkey of an independent, scientific and mainstreamed strategy by developing GE specific monitoring indicators; and enhancing government-civil society cooperation and monitoring capacity in the field of GE.

Starting in March 2017, the project was planned so as to be completed in 24 months. In the project funded by the European Union, the beneficiary is the Ministry of Foreign Affairs Directorate for EU Affairs, contracting authority is the Central Finance and Contracts Unit and the implementing party is the Association for Monitoring Gender Equality. The target group of the project comprises gender-focused civil society organizations, other civil organizations engaged in rights-based monitoring, relevant governmental agencies, governorates and metropolitan municipalities, and district municipalities as units of equality. Project stakeholders include the Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services General Directorate on the Status of Women (KSGM), the TBMM (The Grand National Assembly of Turkey) Commission on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men (KEFEK), Human Rights and Equality Institution of Turkey (TIHEK), and Ombudsman Institution (KDK).

Mapping reports and **monitoring indicators** were developed in ten thematic areas identified in line with the objective of the project (combating gender-based violence against women; gender equality in participation to political decision making, to education, employment, religious activities, sports, access to urban rights/services, media and combat against trafficking in women/human beings). Besides, to make project outputs as well as many sources and data

in relevant fields accessible to all, a **Gender Equality Monitoring Centre** was set up and made functional with its e-library. Mapping Reports on ten thematic areas and their summaries were made available in the electronic environment, printed in Turkish and their informative summaries were released in Turkish and English. On the basis of Mapping Reports, 1337 GE monitoring indicators were presented to the public for use, 515 of which have their presently available or accessible data and 822 proposed to be developed.

One important component of the project was intensive work carried out in selected pilot provinces for local-level sharing of data from reports and indicators developed. Training in gender-sensitive rights-based monitoring and in mapping reports and monitoring indicators accompanied by preparatory workshops on local equality monitoring action plans were the activities carried out in selected seven pilot provinces. Efforts were made to establish and maintain **Local Equality Monitoring Platforms**. In Adana, Ankara, İstanbul, İzmir, Kars, Gaziantep and Trabzon as pilot provinces, **Local Equality Monitoring Plans** were developed to assess and monitor whether services delivered at local level observe gender equality, and a **National Equality Monitoring Plan** was prepared to scale up this work countrywide and ensure its sustenance.

The longer-term durability of services developed by the project is possible with the presence of sustained support. We believe that this support will be available as project outputs are used and further improved by large sections of society.

There are so many organizations and individuals contributing to the project without which it would be simply an impossible endeavour. We are grateful to the project team working with full commitment and engagement throughout the process, experts completing mapping reports and indicators in a long and tiresome work, and to CEİD members supporting the management of the project in harmony from its start to completion. CEİD local coordinators and training experts facilitated the implementation of the project by their hard work at both central and local levels. Staff from public organizations and representatives from civil society organizations who prepared Local Equality Monitoring Plans by taking part in work conducted by Local Monitoring Platforms put this work in practice at the local level. In case this project is to be attributed any success, it is the outcome of efforts and contributions of many including those we could not mention here. We are indebted to all for what they have added to the *Enhancement of Participatory Democracy in Turkey: Gender Equality Monitoring Project*.

Association for Monitoring Gender Equality

Board of Directors

Contents

Biography	3
Preface.....	4
List of Tables	7
List of Acronyms.....	8
I. INTRODUCTION	12
1. International Documents from Historical Perspective.....	12
1.1 Brief History of Women’s Place in the Media and Role in the Process of Production.....	12
1.2 International Documents in the Process of Setting Norms and Standards.....	13
1.3 United Nations (UN).....	14
1.4 Documents in Europe.....	16
1.5 Setting Norms.....	17
1.6 Standards	20
II. PRESENT STATE OF GENDER EQUALITY IN TURKISH MEDIA	23
III. MAPPING RELEVANT POLICIES: CHECKING THE COMPLIANCE OF POLICY DOCUMENTS WITH HUMAN RIGHTS DOCUMENTS	33
IV. COMPOSITE INDEXES IN THE FIELD OF GENDER EQUALITY, DATA SOURCES AND INDICATORS PROVIDED BY INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS	35
V. MONITORING AND EVALUATION ON THE FIELD OF MEDIA	38

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Breakdown of Legislation on the Basis of Related Norms.....	30
Table 2: Monitoring Public Institutions and Organizations	33
Table 3: Monitoring Report for Women’s and GE-Based Organizations.....	34
Table 4: LGBTI Organizations Monitoring Report	34
Table 5: List of Related Indexes	37
Table 6: CEİD Set of Indicators in the Thematic Field of Media (With Sources of Data)	38
Table 7: CEİD Set of Indicators in the Thematic Field of Media (Without Sources of Data).....	49

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AA	Anadolu Agency
ASPB	Ministry of Family and Social Policies
BİA	Independent Communication Network
BTK	Information Technologies and Communication Institution
BYEGM	General Directorate of Press and Information
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CEİD	Gender Equality Monitoring Association
CPJ	Committee to Protect Journalists
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
CŞMD	The Association for Struggle Against Sexual Violence
CSO	Civil Society Organization
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECTT	European Convention on Trans-boundary Television
EIGE	European Institute for Gender Equality Gender
ESC	European Social Charter
EU	European Union
GE	Gender Equality
GFW	Global Fund for Women
GMMP	Global Media Monitoring Project
HDR	Human Development Reports
HRA	Human Rights Association
IFJ	International Federation of Journalists
ILO	International Labour Organization
IPU	Inter-parliamentary Union
KADEM	Women and Democracy Association
KAGİDER	Association of Women Entrepreneurs
Kaos GL	Kaos Gay and Lesbian Cultural Research and Solidarity Association
KDK	Ombudsman Institution
KEFEK	Commission on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men
KİHEP	Women's Human Rights Training Programme
KLMI	Key Labour Market Indicators

KOSGEB	Small and Medium Size Enterprises Development Administration
KSGM	General Directorate on the Status of Women
LGBT	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender
LGBTI	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Intersex
LGBTİQA+	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Intersex, Queer, Asexual, Agender, Aromatic
LGBTT	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transsexual or Travesty
MEB	Ministry of National Education
MEDİZ	Women's Media Monitoring Group
MoTMC	Ministry of Transportation, Maritime Affairs and Communication
MTM	Media Monitoring Centre
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OSCE	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe
PEGI	Pan-European Game Information
PMD	Association of Parliament Correspondents
RTÜK	Supreme Board for Radio and Television
SHÇEK	Social Services and Child Protection Agency
TBMM	The Grand National Assembly of Turkey
TGC	Association of Turkish Journalists
TGS	Union of Turkish Journalists
TİHEK	Human Rights and Equality Institution of Turkey
TİKA	Turkish Cooperation and Coordination agency
TRT	Turkish Radio and Television Corporation
TÜBİTAK	Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey
TÜİK	Turkish Statistical Agency
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UN-GBDI	United Nations Gender Based Development Index
UN-GII	United Nations Gender Inequality Index
UN-HDI	United Nations Human Development Index
UNDESA	United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

WB	World Bank
WEF	World Economic Forum
WHO	World Health Organization
WHR-NSA	Women's Human Rights - New Solutions Association
YÖK	Higher Education Board

Information on the Names of Institutions

Since this report was completed before the decrees mentioned below it does not reflect changes made in the names of some major institutions. The Decree No. 703 in Force of Law on 'Amendment of Some Laws and Decrees to Ensure Compliance with Constitutional Amendments' was published in the Official Gazette No. 30473 dated 9 July 2018. The decree introduced changes to the organization and mandate of some Ministries and institutions.

With the Presidential Decree No. 1 dated 10 July 2018 on the Organization of the Office of Presidency and the Presidential Decree No. 4 dated 15 July 2018 on the Organization of Agencies and Institutions Under, Related and Attached to Ministries and other Agencies and Institutions, organizational structure and mandate of some ministries and institutions were modified.

The ministries and institutions subject to modifications are listed below.

- The Ministry of Family and Social Policies (*Aile ve Sosyal Politikalar Bakanlığı*) and Ministry of Labour and Social Security (*Çalışma ve Sosyal Güvenlik Bakanlığı*) were merged and renamed as 'Ministry of Labour, Social Services and Family.' (*Çalışma, Sosyal Hizmetler ve Aile Bakanlığı*)
Upon the Presidential Decree (Decree No. 15) dated 4 August 2018 on Amendments to Some Presidential Decrees, the Ministry of Labour, Social Services and Family (*Çalışma, Sosyal Hizmetler ve Aile Bakanlığı*) was renamed as Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services (*Aile, Çalışma ve Sosyal Hizmetler Bakanlığı*).
- The Ministry of European Union (*Avrupa Birliği Bakanlığı*) was closed and the Department of European Union (*Avrupa Birliği Başkanlığı*) was established within the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.
- The Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology (*Bilim, Sanayi ve Teknoloji Bakanlığı*) and Ministry of Development (*Kalkınma Bakanlığı*) were merged and named as Ministry of Industry and Technology (*Sanayi ve Teknoloji Bakanlığı*).
- The Ministry of Customs and Trade (*Gümrük ve Ticaret Bakanlığı*) and Ministry of Economy (*Ekonomi Bakanlığı*) were merged and renamed as Ministry of Trade (*Ticaret Bakanlığı*).
- The Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Animal Husbandry (*Gıda, Tarım ve Hayvancılık Bakanlığı*) and Ministry of Forestry and Hydraulic Works (*Orman ve Su İşleri Bakanlığı*) were merged and renamed as Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (*Tarım ve Orman Bakanlığı*).
- The Ministry of Finance (*Maliye Bakanlığı*) was renamed as Ministry of Treasury and Finance (*Hazine ve Maliye Bakanlığı*), and the Undersecretary of Treasury (*Hazine Müsteşarlığı*) which used to be under Deputy Prime Minister was transferred in the new structuring to the Ministry of Treasury and Finance.
- The Ministry of Transportation, Maritime Affairs and Communication (*Ulaştırma Denizcilik ve Haberleşme Bakanlığı*) was renamed as Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure (*Ulaştırma ve Altyapı Bakanlığı*).

I. Introduction

As a fundamental human right, gender equality has secured its place in most fundamental international documents, conventions and commitments. Being parties to these international documents, States thus have made their commitments to ensure gender equality in real life. Turkey too has undertaken this commitment in many areas by being a party to these documents. As in other countries in the world, in Turkey too the media is an area where gender inequalities can be observed commonly.

The objective of the present report is to assess how gender equality as a fundamental human right is experienced in the media both as a sector and its outputs, and international and local level efforts to ensure gender equality in the field of media. It intends to monitor, by using identified indicators, the outcomes of policies pursued and actions launched to ensure gender equality in the media sector and use the outputs of the media for purposes of this equality. The study focuses on media institutions producing what is known as news media and their outputs. Indicators that can be relevant for Turkey were developed in this context. It is considered that the outcome following the presentation of these indicators will contribute to legislation to be developed to ensure gender equality in the field of media. The historical background in this field and exposition of existing shortcomings may also serve as a guide for civil organizations in claiming their rights.

1. International Documents from Historical Perspective

1.1 Brief History of Women's Place in the Media and Role in the Process of Production

The history of the presence of women both actively as content producers and managers and the forms of their representation in media content is also the history of gender inequalities in the media.

Associated with advancements in technology as well as means of communication and transportation, the media became popular along with the Industrial Revolution. Firstly, periodicals in the form of newspapers and journals that we call news media and then electronic publications have served as important means in claiming of rights, libertarian movements and in the search for representation and influence on public opinion of political and opposing organizations. Furthermore, the media also became an instrument of strategic importance in social struggles for its various functions including information flow, awareness building and motivation. The informative and manipulative function of the media was also used extensively in the hands of those holding power to lead and rule over communities and peoples.

Those who hold power (both political and economic power) have strived throughout the history to monopolize the media as well. Others who consider media as one of the important elements of democracy, on the other hand, have waged their struggle to have the media as a means of obtaining impartial and objective knowledge of the world by using such concepts

as the right to information and knowledge, freedom of expression and press. Then there was a range of universal legal arrangements introducing safeguards for democracy and plurality by protecting the freedom of expression and press and the right to communication. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) prepared by the United Nations (UN) is one of the most important documents in this regard. It was followed, in the continent of Europe, by arrangements in legislation pertaining to this right and freedom.

However, the achievement in freedom of press and expression and the right to communication was not enough by itself. Free press had to respond to the demands and expectations of those who were subject to discrimination and hate speech, who were “otherized”, not represented at all or represented in ways that were not equal and fair. The commercial character of the press, its existence in a competitive market and sexist policies that shaped their content made it difficult to realize these demands and expectations. It was indeed the publication market that anti-discriminatory and rights-based movements met a rather strong resistance.

Like all other political movements, the first wave of women’s movement upholding demands of equality and rights needed means of mass media, particularly newspapers and periodicals that were the major means of that time to make its voice heard. When the movement realized that it would be difficult to find space in existing means they launched their own publications. These publications with their manifesto-like content concentrated on issues such as equal pay for equal work, right to elect and be elected and representation in public sphere. In cases where women’s movement was merged with class struggle the struggle for rights waged by socialist feminists time to time took the form of underground press activities. As different from the first, the second and third waves of feminism could make its voice heard more in the media. As demands of equality and freedom changed their places, the women’s movement represented in the mainstream media content through a critical approach started to give more weight to its own publications. Periodicals became a component of women’s movement throughout the world.

Struggling for equality in employment policies of the media, in production of content and representation in the media, women are now much stronger and have made many achievements. However, the competitive structure mentioned above and the sexist tradition in the sector still remains as barriers to what can be further achieved. Indeed, media monitoring carried out by CSOs point out that the sexist and discriminatory structure is still dominant.

1.2 International Documents in the Process of Setting Norms and Standards

The search for freedom in the media basically proceeded on the basis of freedom of press and expression. One fundamental document in this respect is the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Additionally, there are also international documents at the level of the Council of Europe and European Union (EU). Freedom of expression is recognized as a fundamental human right in these documents. The main motivation while discussing the freedom of press is to ensure that the media, the means of mass communication is not taken under the control of the state or any interest group. Ensuring the plurality of voices is the second aim that follows. This struggle as a whole is based on the right of the public to be informed. However, any arrangement

related to Gender Equality (GE) in the media has yet not made itself to any universal or local convention, treaty, declaration, etc. This can be explained by the fact that the recognition of gender equality itself is a relatively new phenomenon at international level.

Arrangements related to the relationship between GE and the media are mostly embedded in international conventions that Turkey is also a State Party to. Direct references to this relationship in domestic legislation and documents are yet new and remain limited, and mostly in the context of violence against women. It is yet quite difficult to speak about the existence of wide awareness in such issues as prevalent cases of discrimination, representation crisis, otherization and hate speech. Meanwhile demands of rights and equality of women employed in the media are not subject to any special arrangement. Struggle for employment and related rights can be waged only with reference to more comprehensive texts.

1.3 United Nations (UN)

Universal Declaration of Human Rights

As the most important of all human rights documents the Universal Declaration of Human Rights was prepared by the (UN) whose charter of establishment dates back to 1945. The principles of equality and non-discrimination, respect for human rights and freedoms are included in this charter. States Parties undertake to adopt these principles, align their domestic law with these, and to contribute to their international adoption. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights was adopted by the UN General Assembly in 1948. Its 1st article guarantees equality of sexes in all relevant fields with the statement “all human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights.” It is also provided that all should benefit from their guaranteed rights freely and without any discrimination. However, since this first instrument could not respond fully to demands of women for rights and equality, another instrument, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women comprising these demands was adopted by the UN General Assembly in 1979.

International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

This covenant was adopted by the UN General Assembly in 1966 and took effect in 1976. Article 2 in the Covenant states “The States Parties to the present Covenant undertake to guarantee that the rights enunciated in the present Covenant will be exercised without discrimination of any kind as to race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status.” This provision stresses non-discrimination and the need to implement the convention in domestic law. An apparent stress on gender equality can be found in Article 3. Article 15 which guarantees the right to participate to cultural life makes the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights important in the context of gender equality in the media in that it refers to access to means of mass communication, media literacy skills that will make this access meaningful, the right to express opinions orally and in writing and the right to be informed. Turkey signed the convention in 2000.

Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW)

The Commission on the Status of Women was established in 1947 within the UN economic and Social Council with the mission of eliminating all forms of discrimination against women in all spheres of life. At the second conference taking place in Copenhagen the text of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) was prepared and opened to signing and the convention took effect in 1981 with the signatures of 20 Member States. It is made a binding provision in the CEDAW that inequalities faced by women should be eliminated not only in legislation but in real life as well accompanied by the obligation of the States to give effect to this elimination. The Optional Protocol to the Convention entitles individuals and groups to apply to the CEDAW Committee in cases where states violate the CEDAW. The Convention also covers the right to communication and freedom of expression in the context of its provisions related to the elimination of all forms of discrimination and inequality and fundamental human rights and freedoms. The Optional Protocol was ratified by Turkey on 30 July 2002 and the protocol took effect on 20 January 2003.

Looking from the perspective of relationship between the media and gender, we see that there are some articles in CEDAW that can be associated with the media although specific issues such as representation and the right to communicate are not covered. One of these is the article concerning participation to working life. Others have their content encouraging participation to cultural life:

Article 11: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, the same rights.

Article 11: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of employment in order to ensure, on a basis of equality of men and women, the same rights.

Article 7: States Parties shall take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women in the political and public life of the country and, in particular, shall ensure to women, on equal terms with men.

Article 14: 2/h- The right to enjoy adequate living conditions, particularly in relation to housing, sanitation, electricity and water supply, transport and communications.

Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action

The Declaration and Action Plan was adopted at the Fourth World Conference on Women gathering in Beijing in 1995 and approved at the 16th session of the UN General Assembly on 15 September 1995. The Beijing Declaration obliges States Parties to take measures to empower women, promote equality between women and men and impart gender perspective to policies and programmes and envisages the implementation of the Platform for Action. The Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action call on governments to launch strategic actions in 12 critical areas; and for the first time in the Beijing Declaration Platform for Action, the media was described as a strategic area. As different from earlier documents, this Declaration stresses the need for media that women can take their positions in decision-making and express themselves as a means of supporting the empowerment norm. The declaration has the following sections relevant to the media:

By governments:

- (a) Support women's education, training and employment to promote and ensure women's equal access to all areas and levels of the media;
- (b) Support research into all aspects of women and the media so as to define areas needing attention and action and review existing media policies with a view to integrating a gender perspective;
- (c) Promote women's full and equal participation in the media, including management, programming, education, training and research;
- (d) Aim at gender balance in the appointment of women and men to all advisory, management, regulatory or monitoring bodies, including those connected to the private and State or public media;
- (e) Encourage, to the extent consistent with freedom of expression, these bodies to increase the number of programmes for and by women to see to it that women's needs and concerns are properly addressed;
- (f) Encourage and recognize women's media networks, including electronic networks and other new technologies of communication, as a means for the dissemination of information and the exchange of views, including at the international level, and support women's groups active in all media work and systems of communications to that end;
- (g) Encourage and provide the means or incentives for the creative use of programmes in the national media for the dissemination of information on various cultural forms of indigenous people and the development of social and educational issues in this regard within the framework of national law;
- (h) Guarantee the freedom of the media and its subsequent protection within the framework of national law and encourage, consistent with freedom of expression, the positive involvement of the media in development and social issues.

By national and international media systems:

Develop, consistent with freedom of expression, regulatory mechanisms, including voluntary ones, that promote balanced and diverse portrayals of women by the media and international communication systems and that promote increased participation by women and men in production and decision-making.

1.4 Documents in Europe

European Convention on Human Rights

The European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) adopted by the Council of Europe in 1950 is a document designed to safeguard fundamental human rights and freedoms in Member States. The European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR) ruled that equality between women and men is one of the most fundamental principles enshrined in the European Convention on Human Rights. Turkey ratified the ECHR in 1954. But she recognized the right of individual application to the ECtHR, which is an inseparable part of the Convention, later in 1987, and the jurisdiction of the ECtHR in 1990y.

European Convention on Transfrontier Television

It is an international convention prepared within the framework of Article 10 in the European Convention on Human Rights on the 'right to freedom of receiving and imparting information' and freedom of expression. The objective of the European Convention on Transfrontier Television is to ensure the free circulation of TV broadcasting and to gather States Parties around common principles, procedures and practices in television broadcasting. In general, the Convention considers freedom of expression as one of the underlying principles of a democratic society and also a precondition for the advancement of society and individuals. It

is therefore clear that the European Convention on Transfrontier Television takes the European Convention on Human Rights as its basis. Turkey signed the convention in 1992 and ratified in 1 May 1993.

1.5 Setting Norms

Documents mentioned introduce arrangements on the basis of 4 fundamental norms with respect to our area of investigation:

Equality/gender equality: a) *de jure* equality, b) *de facto* equality, c) transformative equality.

Non-discrimination: a) direct ban on discrimination, b) indirect ban on discrimination, c) adoption of temporary special measures to overcome *de facto* inequalities, d) considering the cases of multiple-discrimination.

Representation

Empowerment

-Equality norm is the basis of all international documents listed above whether binding or of advisory nature. The distance historically covered in the context of human rights rules out even any debate over the principle of equality. In practice, on the other hand, violations of the principle of equality are commonly observed in almost all fields. The texts mentioned envisage equality with respect to race, religion, language, political opinion, social origin and ethnicity as major areas and include gender as well.

Equality is divided into three sub-categories as *de jure* equality (legal equality), equality in difference and transformative equality.

Formal equality De jure equality: It means equality before law. This type of equality which establishes gender identities on the basis of two categories as woman and man does not consider the fact that women face *de facto* inequalities as well. Although it constituted an important step ahead in equality in line with the accomplishments of the first wave feminist movement, it received criticisms in the course of time.

Equality of outcome (de facto equality): In this understanding of equality women and men are again equal before law; but it differs from the first one by not regarding both sexes as the same. It again operates over a dual categorization; it considers inequalities deriving from patriarchy and regards policies for improvements in this respect as compulsory. However, this improvement does not entail any transformative leap; it tries to improve situations through such mechanisms as positive discrimination and quota allocation that protect and place women in more advantageous positions.

Transformative equality: This concept of equality developed the thesis that there can be no real equality between sexes unless there is radical transformation in social structure and power mechanisms. It holds that although external support and interventions may temporarily and superficially settle the problem of gender inequality, final and definitive solution lies in transformation of norms.

-Non-discrimination norm defines the situation of equal treatment of each individual who is different than others (and even equal treatment of human beings and other living entities). Non-discrimination has several dimensions. Direct discrimination proceeds on two categories as women and men, and it is when women are disadvantaged and treated differently and negatively relative to men. In the context of the media, for example, it is an example of direct discrimination when women are not found suited to the profession of journalism in general and as reporters in particular on the assumption that they are sentimental and physically fragile.

Having its place in these two categories, indirect discrimination is a form of discrimination that we can call as gender blind for overlooking unequal power relations between women and men. The presence of de facto discrimination while legislation, state policies, etc. include no discriminatory clause or decision is indirect discrimination. Indirect discrimination is tried to be overcome mostly through positive discrimination and quota allocation to women. However, since the field of media is held and controlled by the private sector with its competitive nature, suggestions and demands for women's quota in the media find no echo in practice.

Multiple-discrimination can be defined as person's subjection to discrimination for more than one reason. For example, women are subject to discrimination due to their biological sex, but beyond this they may also face discrimination as a result of their class; ethnic, cultural, religious or political engagements or the types and severity of violence they face may increase. Multiple-discrimination that LGBTI individuals recently face is also a problem that must be articulated while talking about norms of equality. Having a disability too may lead to practices of discrimination apart from what we have mentioned so far.

Discrimination in the field of media must be taken together with the concept 'representation' within the framework of international documents mentioned above. In other words, non-discrimination in the media means representation devoid of any discrimination with respect to sex, race, sexual orientation, etc. including any stereotyping and also without degrading women.

-The representation norm can be summarized as individual's presence in public sphere freely and equally with his/her identity, to be taken as counterpart, and by enjoying freedom of expression. Moreover, words and acts that may lead to unjust accusations or notoriety about an individual must be avoided and presumption of innocence must not be violated. In this context, women and LGBTI individuals may frequently appear in the mainstream media with negative attributions (crime, victimization, being made sexual object, etc.). This is made possible through topics selected as well as visuals, discourse, language and style used. Recently there are warnings and sanctions concerning discriminatory discourse, shooting angles that are not equalitarian and biased cinematographic styles to prevent the circulation and reproduction of discrimination, prejudices, established values and inequalities. The European Convention on Transfrontier Television, Council of Europe Convention on Cybercrime and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights contain articles that are formulated so as to guarantee equality in representation. Similarly, the Beijing Declaration and CEDAW are international documents serving as a source for the norm on media representation.

-Empowerment norm means women and LGBTI have their opportunities and means to access economic resources and take place in processes of political participation and decision-making. It means they should be able to be visible in public and private spheres, express themselves and own property without any institutional support. Arrangements related to this norm are more recent compared to equality and non-discrimination norms and largely won as a result of struggles waged for rights.

Empowerment in the field of media necessitates the transformation mainstream media content where there is short or negative representation or making gender equality dominant in representation through alternative media activities. Since penetration into mainstream media has always been difficult, equal representation and production of non-discriminatory content through alternative media is accepted as one of the ways of empowerment. In fact, CSOs and other rights-based organizations are engaged in remarkable efforts in this respect. In paragraph (f) of Beijing Declaration under "Actions to be taken by Governments-239" it is stated that women's media networks should be encouraged and recognized.

Access is an extension of the norm of empowerment. Communication technologies and access to content produced/disseminated through these technologies is attached importance in policy documents and relevant arrangements.

The momentum that mobilization in critical media literacy gained with new media literacy coincided with the recognition of the importance of the equality norm in access to the media. Paragraph (a) under item 183 in the Beijing Declaration stresses the importance of education and teaching in women's access to all fields of the media. Similarly, the CEDAW (Art. 14) envisages women's making use of communication services. The "right to participate to cultural life" set by the UN Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights too entails information and skills necessary in accessing to and making use of means of mass communication (cinema, theatre, social media, etc. besides news media). It is possible to find statements in this direction in the European Convention on Transfrontier Television.

In its 2016 report entitled *Gender and Digital Agenda* of the European Institute for Gender Equality (EIGE) which is an autonomous agency within the EU stresses the need to eliminate inequalities between women and men in accessing new communication technologies in particular and points out to the contribution of these technologies to the empowerment of women. Meanwhile Articles 12 and 17 under Chapter III-Prevention in the Istanbul Convention refer to "access to means of communication and women's empowerment through these means."

1.6 Standards

In international documents related to human rights and gender equality, one cannot find in the field of media specific strategies and well-defined standards bringing quantitative criteria unlike the case in other fields. The most important reason is the fact that the media operates in a competitive market largely without any institutional supervision. For instance, women's quota that is developed in the field of political participation does not exist in the media; neither can we find in the field of media those legal obligations that govern the field of health.

Nevertheless, efforts to mainstream gender equality in the field of media as well which flourished starting from the first half of the 20th century found some echo in legal arrangements and human rights documents. Though not in the form of setting standards directly, recommendations, guidelines and reformatory action plans directed to governments, media organizations and CSOs, professionals and rights-based organizations active in the field of media are used in the present study to determine relevant standards and indicators.

Fundamental arrangements required to prevent inequalities in employment and participation to decision-making include measures to eliminate what is called “glass ceiling effect” that invincibly excludes women and LGBTI individuals from top management positions. It is necessary to determine the number of women and men holding management positions in the media and whether there are institutions that adopted measures to eliminate the glass ceiling effect in order to bet relevant standards. The Beijing Declaration has its specific importance in this regard.

The heading 183 in the Beijing Declaration (1995) which is the first international document recognizing the media as a strategic area suggests “women taking their place as decision makers in the media” to ensure gender equality in this field. The following is stated in a related paragraph:

“d) Aiming at gender balance in the appointment of women and men to all advisory, management, regulatory or monitoring bodies, including those connected to the private and State or public media.”

The arrangement related to national and international media systems underlines a similar issue. It is considered that participation to decision-making processes will contribute to giving full effect to non-discrimination:

“d) Encourage the participation of women in the development of professional guidelines and codes of conduct or other appropriate self-regulatory mechanisms to promote balanced and non-stereotyped portrayals of women by the media.”

Beijing Declaration Strategy of Cooperating with National Machinery:

By the media, non-governmental organizations and the private sector, in collaboration, as appropriate, with national machinery for the advancement of women:

- (a)** Promote the equal sharing of family responsibilities through media campaigns that emphasize gender equality and non-stereotyped gender roles of women and men within the family and that disseminate information aimed at eliminating spousal and child abuse and all forms of violence against women, including domestic violence;
- (b)** Produce and/or disseminate media materials on women leaders, inter alia, as leaders who bring to their positions of leadership many different life experiences, including but not limited to their experiences in balancing work and family responsibilities, as mothers, as professionals, as managers and as entrepreneurs, to provide role models, particularly to young women;

- (c) Promote extensive campaigns, making use of public and private educational programmes, to disseminate information about and increase awareness of the human rights of women;
- (d) Support the development of and finance, as appropriate, alternative media and the use of all means of communication to disseminate information to and about women and their concerns;
- (e) Develop approaches and train experts to apply gender analysis with regard to media programmes

Supporting the empowerment norm, access to the media, content production and alternative broadcasting are also among important strategies envisaged by the declaration. Heading 183 foresees the development of a strategy in this regard:

- (a) Support women's education, training and employment to promote and ensure women's equal access to all areas and levels of the media;
- (e) Encourage, to the extent consistent with freedom of expression, these bodies to increase the number of programmes for and by women to see to it that women's needs and concerns are properly addressed;
- (f) Encourage and recognize women's media networks as a means for the dissemination of information and the exchange of views, including at the international level, and support women's groups active in all media work and systems of communications to that end.

To see whether these strategies are actually translated into life, it is necessary to find the proportion of women and men who can access the media, gender distribution of media literacy, number of institutions developing and supporting alternative media practices, and number of women and men benefiting from training in alternative media.

European Convention on Transfrontier Television

This Convention dated 1992 underlines the importance of non-discriminatory media content respectful to human dignity and discouraging violence and hatred in mainstreaming gender equality. European Convention on Transfrontier Television aims to adopt measures and develop strategies so as to prevent negative representations of content. With this aim, the Convention introduces obligations to States Parties to establish institutional supervision mechanisms (like RTÜK in Turkey) and to build awareness in viewers (like media literacy courses and campaigns in Turkey).

Chapter 2, Article 7:

All items of programme services, as concerns their presentation and content, shall respect the dignity of the human being and the fundamental rights of others. In particular, they shall not:

- a) be indecent and in particular contain pornography;
- b) give undue prominence to violence or be likely to incite to racial hatred.

States Parties to the Convention are required to establish mechanisms to supervise television

broadcasting with respect to negative content encouraging discrimination, and imposing sanctions when there are breaches.

The use of the system of 'smart symbols' warning viewers against discrimination and protecting children in particular is compulsory. These symbols should appear on screen before broadcasting and contain warnings related to existing negative elements in content.

There will be media trainings for viewers to notice discriminatory content encouraging violence, to be able to use alternative media, and to develop content.

To determine whether news features in television are sensitive to gender equality it is necessary to conduct content analysis relating to the presence of men and women in news content in comparative terms and whether news are presented in compliance with gender equality and non-discrimination. The same is applicable to periodicals.

Good Example

Global Media Monitoring Project (GMMP)

It is a Swedish origin institution starting its monitoring activities in 1995 which are carried out in every five years. It is the institution covering the issue of women's representation in the media in most comprehensive way. Its work headed "Who makes the news?" is important. According to this study only 37% of correspondents involved in making news are women. 57% of those standing before camera are women. Reports by the GMPP show that while 41% of material overviewed is about women, only 3% is related to gender equality or discrimination and 4% is about stories against sexist prejudices.

II. Present State of Gender Equality in Turkish Media

In Turkey there are no directives and official institutions directly regulating and monitoring the field of media and gender. Efforts to regulate, monitor and improve the relationship between the media and gender mainly come from CSOs working on women's emancipation and communities within universities whose influence and publicity are both weak. There are two exceptions: The Turkish Society of Journalists and the Turkish Union of Journalists. The Women and LGBTI Commission of the latter is sensitive to issues related to media and gender equality and discrimination and engages in monitoring in these issues though somewhat limited.

Besides these we can also mention public spots and campaigns launched through the media geared to building awareness in violence against women and protecting women's well-being. Recent initiatives to build awareness related to discriminatory and violent social media content as well as efforts in improving media literacy including those targeting the public at large and compulsory courses in schools are promising developments. In general, there are limited provisions that address the relationship between gender and the media in national and international instruments with binding character. Nevertheless, embedded in these texts we observe some suggestions and necessities instrumentalizing the media. These envisage making use of the media in building awareness and educating the public against discrimination, violation of rights and violence. As for employment, the principle of equality envisaged by conventions and legislation on women's employment is found inapplicable in this field as a result of the ideology of the profession of journalism. Difficulties in working conditions of journalists and wide acceptance by society of traditional roles attributed to women deem women's employment and the principle of 'equal pay for equal work' inapplicable in this sector as different from many other professions. It is impossible to speak about women's quota in media organizations even if there are some pressures to this effect by CSOs.

This issue is covered under various headings in domestic legislation and in action plans developed on the basis of international conventions and international conventions. It is possible to speak about two main reasons for the weakness of the principle of gender equality in the media: The media being a part of competitive practices of the private sector immediately after the end of state monopoly and the absence of media monitoring organizations strong enough to function as a pressure group.

It will be appropriate to address the legislation in Turkey related directly or indirectly to the media starting with the **Constitution**. The Constitutional Article 10 provides that "Everyone is equal before the law without distinction as to language, race, colour, sex, political opinion, philosophical belief, religion and sect, or any such grounds." Following this general provision, Article 28 introduces more specific arrangements related to press including freedom of

press, right of reply and correction, protection of instruments of press and periodical and non-periodical publications. These articles do not contain any provision related to gender inequality and women's employment or representation in the media.

Law on the Protection of Family and Prevention of Violence against Women

The Istanbul Convention adopted in 2012 again provides indirectly for the relationship between gender and the media. Chapter II of the Convention headed "Prevention" suggests the use of the media for the purpose of building awareness against violence and inequalities. It is also stated that media literacy should be promoted to build sensitivity in and prevent violence against women and children. The Law No. 6284 on the Protection of Family and Prevention of Violence against Women obliges parties to allocate at least 90 minutes in radio and television to programmes building awareness in these issues and publicizing related measures adopted by the state.

Law on the Protection of Family and Prevention of Violence against Women Relevant Article

Article 16/3: Along with Turkish Radio and Television Corporation, the private radios and television channels broadcasting national, regional and locally have to broadcast informative materials, at least 90 minutes each month, on the integration of women into the work life, the mechanisms and policies to fight against the violence especially related with children and women which are all prepared by the ministry (Ministry of Family) or prepared by other agencies with the consent of the ministry. These materials are broadcast between 0800 and 2200 o'clock including at least 30 minutes broadcasting between 1700 and 2200 o'clock and the copies of these broadcasts are submitted monthly to Supreme Board of Radio and Television. Any broadcast before or after these hours are not considered within the monthly 90 minute timeframe. These hours are inspected by the Supreme Board of Radio and Television. Informative materials to be broadcast on TVs and radios are prepared by the units of the Ministry with the opinions of universities, related vocational organizations and NGOs.

Law on the Establishment of Radio and Television Enterprises and their Media Services

The Law No. 6112 on the Establishment of Radio and Television Enterprises and their Media Services was adopted on 15 February 2011 and the law took effect upon its publication in Official Gazette dated 3 March 2011. Upon the enactment of this law, the Law No. 3984 dated 1994 on Radio and Television Broadcasting was repealed. The Law no. 6112 presently in effect has 12 chapters and consists of 48 articles. The law also contains 8 provisional articles.

It is stated in Article 8/1 under chapter 3 related to principles to be observed in media services that: *"(Media services) shall not incite the society to hatred and hostility by making discrimination on the grounds of race, language, religion, sex, class, region and sect or shall not constitute feelings of hatred in the society."* This article prohibits any polarization on the basis of sex. However, no consideration of and arrangement related to different sexual identities exist. It is stressed in paragraph (s) that "programmes running counter to gender equality, encouraging pressures over and abusing women shall not be allowed." However, the preference of 'pressure' in place of 'violence' and absence of detail as psychological or physical is questionable. In this regard it can be said that the law addresses the issue of gender equality only in general terms.

There is no gender-related provision in the first version of the **Press Law** dated 1950. Article 19 in the Press Law No. 5187 that amended the first one in 2014 considers the "encouragement of sexual assault, homicide and suicide" as offence. This article can be considered as an initiative to

establish ethical codes in presenting news about violence against women. Article 20 states the following: "Those who publish articles and images which can encourage sexual assault, murder or suicide beyond the limits of furnishing information on such activities shall be sentenced to pay a major fine ranging from 1 billion to 20 billion TL. This fine cannot total less than 2 billion TL for regional periodicals and 10 billion TL for nationwide periodicals."

Turkish Radio and Television Law

It is actually a legal text related to the area we are examining, but without any emphasis on GE. Rather it is a text providing for the working of the institution, its units, financial structure, personnel, duties and responsibilities. It also covers issues such as news concerning political parties, government statements and the right of reply.

Regulation on Principles and Procedures in Broadcasting Services

It is the relevant regulation that determines how the law on broadcasting will work and it is included in the RTÜK legislation. Data related to the thematic area we are examining are organized within the framework of principles of broadcasting services. As is the case in almost all legislation/regulation texts it is stated in general terms at the beginning discrimination on any ground is prohibited:

Article 8: b) "(Media services) shall not incite the society to hatred and hostility by making discrimination on the grounds of race, language, religion, sex, class, region and sect or shall not constitute feelings of hatred in the society."

- e) shall not include or promote broadcasts which make discrimination on the basis of race, colour, language, religion, nationality, sex, disablement, political and philosophical opinion, sect and any such considerations and degrade individuals."

Additionally, it prohibits sexist content and representation as sexual commodity:

- n) "Shall not be obscene". Media services shall avoid the exploitation sexual feelings; portrayal of individuals as sexual commodity; reduction of human body to element of sexual incitation; obscene discourse and acts that cannot be considered as normal in public; erosion of feelings of shame; incitement and abuse of sexual desires.

The same article (8) also contains direct emphasis on gender equality:

- s) shall not contain any programmes against the gender equality, encouraging the oppression over and exploitation of women and encourage the use of customs as a means of pressure on women.

Similar statements can also be found in Article 9 on commercial communication in media services:

- b) shall not include or encourage any discrimination based on sex, race, colour or ethnic origin, nationality, religion, philosophical belief or political opinion, disablement, age and any other issues.
- d) Shall not exploit women. Woman's body should not be used as sexual commodity in products, services or images promoted.

Principles and Procedures in Applying Smart Signs

It is a text showing how to use the system of smart signs or instructions for practice. Hence it does not contain expressions related directly to our work. Nevertheless, the system is important since there are questions in the coding system related to violence, sexuality and discrimination.

Ethical Rules in Broadcasting

As the first in Turkey in the field of radio and television broadcasting, the Ethical Rules in Broadcasting was signed on 3 July 2007 by media organizations. The Rules include the following provisions:

- Respect for human dignity, fundamental rights and freedoms,
- Reflecting events and cases correctly, impartially and fully in the context of freedom of expression and right to be informed,
- Avoidance of using broadcasting for illegitimate purposes and interests,
- Attaching importance to the protection of plurality and cultural diversity,
- Avoidance of discrimination, degradation and prejudices on the basis of race, colour, language, faith and gender,
- Respect for the right of persons and institutions to reply and make corrections,
- Adopting conventional wisdom in the face of events that may lead to public fear and indignation,
- Avoiding encouragement and legitimization of violence,
- Respect for private life and confidentiality,
- Being sensitive to problems of women and avoiding their commodification,
- Being attentive to protecting children and youth from inappropriate content,
- Attaching importance to needs, likes and sensitivities of viewers and audience.

Legislation Relating to the General Directorate of Anatolian News Agency

The principles adopted by the Anatolian News Agency (AA) established in 1920 as a state agency are important in the context of our examination:

1. In cases of war, conflict, terror, violence and disaster, pays due regard to universal human rights, national security and public order and acts responsibly while responding to the right of the public to receive information.
2. Refuses any media policy that encourages violence, terror, ethnic discrimination or incites hatred and enmity on the basis of class, race, language, faith, sex or region.
3. Avoids any approach or news policy that instigates hatred and leads to fear, enmity, chaos and panic.
4. Takes care that its news policy is devoid of any content encouraging discrimination and violence, spreading fear in a way to lead to traumas, undermining the principles of equality and justice and degrading human dignity.

Social media policies of the Agency constitute another heading:

- In social media sharing there must be no place for content running counter to the principles of the AA; no statement, sound and visuals or confidential information or documents that degrade, humiliate or target any person, institution, faith, race, sex and culture.
- Social media sharing cannot be an instrument in encouraging violence and discrimination, spreading fear in a way to lead to traumas and undermining the principles of equality and justice.

Circular on Measures to be Adopted to Prevent Violence against Women and Honour Killings

The “Circular on Measures to be Adopted to Prevent Violence against Women and Honour Killings” which took effect upon its publication in the Official Gazette No. 26218 dated 4 July 2006 is a quite extensive document obliging all ministries and public organizations as well all (public, private, national, regional or local) media organizations, information services, news agencies and professional organizations of the press to perform their duties in preventing violence against women.

Under the circular, all organizations, agencies and units mentioned above have to submit “quarterly detailed report of activities” to the coordinating agency (Social Services and Child Protection Agency [SHÇEK] or General Directorate on the Status of Women [KSGM]) giving information about what they have done and planning to do as efforts in preventing violence against women and honour killings.

Circular on Violence against Women, Part D (1)

“**Article 4** (d) in the Law No. 3984 on the Establishment of Radio and Television Enterprises and their Broadcasting prohibits humiliating or insulting persons on the basis of their sex or other characteristics and paragraph (u) under the same article establishes that violence and discrimination against women should not be encouraged.”

In parts (B) and (C) of the Circular the media is considered among organizations to be cooperated with the following is envisaged for a “systematic transformation in mentality”: Adoption of a discourse in textbooks, daily conversation, visual and printed press, movies, academic studies and religious preaching that points of to negative consequences of traditional gender roles and stereotypes and male dominant mentality in social life and relations.

“There must be training programmes to identify, demonstrate and change harmful traditions and customs in the context of violence against women.”

“Spot films must be produced on violence against women and these films must be shown through national, regional and local media under a nationwide campaign.”

“The issue of violence against women must be covered by curricula in communication education as well like the case in other undergraduate education and in-service training programmes.”

“To prevent honour killings, informative spot films must be produced and shown in the media in frequent intervals.”

Work by the Ministry of Family and Social Policies

Law on the Protection of Family and Prevention of Violence against Women

Along with TRT, the private radios and television channels broadcasting national, regional and locally have to broadcast informative materials, at least 90 minutes each month, on the integration of women into the work life, the mechanisms and policies to fight against the violence especially related with children and women which are all prepared by the ministry or prepared by other agencies with the consent of the ministry. At least 30 minutes of this broadcasting should take place between 17:00 and 22:00 hours o'clock and the copies of these broadcasts are submitted monthly to Supreme Board of Radio and Television. Any broadcast before or after these hours are not considered within the monthly 90 minute timeframe. Informative materials to be broadcast on TVs and radios are prepared by the units of the Ministry with the opinions of universities, related vocational organizations and NGOs.

Work by the Commission on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men

Report by the Parliamentary Commission on Investigating the Causes of Violence against Women and Identification of Measures to be Adopted- Part on Education

1. There must be training in ethics for media professionals at all levels.
2. The number of training sessions in gender equality and violence against women targeting local media employees must be increased and these sessions must be organized countrywide.
3. Training events must be organized and conducted in gender equality, violence against women and the media for all public organizations.
4. Courses in "gender equality" must be made compulsory in higher education institutions in communication sciences.
5. The number of gender and media workshops for students in communication schools must be increased and these workshops must be organized countrywide.

Report by the Parliamentary Commission on Investigating the Causes of Violence against Women and Identification of Measures to be Adopted Part on Media Literacy

6. For adult women and girls, there must be courses in digital literacy to promote computer literacy and practices of utilization and to eliminate inequalities in this area, and courses in media literacy for all citizens to promote the understanding of gender equality.
7. The full content of the course in media literacy must be made sensitive to gender equality. The course must be delivered by graduates of communication schools with necessary formation accompanied by workshops on gender equality for teachers delivering this course. In courses, mechanisms of complaint to RTÜK must be covered and self-control mechanisms must be treated in more detail.

Turkish Society of Journalists

The Turkish Society of Journalists (TGC) established to protect the rights and freedom of and to establish ethical rules for journalists in Turkey adopts the Declaration of Rights and Responsibilities dated 1998 as its fundamental text in its activities. Article 3 under heading (E) in the declaration states the following: "The journalist defends universal values of humanity, plurality and respect to differences including peace, democracy and human rights in the first place. The journalist recognizes the rights and dignity of all nations, peoples and individuals without any discrimination with respect to nationality, races, ethnicity, sex, language, religion, class and philosophical opinion. The journalist avoids publications instigating hatred and enmity among peoples, communities and nations (...) The journalist never engages in any publication provoking or justifying violence in any form."

Since 2000s, the society is working in a more sensitive and active way on such issues as gender equality, women's representation in the media and rights of women media workers. The society has its women's commission. The link to "Women and the Media: A Guide to Gender Equality Sensitive Reporting" is available on the main page of its website.¹

In sum, the guide tells about cases of discrimination and violence faced by women journalists in their sector by giving specific examples sets the following main objectives for the association:

Making news discourse equalitarian,

Ensuring sensitivity to gender equality in journalism,

Giving place to women in news not as victims, offenders or elements of magazine but with their identities and accomplishments,

Developing a system to spot cases of mobbing,

Clearing the way of women to top management positions.

Turkish Union of Journalists

Of all professional organizations, the Turkish Union of Journalists (TGS) has its important place in addressing the problems of LGBTI individuals together with those of women besides its active presence in the field of gender equality. The term 'gender identity' was included in the Bylaw of the Union in 2013. In ordinary General Assembly meeting of the Union held in the same year, equal representation of women was ensured and, upon the initiative of the Women's Commission, the TGS became the first trade union taking step against discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation and identity. The second paragraph of Article 2 of the Bylaw headed "Objective of the Union" was amended as follows:

"The TGS works to ensure the unity of workers in line with class consciousness and interests of labour without any discrimination on the basis of language, faith, sect, race, colour, sexual identity and orientation, philosophical view or political opinion (...) For building a democracy founded on equality of women and men, the union upholds the principle of equality of sexes at home and in all fields of working life, in enterprises where it is organized, in internal working of the union, union management and activities and in collective bargaining processes."

The following was added to Article 3 in the Bylaw headed "Authority and Activities":

"Working for the elimination of child labour; making efforts to bring solution to the problems of women, young, elderly, migrant and LGBTI workers; adopting positive discrimination measures and ensuring their implementation to solve the problems of these workers discriminated against; conducting scientific studies on specific problems of workers discriminated against (women, youth, elderly workers, workers with disabilities, migrant workers; LGBTI individuals) and establishing relevant commissions for these studies."

Beyond these, the TGS is the second union including the principle "woman's statement is the basis" in its bylaw.

¹ <https://tgc.org.tr/bildirgeler/cinsiyet-esitlikci-haber-kilavuzu.html>

The union has its women and LGBTI commissions. There is the link “Women-LGBTI” on its official website. In this link one can find a range of events including threats to women journalists, imprisonment and legal suits and a booklet titled “Targeted Journalists/What Women Journalists Working in Conflict Zones Tell” (TGS Publication, March 2016). The latter is the first and single study by a professional organization covering the problems faced by women journalists in the South-eastern region. Interviews conducted with 10 women journalists point out to incidences of harassment, violence and discrimination that women journalists faced due to their sex. Journalists tell about their psychological problems arising from cases of violence, how they are blocked from performing their profession and cases of arrest and legal suit.

Table 1: Breakdown of Legislation on the Basis of Related Norms

Legislation	Related Article	Text of Related Article	Related norm
1982 Constitution of the Republic of Turkey	Art. 10	Everyone is equal before the law without distinction as to language, race, colour, sex, political opinion, philosophical belief, religion and sect, or any such grounds. (Paragraph added on May 7, 2004; Act No. 5170) Men and women have equal rights. The State has the obligation to ensure that this equality exists in practice. (Sentence added on September 12, 2010; Act No. 5982) Measures taken for this purpose shall not be interpreted as contrary to the principle of equality. No privilege shall be granted to any individual, family, group or class. State organs and administrative authorities are obliged to act in compliance with the principle of equality before the law in all their proceedings	Equality: <i>De jure</i> equality Transformative equality De facto equality: Temporary special measures Obligation of the State to implement the norm of equality
Law on the Protection of Family and Prevention of Violence against Women	Art. 16/3	Article 16/3: Along with Turkish Radio and Television Corporation, the private radios and television channels broadcasting national, regional and locally have to broadcast informative materials, at least 90 minutes each month, on the integration of women into the work life, the mechanisms and policies to fight against the violence especially related with children and women which are all prepared by the ministry (Ministry of Family) or prepared by other agencies with the consent of the ministry. These materials are broadcast between 0800 and 2200 o'clock including at least 30 minutes broadcasting between 1700 and 2200o'clock and the copies of these broadcasts are submitted monthly to Supreme Board of Radio and Television. Any broadcast before or after these hours are not considered within the monthly 90 minute timeframe. These hours are inspected by the Supreme Board of Radio and Television. Informative materials to be broadcast on TVs and radios are prepared by the units of the Ministry with the opinions of universities, related vocational organizations and NGOs.	Equality norm De facto equality Transformative equality Non-discrimination norm Empowerment norm

Legislation	Related Article	Text of Related Article	Related norm
Law on the Establishment and Broadcasting of Radio and Television	Art. 8/1	<p>b) (Media services) shall not incite the society to hatred and hostility by making discrimination on the grounds of race, language, religion, sex, class, region and sect or shall not constitute feelings of hatred in the society.</p> <p>This article also states that there should be no polarization on the basis of gender.</p> <p>ç) shall not be contrary to human dignity and the principle of respect to privacy, shall not include disgracing, degrading or defamatory expressions against persons or organizations beyond the limits of criticism.</p> <p>e) shall not include or promote broadcasts which make discrimination on the basis of race, colour, language, religion, nationality, sex, disablement, political and philosophical opinion, sect and any such considerations and degrade individuals.</p>	Non-discrimination norm
Regulation on Principles and Procedures in Broadcasting Services	Art. 8 Art. 9	<p>b) shall not incite the society to hatred and hostility by making discrimination on the grounds of race, language, religion, sex, class, region and sect or shall not constitute feelings of hatred in the society.</p> <p>e) shall not include or promote broadcasts which make discrimination on the basis of race, colour, language, religion, nationality, sex, disablement, political and philosophical opinion, sect and any such considerations and degrade individuals.</p> <p>n) shall not be obscene. Media services shall avoid the following: Exploitation sexual feelings; portrayal of individuals as sexual commodity; reduction of human body to element of sexual incitation; obscene discourse and acts that cannot be considered as normal in public; erosion of feelings of shame; incitement and abuse of sexual desires.</p> <p>The same article (8) also has its direct emphasis on gender inequality:</p> <p>s) shall not contain any programmes against the gender equality, encouraging the oppression over and exploitation of women. There must be no encouragement of customs to be used as a means of oppression of women.</p> <p>Article 9b) shall not include or encourage any discrimination based on sex, race, colour or ethnic origin, nationality, religion, philosophical belief or political opinion, disablement, age and any other issues.</p> <p>Article 9 d) shall not exploit women. Woman's body should not be used as sexual commodity in products, services or images promoted.</p>	Non-discrimination norm Equality norm

Legislation	Related Article	Text of Related Article	Related norm
Circular on Measures to be Adopted to Prevent Violence against Women and Honour Killings	Law no. 3984, Art.4.	<p>“For a systematic transformation in mentality, a discourse must be developed in textbooks, daily talk, visual and printed media, films, academic studies and religious preaching that stress negative consequences of traditional gender roles and stereotypes and male dominant social formation.”</p> <p>“There must be education-training programmes to identify harmful traditions and customs in the context of violence against women and to transform associated forms of attitude and behaviour.”</p> <p>“Spot films on violence against women must be produced and shown in national, regional and local media in the context of a national campaign.”</p> <p>“The issue of violence against women must be covered by education programmes in communication as in graduate and in-service education programmes.”</p> <p>“In preventing honour killings, informative spot films should be produced and frequently shown in visual media.”</p>	Non-discrimination norm Representation Media as a means for awareness building
Circular on Measures to be Adopted to Prevent Violence against Women and Honour Killings	Law no. 3984, Art.33	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Efforts in building media awareness and creating conscious media followers (i.e. parents in the first place). - In line with the EU acquis, ensuring that media institutions set up their own self-control units and establish principles of responsible broadcasting. - Having broadcasting channels establish their ethical codes to ensure the absence of gender discrimination, child abuse, violence, pornography, and any discourse or stereotype degrading women. - Bringing to the fore and broadcasting in prime time those programmes that focus on home-based working women and give information that will help the social transformation of women. - Replacing programmes discontinued by RTÜK by substitute programmes that are educative and with messages against violence. - Ensuring that media workers involved in various phases of production, including producers and directors in the first place, receive training in gender equality to enhance their sensitivity against violence. - Conducting studies, which are presently missing, on the impact of the media on eliminating or consolidating violence against women and children. - Eliminating sexism and ensuring equality in decision-making mechanisms in the media. - Having CSOs launch their media monitoring groups and ensuring that the media is monitored daily accompanied by auto-control measures. 	Non-discrimination norm Representation Media as a means for awareness building Empowerment norm Equality norm

III. Mapping Relevant Policies: Checking The Compliance of Policy Documents with Human Rights Documents

Table 2: Monitoring Public Institutions and Organizations

Central Level Public Institution /Title of Policy Document	Date	Gender Equality		Not included
		Yes	No	
Ministry of Family and Social Policies				
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Strategic Plan				✓
Action Plan				✓
ASPB-KSGM				
Gender Equality National Action Plan 2008-2013	2008	✓		
Ministry of Transportation, Maritime Affairs and Communication				✓
TRT				✓
RTÜK		✓		
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
YÖK		✓		
Information Technologies Institution				✓
AA				✓
BYEGM (Prime Ministry, General Directorate of Press and Information)				✓
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
Ministry of Culture				
Mission			✓	
Vision			✓	
KEFEK				
Mission		✓		
Vision		✓		
Strategic Plan				✓

Table 3: Monitoring Report for Women's and GE-Based Organizations

CSO	Rights-Based Monitoring		Monitoring Report	Year	Content	Inclusion of Multiple Discrimination and LGBTI **	
	Yes	No				Yes	No
Women's Human Rights New Solutions Association	✓		CEDAW 4th and 5th Period Combined Shadow Report on Turkey	2005	CEDAW's General Monitoring	✓	
IPS Communication Foundation Independent Communication Network	✓		Masculine Violence Tally	2008		✓	
IPS Communication Foundation Independent Communication Network	✓		Monitoring on the Basis of Rights Reporting	2005		✓	

Table 4: LGBTI Organizations Monitoring Report

CSO	Rights-Based Monitoring		Monitoring Report	Year	Content	Inclusion of Multiple Discrimination and LGBTI **	
	Yes	No				Yes	No
Kaos Gay and Lesbian Cultural Research and Solidarity Association (Kaos GL)	✓		Non-Discrimination and Report by the Human Rights and Equality Institution of Turkey (TIHEK)	2017	About TIHEK Law	✓	

IV. Composite Indexes in The Field of Gender Equality, Data Sources and Indicators Provided by International Organizations

Monitoring GE with various mixed indicators is important in terms of standards of working with data related to follow-up, accountability and gender inequality. Further, these mixed indicators also guide political decision-makers as well as civil society organizations. This part of the study covers international indexes related to GE in a multi-dimensional way, in other words covering sub-indicators as well.

The UN is the leading international organization developing indexes related to various spheres of social life through various programmes. At global level, a comprehensive set of indicators on countries' level of **human development** is prepared by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and published in "Human Development Report." The ranking in terms of human development index (HDI) covers the dimensions of long and healthy life, state of being informed and living standards. The **sub-indicators** include, adult literacy, rate of school enrolment, purchasing power, etc. As of 2015, Turkey's human development score (HDI) is stated as 0.767. As can be followed in the table given below Turkey stands among countries in the category of high human development. Of 188 countries in the list Turkey ranks as 71st.

Another index presented by the UN is the **Gender Inequality Index (GII)**. This index covers as **dimensions** reproductive health, empowerment and labour market while including maternal mortality and adolescent birth rates, proportion of women and men in the parliament, proportion of women and men with at least secondary school education and labour force participation of women and men as **sub-indicators**. Calculated first in 2010, Turkey ranked 69th among 159 countries with her GII value of 0.328. The table below shows the ranking of countries again on the basis of 2015 data. Countries included in the table are the same so as to make HDI and GII comparison possible.

Another set of indicators that must be considered is published by the World Economic Forum (WEF); its *Global Gender Gap Report* is being published since 2006. The report addresses the issue of **gender inequality** in terms of such dimensions as economic participation, education, survival, health and political empowerment. **Sub-indicators** used in the report include labour force participation, comparison of pay to women and men for the same work, and employment of women/men in some professional and technical branches. The 2017 report points out that Turkey lost one step and ranked 131st. according to the report covering 144 countries, Iceland stands out as the country with minimum gender gap. Turkey was at the bottom of the list in 2015 (115 countries) and 130th in 2016 (144 countries).

The **gender inequality index** by the EU covers **dimensions** like employment, money, health,

violence and power. The index is prepared by the EIGE. The EIGE is EU's gender equality information centre providing data and expertise in gender equality in Europe to decision-making bodies and relevant organizations. The **sub-indicators** of the index cover various areas including participation, segregation, monetary sources, educational achievement, age, ethnicity, religion, sexual orientation, direct and/or indirect violence. It has its limits since it covers 27 EU member countries. Nevertheless, it is still important in demonstrating progress and/or decline. Indicators related to Turkey do not exist in this index since Turkey is not a member country.

There is no index specifically developed for the field of media. Still, there are GE related statistics released by international organizations also covering the thematic area of media. Below, there is first some major statistics related to GE followed by those on the media.

Gender Statistics published by the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) provide information about gender inequalities in a range of areas including education, employment, enterprising, health and development. There is no data directly related to the thematic area of media, but some data related to employment are also valid for the media industry. These are pay gap by gender, participation to employment by gender, share in total employment of managers by gender, executive board membership by gender in largest publicly-held companies and distribution of employment by sectors and gender.

World Bank's (WB) Gender Statistics contain gender-disaggregated data in such areas as demographics, education, health, and access to economic opportunities, public life and decision-making mechanisms.

Statistics at international level on gender inequality in the media can be reached mainly on the basis data supplied by professional organizations and trade unions. The International Federation of Journalists (IFJ) is one of the organizations releasing gender inequalities in the media under "gender inequality portal". According to information given in this portal over half of women working in the media face sexual harassment in their workplaces and close to a half suffer physical violence. According to IFJ data, 65% of women working in the media experience oppression, threats and harassment at their workplaces.

The Committee to Protect Journalists (CPJ) is another organization releasing data on gender inequality in the media in the context of violence against women. There is an interesting data in the study of the Committee dated February 2015. 95% of journalists participating to the survey state that harassments and threats they face take place mostly through the internet.

Table 5: List of Related Indexes

Index	Produced by	Data Source	Components	Period of updating
Gender Equality Index (GEI)	HDR, UNDP	UNDESA UIS World Bank, ILO	Long and healthy life	Bi-annual
			Education	Annual
			Living standard	Annual
Global Gender Gap Index	WEF	ILO, KILM WEF, UIS, CIA World Factbook WHO, IPU, IPI WEF	Economic participation and opportunities, Education, health and political empowerment	Annual
Human Development Index	UN		Healthy life, information, living standard, adult literacy rate, school enrolment rate and purchasing power	Annual
Gender Inequality Index (GII)	HDR, UNDP	UN, IAEG UNDESA, IPU UIS, ILO	Reproductive health	Bi-annual
			Empowerment	Annual
			Labour market	Annual

V. Monitoring and Evaluation on the Field of Media

Set of Indicators

Table 6: CEİD Set of Indicators for the Thematic Area Media (Those with Sources of Data)

EQUALITY NORM					
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency	Data Collection Method
Participation to Decision Making Mechanisms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ CEDAW Art. 2 ▪ CEDAW Art. 11 ▪ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Number of women and men in positions of managing editor, editor, news director and representative in the media. ▪ Number of media institutions applying quota to spot and eliminate the effect of glass ceiling. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Institutional documents that set the rules of employment of media institutions. ▪ Annual activity reports of media institutions. ▪ Documents produced by human resources departments of media institutions. ▪ Conducting structured surveys and interviews with employees in the media. ▪ Works and reports by CSOs and research institutions that monitor media institutions. ▪ Bylaws, regulations and reports of professional organizations. ▪ Academic and scientific studies and projects. ▪ Narratives such as memoirs, autobiographies, biographies and diaries. ▪ Outcomes of YÖK's Gender Sensitive University Workshop. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Yearly ▪ Yearly ▪ Monthly ▪ Yearly ▪ Yearly ▪ In the office term of each new management ▪ Triennially ▪ Semi-annually ▪ Quarterly ▪ Yearly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Examination of the web site of the institution or requesting information from human resources department ▪ Examination of the web site of the institution and relevant documents. ▪ Examination of information obtained from human resources departments of institutions. ▪ Interviewing employees by disseminating questionnaires or by conducting structured interviews. ▪ Interviews with CSO staff and workers and going over reports prepared by institutions. ▪ Going over relevant documents by professional organizations. ▪ Screening libraries and archives in universities, research institutions and other similar organizations. ▪ Reading of and taking notes from all or some parts of relevant publications. ▪ Examination of workshop reports.

EQUALITY NORM					
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency	Data Collection Method
Entry to the Profession	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ CEDAW Art. 2, ▪ CEDAW Art. 11, ▪ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Number of women working in the media sector who have lodged complaint about discrimination. ▪ Proportion of women and men working in official institutions active in the field of publishing and in charge of making legislative arrangements in that field. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Annual activity reports of media institutions. Annual activity reports of RTÜK, AA, TRT, BYEGM and BTK ▪ TÜİK statistics. ▪ Statistics by Press Advertisement Agency. ▪ Survey reports by professional organizations. ▪ Works and reports by CSOs and research institutions that monitor media institutions. ▪ Academic and scientific studies and projects. ▪ Narratives such as memoirs, autobiographies, biographies and diaries. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Yearly ▪ Yearly ▪ Yearly ▪ Quarterly ▪ Monthly ▪ Quarterly ▪ Yearly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Examination of activity reports of relevant institutions. Examination of legislation, human resources and annual activity reports of relevant institutions. ▪ Screening TÜİK web site by using key words ▪ Screening the web site of Press Advertisement Agency by using key words ▪ Examination of reports published by professional organizations on their web sites and reports existing in archives of institutions. ▪ Examination of reports on monitoring activities existing in web sites of relevant CSOs and documents of balance sheet character. ▪ Examination of relevant work carried out by research centres of universities ▪ Reading of and taking notes from all or some parts of relevant publications.

EQUALITY NORM					
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency	Data Collection Method
Work/Private Life Balance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ CEDAW Art. 2, ▪ CEDAW Art. 11, ▪ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan -European Social Charter 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Number of media institutions that arrange working spaces in compliance with rights deriving from obligations of parenthood and accompaniment. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Institutional documents that set the employment regime of media institutions. ▪ Legislation related to employment relations. ▪ Conduct of structured surveys and interviews with employees in the media. ▪ Academic and scientific studies and projects. ▪ Narratives such as memoirs, autobiographies, biographies and diaries. ▪ Survey reports by professional organizations. ▪ Works and reports by CSOs and research institutions that monitor media institutions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Yearly -Yearly -Yearly -Quarterly -Yearly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Going over human resources documents and annual activity reports available on web sites of media institutions. ▪ Going over legislation related to the Ministry of Labour and Social Security and other legislation governing employment relations. ▪ Applying questionnaires to or conducting face-to-face interviews with media employees. ▪ Examination of relevant work carried out by universities and research centres ▪ Reading of and taking notes from all or some parts of relevant publications.

EQUALITY NORM					
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency	Data Collection Method
Mainstreaming of Gender Equality within the Institution	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan. ■ İstanbul Convention Art. 17 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions and professional organizations that allocate budget for mainstreaming gender equality within the institution. ■ Number of media institutions and professional organizations that have their internal consensus document on gender equality and related action plan. ■ Number of media institutions and professional organizations that opened their institutional structure, documents and policies to outer monitoring, reporting and suggestion making mechanisms for purposes of checking compliance with gender equality. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Relevant documents of human resources departments of media institutions. ■ Regulations and bylaws of professional organizations. ■ Annual activity reports of media institutions. ■ Works and reports by CSOs and research institutions that monitor media institutions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Yearly ■ Yearly ■ Yearly ■ Semi-annually 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Screening texts related to human resources on web sites of media institutions. ■ Going over texts of regulations and bylaws on web sites of professional organizations. ■ Going over annual activity reports of media institutions on their web sites. ■ Going over relevant reports by CSOs and research institutions on their web sites and requesting information on this subject.

EQUALITY NORM					
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency	Data Collection Method
Safe Working Conditions	CEDAW Art. 2, CEDAW Art. 11, Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions that have mechanisms/units inside to prevent gender-based violence. ■ Number of professional organizations and CSOs that monitor and report on working spaces and conditions of media workers. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Relevant documents of human resources departments of media institutions. ■ Annual activity reports of media institutions -Reports and documents by professional organizations. ■ Works and reports by CSOs and research institutions that monitor media institutions. ■ Academic and scientific studies and projects. ■ Narratives such as memoirs, autobiographies, biographies and diaries. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Yearly ■ Yearly ■ Semi-annually ■ Quarterly ■ Quarterly ■ Yearly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Screening texts related to human resources on web sites of media institutions. ■ Going over annual activity reports of media institutions on their web sites. ■ Going over relevant documents of professional organizations on their web sites and requesting information from. -Going over monitoring reports of CSOs and reports published by research institutions. ■ Examination of relevant work carried out by universities and research centres. ■ Reading of and taking notes from all or some parts of relevant publications.

EQUALITY NORM					
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency	Data Collection Method
Equal Pay for Equal Work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 2, ■ CEDAW Art. 11, ■ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions publishing their policies of pay increase in the context of transparency and accountability. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Documents of human resources departments of media institutions. ■ Documents of finance units of media institutions. ■ Annual activity reports of media institutions. ■ Reports and documents by media institutions. ■ Studies and reports by unions organized in the media. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Yearly ■ Yearly ■ Yearly ■ Semi-annually ■ Yearly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Screening texts related to human resources on web sites of media institutions. ■ Applying to accounting units of professional organizations for information. ■ Going over activity reports published annually on web sites of media institutions. ■ Examination of monitoring and other similar reports by professional organizations. ■ Examination of reports of surveys conducted by trade unions in the field of media.
Employment with Social Security	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 11, ■ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions that arrange their work contracts in line with legislation and principles that prevent gender-based insecurity in employment. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Relevant reports and documents by professional organizations. ■ Works and reports by CSOs and research institutions that monitor media institutions ■ Relevant studies and reports by trade unions. ■ Working life statistics. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Semi-annually ■ Semi-annually ■ Semi-annually ■ Yearly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Examination of monitoring and other similar reports by professional organizations. ■ Examination of monitoring and other similar reports by CSOs and research institutions. ■ Examination of monitoring and survey reports by trade unions. ■ Examination of statistics on working life published by TÜİK and other relevant institutions.

EQUALITY NORM					
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data Source	Data Collection Frequency	Data Collection Method
Training in Profession	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan. -Istanbul Convention Art. 14 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of women and men working as trainers in communication. Number of women and men who made career and promotion academically in institutions giving education in communication. Number of women and men enrolled to and graduated from institutions of professional education (secondary and higher education). Number of courses in the curriculum of institutions delivering media education on gender equality and rights in the field of media. Number of institutions delivering media education that include critical media literacy course in their curriculum. Number of academic studies and research projects on gender equality in media conducted by academic study and research institutions. Number of academic study and research institutions engaged in studies on gender equality. Number of women and men enrolled to and graduated from institutions of professional education 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legislation and statistics of Higher Education Board. Legislation and Statistics of Ministry of National Education. Regulations and curricula of universities and other higher education institutions and relevant documents of research units. Curricula of communication high schools. Legislation on TÜBİTAK. Relevant documents of commercial and public benefit institutions delivering education and training in communication. Outcomes of YÖK's Gender Sensitive University Workshop. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Semi-annually Yearly Semi-annually Yearly Yearly Yearly Yearly Yearly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Screening on YÖK web site and TÜİK higher education statistics by using key words. Screening on MEB and TÜİK web sites by using key words. Examination of relevant pages and curricula information on web sites of all universities in Turkey. Examination of curricula of all communication high schools in Turkey on the basis of information from MEB database. Going over identity of persons conducting research projects on the web site of TÜBİTAK Requesting information from institutions delivering education in communication that are not under the MEB Examining information obtained directly from YÖK and its web site.

NON-DISCRIMINATION NORM					
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data Source		
Representation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proportion women and men as news items in media outputs. Proportion in media outputs of news that contain discrimination and hatred, and encourage violence against women. Number of media institutions and professional organizations that introduce in their principles, ethical codes and bylaws measures to avoid discourses and forms of representation that are discriminatory, encourage violence, contain hate speech, involve otherization and stereotyping and prevent multi-dimensional representation in media outputs. Number of media institutions and professional organizations that introduce in their principles, ethical codes and bylaws measures to prevent the affirmation and reproduction of values and norms that disregard gender equality in media outputs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Text content of news by national and local media organs. -Ministry of Family and Social Policies, KSGM Women and the Media Policy Document. Prime Ministerial Circular on Violence against Women. European Convention on Transfrontier Television. Prime Ministerial Circular No. 2006/17. KEFEK Report by the Parliamentary Commission on Investigating the Causes of Violence against Women and Identification of Measures to be Adopted. Law No. 6112 on the Establishment and Broadcasting of Radio and Television. nd Television Law No. 2954. Institutional documents governing ethical codes and principles of media institutions. Relevant documents and survey reports of professional organizations and CSOs. Scientific studies and projects. Documents by the Ombudsman Institution. Documents by the Human Rights and Equality Institution of Turkey. RTÜK documents. TRT documents. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Monthly Yearly Yearly Yearly Yearly Yearly Semi-annually <p>Regulation on Principles and Procedures in Broadcasting Services.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Principles and procedures in in applying signs. Text of Ethical Rules in Broadcasting agreed upon by the RTÜK and Association of Television Broadcasters. Legislation on the General Directorate of AA News Agency. Press Law Turkish Radio a 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Examination of text content of news by national and local media organs Examination of relevant document and new articles added. Examination of relevant document and new articles added. Examining texts on ethical rules of media institutions obtained directly from these institutions or available on their web sites. Examination of ethical rules of broadcasting agencies operating under the state Examination of applications made through the media to relevant institutions concerning cases of mobbing and harassment Examination of relevant monitoring reports by CSOs and professional organizations Examination of legislation governing the field of media Examination of relevant scientific publications by persons and institutions

NON-DISCRIMINATION NORM					
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data Source		
Mainstreaming of Gender Equality Perspective in Media Production Processes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of media institutions producing media outputs that are useful in gender mainstreaming. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relevant documents by professional organizations and CSOs. Scientific studies and projects. Institutional documents governing ethical codes and principles of media institutions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Semi-annually Semi-annually Yearly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Examination of efforts by professional organizations and CSOs to introduce improvements in the field. Examination of scientific studies and projects that contain suggestions for improvements in the field. Examination of documents containing principles and ethical codes adopted by media institutions.
Media's Active or Passive Support to Building Awareness in Gender Equality	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan. Istanbul Convention Art. 13 	<p>Passive Support:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of media institutions publishing outputs from gender equality campaigns and efforts and frequency of such publishing. <p>Active Support:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of media institutions participating as stakeholders to campaigns and efforts geared to building awareness in gender equality. Number of media outputs that build information concerning gender equality, violence and abuse and use explicit messages and symbols in this regard. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ministry of Family and Social Policies, KSGM Women and the Media Policy Document. Prime Ministerial Circular on Violence against Women. Prime Ministerial Circular No. 2006/17. KEFEK Report by the Parliamentary Commission on Investigating the Causes of Violence against Women and Identification of Measures to be Adopted. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Yearly Yearly Yearly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identification of campaigns appearing on selected national publications regularly in one-month periods Examination of legislation on Ministry of Family and Social Policies Examination of Prime Ministerial Circular on Violence against Women. Examination of KEFEK regulations and report

EMPOWERMENT NORM					
Theme	Standards	Indicators	Data sources		
Access		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of women and men having means of mass communication. ■ Number of women and men having new means of communication. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ TÜİK Statistics ■ Studies and reports by professional organizations, CSOs and research units in universities concerning new communication technologies. ■ Documents by Information Technologies and Communication Institution. ■ Ministry of Transportation, Maritime Affairs and Communication documents. ■ Reports, studies and statistics by local governments. ■ RTÜK 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Yearly ■ Semi-annually ■ Yearly ■ Yearly ■ Yearly ■ Yearly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Key word based search on TÜİK web site ■ Going over documents by relevant research units, CSOs and academic institutions ■ Going over legislation on Information Technologies and Communication Agency ■ Going over legislation on the Ministry of Transportation, Maritime Affairs and Communication ■ Going over publicly announced work conducted by local governments and requesting information from institutions ■ Web search on relevant documents by RTÜK and requesting information from the institution

NON-DISCRIMINATION NORM					
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data Source		
Economic, Social and Cultural Empowerment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ İstanbul Convention Chapter III - Prevention Art. 12 ■ İstanbul Convention Chapter III Prevention Art. 17 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of women and men participating to training and certification programmes that build skills in using new means of communication. ■ Number of women and men participating to alternative media trainings of civil society organizations and rights-based organizations. ■ Number of gender-sensitive persons and institutions launching alternative publishing practices. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ TÜİK Statistics ■ Reports, studies and statistics by local governments. ■ Reports and studies by CSOs. ■ Work by universities and research institutions. ■ Annual activity reports of and interviews with technology firms offering access to, content and services in new communication technologies. ■ TÜBİTAK reports and activities. ■ KOSGEB reports and activities. ■ TİKA reports and activities. ■ Interviews with and statistics of local governments and occupation building and adult education centres operating under these governments. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Yearly ■ Yearly ■ Semi-annually ■ Semi-annually ■ Semi-annually ■ Semi-annually ■ Yearly ■ Yearly ■ Yearly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Search on TÜİK web site by using key words ■ Examination of information obtained from web sites of local governments and information supplied upon direct request ■ Going over CSOs' monitoring reports and other documents ■ Going over publications by universities and research institutions ■ Conducting interviews with customer services and R&D units of technology firms ■ Going over studies conducted under the auspices of TÜBİTAK ■ Examination of information obtained from KOSGEB web site and supplied by the institution upon request ■ Examination of TİKA reports and documents available on website or obtained upon request ■ Examination of information supplied by local governments upon request

Table 7: CEID Set of Indicators in the Thematic Field of Media (Without Sources of Data)

Standard	Indicators
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 2 ■ CEDAW Art. 11 ■ Beijing Declaration J: <p>Women and the Media Action Plan</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of women and men that hold positions as owner, manager and board member in media institutions. ■ Number of women and men with membership to media related associations, foundations, chambers and unions. ■ Number of women and men holding positions as managers in media related associations, foundations, chambers and unions. ■ Number of media institutions delivering mentoring services in methods, requirements and rules of professional advancement and promotion.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 2, ■ CEDAW Art. 11, ■ Beijing Declaration J: <p>Women and the Media Action Plan</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of women and men employed in different sectors and in different positions in the media.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 2, ■ CEDAW Art. 11, ■ Beijing Declaration J: <p>Women and the Media Action Plan</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ European Social Charter 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions arranging working conditions with respect to daily routine work, shifts, missions outside, location, etc. in compliance with rights deriving from parenthood and accompaniment.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Beijing Declaration J: <p>Women and the Media Action Plan.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ İstanbul Convention Art. 17 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions and professional organizations engaged in training activities to build institutional consensus on gender equality. ■ Number of media institutions and professional organizations delivering mentoring services to build institutional consensus on gender equality and mainstream gender equality within the institution. ■ Gender distribution of media institution employees by different fields of expertise.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 2, ■ CEDAW Art. 11, ■ Beijing Declaration J: <p>Women and the Media Action Plan</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions arranging working spaces sensitive to gender equality. ■ Number of media institutions delivering mentoring services related to gender-based violence. ■ Number of media institutions allowing employee participation to organizational practices that prevent gender-based employment insecurity (i.e. trade unions, associations).
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 2, ■ CEDAW Art. 11, ■ Beijing Declaration J: <p>Women and the Media Action Plan</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of forms of employment contract arranged differently for women and men working in different positions in various sectors of the media.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 11, ■ Beijing Declaration J: <p>Women and the Media Action Plan</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions allowing their employees to participate to organizations practices that prevent gender-based insecurity in employment. ■ Number of media institutions entitling all employees social security rights that prevent gender-based insecurity in employment.

Standard	Indicators
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proportion of women and men referred to as experts and source of news in the preparation of media outputs. Number of programmes with news content sensitive to gender equality mainstreaming. Number of women represented in these programmes in a way sensitive to gender equality. Number of media institutions and professional organizations that deliver mentoring services and training in the use of balanced and non-discriminatory discourse and visuals.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of media institutions and professional organizations preparing gender-based documents and guides to be used by employees in their routine work.
Standards	Indicators
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of publicly open and safe internet access points in urban centres. Number of women and men using public internet access points in urban centres. Number of institutions delivering free training and certification programmes in new media literacy. Number of institutions declaring to have their pricing, practices and services shaped from gender equality perspective. Number of women and men benefiting from investment incentives and grants in order to develop means of mass communication and produce news media content. Number of women and men benefiting from investment incentives and grants in order to start business in the media sector. Number of institutions that deliver mentoring services (guidance and counselling) in empowerment through media use and broadcasting.

EQUALITY NORM			
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data source
Participation to Decision Making Mechanisms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> CEDAW Art. 2 CEDAW Art. 11 Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Number of women and men holding position as owner, manager and board member in media institutions. Number of women and men with membership to media-related associations, foundations, chambers and unions. Number of women and men holding management positions in media-related professional organizations like association, foundation, chamber and union. Number of media institutions delivering mentoring services in methods, requirements and rules of professional advancement and promotion. 	

EQUALITY NORM			
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data source
Starting in the Profession	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 2, ■ CEDAW Art. 11, ■ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of women and men employed in different positions in different sectors of the media. 	
Work/Private Life Balance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 2, ■ CEDAW Art. 11, ■ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan ■ European Social Charter 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions arranging working conditions with respect to daily routine work, shifts, missions outside, location, etc. in compliance with rights deriving from parenthood and accompaniment. 	
Mainstreaming of Gender Equality within the Institution	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Beijing Declaration: Women and the Media Action Plan. ■ Istanbul Convention Art. 17 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions and professional organizations engaged in trainings to build institutional consensus on gender equality. ■ Number of media institutions and professional organizations delivering mentoring services to build institutional consensus on gender equality and mainstream gender equality within the institution. ■ Gender distribution of media workers with respect to different fields of expertise. 	
Safe Working Conditions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 2, ■ CEDAW Art. 11, ■ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions that arrange working spaces sensitive to gender equality. ■ Number of media institutions delivering mentoring services related to gender-based violence. ■ Number of media institutions allowing employee participation to organizational practices that prevent gender-based employment insecurity (i.e. trade unions, associations). 	
Equal Pay for Equal Work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 2, ■ CEDAW Art. 11, ■ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of forms of employment contract arranged differently for women and men working in different positions in various sectors of the media. 	

EQUALITY NORM			
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data source
Employment with Social Security	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ CEDAW Art. 11, ■ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions allowing employee participation to organizational practices that prevent gender-based employment insecurity. ■ Number of media institutions entitling all employees social security rights that prevent gender-based insecurity in employment. 	

NON-DISCRIMINATION NORM			
Theme	Standard	Indicators	Data source
Representation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Proportion of women and men referred to as experts and source of news in the preparation of media outputs. ■ Number of programmes with news sensitive to mainstreaming of gender equality ■ Number of women represented in these programmes in a way sensitive to gender equality. ■ Number of media institutions and professional organizations that deliver mentoring services and training in the use of balanced and non-discriminatory discourse and visuals. 	
Mainstreaming of Gender Equality Perspective in Media Production Processes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Beijing Declaration J: Women and the Media Action Plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Number of media institutions and professional organizations that produce gender-based documents and guides that media workers will use in their routine work. 	

This publication is produced with the financial support of European Union. Its contents are the sole responsibility of the Association for Monitoring Gender Equality and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Union or the Directorate for EU Affairs - Department of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Republic of Turkey.